



Staff Report

City of Pomona Historic Preservation Commission

July 2, 2025

FILE NO: MAJCOA-000360-2025

A request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-000360-2025) to legalize twenty-four (24) unpermitted vinyl windows on the primary structure of a contributing resource within the Hacienda Park Historic District.

ADDRESS: 1515 GANESHA PLACE (APN: 8359-018-023)

APPLICANT: Cassie Hau

PROJECT PLANNER: Alan Fortune, Associate Planner

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW: This project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration and Rehabilitation) and Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) of the CEQA Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION: Deny Major Certificate of Appropriateness (File No. MAJCOA-000360-2025) and adopt Resolution No. 25-020 (Attachment 1).

Project Information:

GENERAL PLAN DISTRICT: Residential Neighborhood

ZONING DISTRICT: RND1-H [HM1-N1-R1]

TRANSECT: T3

SPECIFIC PLAN DISTRICT: N/A

GENERAL PLAN DENSITY: 20 DU/AC

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Hacienda Park

Important Dates:

DATE SUBMITTED: April 17, 2025

DATE DETERMINED COMPLETE: May 22, 2025

DEADLINE TO MAKE A DECISION: August 5, 2025

Property Background:

The contributing resource located at 1515 Ganesha Place consists of a single-family residence estimated to have been constructed in 1947. The property is developed with a 1,941 square foot single family home on a 20,000 square

foot lot. The property is a contributing property to the Hacienda Park Historic District. The Hacienda Park Historic District survey that evaluated this property identifies the structure as Minimal Traditional style architecture and gives the resource a "Contributing" rating with no significant additions or alterations having been made (Attachment No. 2).

Based on the historic resource surveys and staff visits to the site, the condition of the structure is good with no major alterations or additions having been made since the estimated time of construction in 1947, with exception to the replacement of the original windows with vinyl windows. Otherwise, the structure retains its character-defining features. All original windows, approximately twenty-four (24), are estimated to have been replaced with vinyl windows in 2014.

On March 5, 2025, the Historic Preservation Commission approved a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (HPC Resolution No. 25-003) for the same site to allow for the construction of a new detached 1,200 square foot accessory dwelling unit, a new detached 450 square foot garage, and a new four foot (4') tall wall at the rear of this contributing resource.

Also on March 5, 2025, an online complaint was received by the Code Compliance Division regarding the replacement of the windows on the property. On March 11, 2025, the Code Compliance Division issued a Notice of Violation to the property owner informing them that the replacement of windows on a contributing resource requires the approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness. On April 16, 2025, Planning Staff received an application for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-000065-2025) to legalize twenty-four (24) unpermitted vinyl windows on the primary house located at 1515 Ganesha Place. Project plans as well as site photographs have been provided for the Commission's consideration as Attachment Nos.4 and 5 respectively.

The proposed project consists of the legalization of all windows on the primary structure on the contributing resource. The primary structure consists of one (1) single family home with twenty-four (24) windows. All other features on the primary resource are proposed to remain intact.

Critical Issues:

- The original wood windows, which were identified by the Hacienda Park surveys as a character-defining feature of the resource, were replaced with windows made of vinyl, a material that is not compatible with the style of the home. This work was not conducted by the applicant but by a previous property owner and without the benefit of any required permits.

Discussion of Critical Issues:

1. The existing windows were installed in approximately 2014. These windows are the same size of the original and did not alter the window opening sizes. These are also single-hung windows, similar to the original wood windows that they replaced. Though these windows are of a similar size and style, the vinyl material is not compatible with the period or architectural style of the primary resource. According to the Pomona Historic Preservation Guidelines, the installation of a material, such as vinyl, that is not compatible with the home requires the approval of a Major Certificate of Appropriateness by the Historic Preservation Commission. The applicant is not responsible for the installation of the existing windows as these were conducted by a previous property owner and without the benefit of any required permits.

Architectural Style:

Based on the features of the subject residence observed by staff and in the recorded survey, the existing primary structure is of Minimal Traditional architecture and style according to Chapter 2 of the "Pomona Guide to Historic Preservation." The detached garage was constructed at a similar time to the primary residence and has a similar architectural style. The Pomona Guide to Historic Preservation describes Minimal Traditional style as a "transitional style between the revival styles of the 1920s and 30s and the post-war tract homes. The Great Depression help spur the use of this style, since the Minimal Traditional style is a compromised, more economical version of the various revival styles." The Guide continues: "Elements common to many styles, but belonging exclusively to none, are favored [with Minimal Traditional homes]. These include gables, chimneys, and shutters. Houses of this style may be built of virtually any traditional material; brick and wood are common. Roofs always lack the eaves or overhangs found on more assertive styles. Most ... are one or 1 ½ stories in height." The relevant pages of the Pomona Guide to Historic Architecture has been attached for the Commission's reference (Attachment No. 6).

Architectural Description:

The original windows were identified as a character-defining feature in the initial 2004 Hacienda Park Historic District survey. These windows were wood, single-paned and double-hung.

Among the character defining features present on this home is a relatively low-pitched roof with composite roof shingles with some exposed rafters on some gables and elevations. The house is a rectangular form with two front cross-gables. An attached patio/barbecue room with a composition shingle roof was constructed in 1950 at the rear of the structure. This was enclosed as an addition to the home at a later date. A detached garage was constructed at a similar time with a similar architectural style.

The structure has many features that are typical and/or defining of Minimal Traditional homes, these include a cross-gabled roof and a small front porch.

RELEVANT ALTERATIONS:

The existing windows, estimated to have been replaced in 2014, are also hung windows but are vinyl in material. These windows are of the same dimensions as the original windows however vinyl is not a material that is compatible with the period or style.

Character-Defining Features:

1. Two front-facing bump-out bay windows
2. One front-facing center picture window
3. Original windows were single-paned and double-hung. *These wood windows have been since been replaced with vinyl windows since being surveyed in 2004.*
4. Front porch is simple with a covered entryway with iron supports
5. Original front door and iron door knocker
6. Wall cladding is composed of smooth stucco
7. Garage is detached with modern roll-up door

Discussion of Existing Conditions

The subject site consists of one (1) single-family residential unit and one (1) detached garage. The detached garage is located near the southwest property line to the rear of the primary structure alongside the alley. The proposed project involves the windows on the primary structure located closer to Ganesha Place. The project does not include any other modifications or expansions to the site or structure.

The applicant's request is to legalize a total of twenty-four (24) unpermitted vinyl windows on the house. This work was not conducted by the applicant but by a previous property owner and without the benefit of any required permits in approximately 2014.

Design Review:

According to Section 800.C.7.a.2, projects that alter, or have the potential to alter character-defining features and/or the historic character of historic resources and fit into one of the categories below require approval of a Major Certificate of Appropriateness by the Historic Preservation Commission. This includes alterations that do not meet the applicable design standards and guidelines in the Pomona Guide to Historic Preservation.

Staff reviewed the request against the guidelines for Minimal Traditional architecture within the Pomona Guide to Historic Preservation, as well as the recorded Hacienda Park Historic District surveys to determine whether the requested change would be compatible with the period and style of the contributing resource.

SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR THE TREATMENT OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES.

The Historic Preservation Ordinance provides that the Commission be guided by the latest Rehabilitation Standards contained in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. Staff reviewed the project for compliance with the applicable standards below:

1. *A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.*

The use of the property will not change; the single-family home will remain unaltered.

2. *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

The original wood windows were identified as a character defining feature of the Minimal Traditional style architecture of the home. This element of the historic character will not be retained nor preserved with the replacement of these windows with vinyl windows.

3. *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

Though the windows retain their original sizes and opening styles (single-hung) the material is not compatible with the period or style of the home or neighborhood.

4. *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

Does not apply. There are no changes on the property that have acquired historic significance in their own right.

5. *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

The original wood windows were identified as a character defining feature of the Minimal Traditional style architecture of the home. These distinctive materials, finishes, and construction have been removed and replaced with non-original, non-compatible vinyl.

6. *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

The old windows may have been in need of maintenance, but the previous property owner opted for full replacement. These new vinyl windows do not match the old in design, color, texture or materials.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

Does not apply. No damaging treatments are proposed

8. *Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

Does not apply. The proposed project will not impact any potential archaeological resources

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The proposed change to permanently install vinyl framed windows would detract from the original historic materials used in the home. The previous windows had been original to the home, constructed in 1947, and had been composed of wood. This feature will be lost with the approval of the existing windows.

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

The proposed project does not include any new construction; the scope of work is limited to the legalizing of the existing windows with no other modifications to the structure or site.

Pomona Historic Preservation Guidelines:

1. Windows of Minimal Traditional Architecture: Double-hung, multi-pane, wood frame windows (Page 2-68)

The applicant is requesting to legalize the existing vinyl windows which would leave this example of a Minimal Traditional home without its original wood frame windows, a feature that was described as character-defining to the architecture in both the conducted survey and the Pomona Guide to Historic Preservation.

Required Findings:

The findings required in Section .1190.D.4 of the Pomona Zoning and Development Code for a Certificate of Appropriateness are included in the attached draft HPC Resolution No. 25-020 (Attachment No. 1).

Conclusion:

Due to vinyl being an incompatible material with the time period and architectural style of the contributing historical resource, and the Hacienda Park Historic District surveys specifically identifying the windows as character-defining features of the Minimal Traditional architecture of the home, Staff is recommending that the Historic Preservation Commission deny the request to legalize the unpermitted vinyl windows. The approval of this request would result in the historic resource losing a character-defining feature.

Environmental Review:

Staff has determined that, if approved, this project is exempt for the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15331, Class 31 – Historical Resource Restoration and Rehabilitation and Section 15301, Class 1 – Existing Structures of the CEQA Guidelines. Separately, CEQA does not apply to projects that are denied.

Attachments:

1. Draft Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 25-020

2. Project Plans
3. Photographs of site and surrounding area
4. Public Hearing Notice
5. Hacienda Park Historic District Survey Form
6. "Minimal Traditional" pages from Pomona Historic Guidelines