

548 & 554 Center Street

MAJCOA 18024-2022

Applicant: Ali Dashti



City Council Meeting – November 21, 2022

Executive Summary

- The request is an appeal of HPC's decision on Major Certificate of Appropriateness (**MAJCOA 18024-2022**) requesting to allow for the demolition of pre-1945 structures on properties located at 548 and 554 W. Center Street.
- 548 W. Center Street is a six-unit multifamily development estimated to have been constructed in 1885
- 554 W. Center Street is one single family dwelling estimated to have been constructed in 1895.



Location



Previous Decisions

- **HPC Meeting September 7, 2022** – HPC made a motion to deny Staff's recommendation and directed Staff to return to Commission with findings for a denial on a 5-2-0-0 vote.
- **HPC Meeting October 5, 2022** – Continued public hearing where HPC made a motion to deny the Major Certificate of Appropriateness in that the structures have sufficient integrity and deemed them to be of historic significance on a 4-3-0-0 vote.
- **October 13, 2022** – Applicant filed for an appeal.



Background

- Planning Staff **evaluated the properties against all 10 Historic Landmark Designation** Criteria (Sec. 5809-13.D of PZO) and determined that, because of modifications having been made over the years, the subject properties do not meet the criteria nor the integrity requirements for local historic landmark designation or as contributors to a potential historic district.
- **At the HPC meeting of September 7, 2022**, Staff brought forward a recommendation to Commission to approve the Major COA request to allow for demolition. Commission instructed Staff to return to Commission with findings for denial.
- **At the HPC meeting of October 5, 2022**, continued public hearing where Staff brought forward a similar recommendation to approve the request after having re-evaluated all designation criteria and did not find sufficient evidence to support the local historic landmark designation.
 - HPC made findings that the subject properties met Designation Criteria 3 and 4, therefore denied the request for a COA for demolition and deemed the properties to be of historic significance.



Background (cont.)

- **On October 5, 2022**, HPC voted to deny the permit based on the following Historic Landmark Designation Criterion (Sec. 5809-13.D of PZO):
 - Criterion 3: *"It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship."*
 - Criterion 4: *"It contributes to the significance of an historic area, being a geographically definable area possessing a concentration of historic or scenic properties or thematically related grouping of properties which contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by plan or physical development."*



Background (cont.)

- According to Sec. .5809-13.F.8:
 - *"In making such a determination [regarding demolition of pre-1945 non-designated structures] the [HPC] shall first consider if the property would likely meet the criteria used in historic landmark designation **thus deeming it of historical significance.**"*
- According to Sec. .5809-13.D:
 - *"A site may be designated an historic landmark by the historic preservation commission and city council...if the building(s) are fifty or more years... **and it meets one or more** of the **Historic Landmark Designation Criteria.**"*



Site Photographs – 554 W. Center



Site Photographs – 548 W. Center



Similar Houses



Alterations

- 548 West Center
 - Addition, porch alteration – 1957-58
- 554 West Center
 - Addition, Window Replacement, Stucco – 2004 and 2010
 - These alterations were made after the property was surveyed



Staff Recommendation

Two options for the Council's consideration:

- Approving Resolution No. 2022-208 would **deny** the appeal and uphold the Commission's decision to deny the Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 18024-2022) and not allow demolition to move forward and would deem the properties to be of historical significance.

or

- Approving Resolution No. 2022-212 would **approve** the appeal and reverse the Commission's decision, approve the Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 18024-2022) and allow the applicant to pursue a demolition permit.

