

Historic Preservation Commission

Staff Report

March 5, 2025

FILE NO: MAJCOA-000065-2025

A request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-000065-2025) for the construction of a new detached 1,200 square-foot accessory dwelling unit (ADU), a new 450 square-foot garage, and a new 4' tall block wall to match existing block wall at the rear of a contributing

resource within the Hacienda Park Historic District.

DATE SUBMITTED: January 16, 2025

ADDRESS: 1515 Ganehsa Place

APPLICANT: Cassie Hau

PROJECT PLANNER: Alan Fortune, Associate Planner

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW: This project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act

(CEQA) pursuant to Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration and Rehabilitation) and Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing

Facilities) of the California CEQA Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION: Approve Major Certificate of Appropriateness (File No(s). MAJCOA-

000065-2025) and adopt HPC Resolution No. 25-003 (Attachment 1).

PROPERTY ARCHITECTURE AND BACKGROUND:

The contributing resource located at 1515 Ganesha Place consists of a single family residence estimated to have been constructed in 1947. The property is developed with a 1,941 square foot single family home on a 20,000 square foot lot. The property is a contributing property to the Hacienda Park Historic District. The Hacienda Park Historic District survey that evaluated this property identifies the structure as Minimal Traditional style architecture and give the resource a "Contributing" rating with no significant additions or alterations having been made (Attachment 2).

On January 16, 2025, Planning Staff received an application for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-000065-2025) for the construction of a new 1,200 square-foot accessory dwelling unit (ADU),

a new 450 square-foot garage, and a new 4' tall block wall to match existing block wall. Project plans as well as site photographs have been provided for Commission consideration as Attachments 4 and 5 respectively.

Based on the historic resource surveys and staff visits to the site, the condition of the structure is good with no major alterations or additions having been made since the estimated time of construction in 1947, with exception to the replacement of the original windows with vinyl windows. Otherwise, the structure retains its character-defining features. The proposed project consists of the construction of a detached accessory dwelling structure with an attached garage at the rear of the property, directly adjacent to a separate existing detached garage. The new structure will match the architectural style of the home and incorporate several character defining features. All features on the primary resource will remain intact as the primary structure is not a part of this proposed project

CHARACTER-DEFINING FEATURES:

- 1. Two original bump-out bay windows
- 2. One center picture window
- 3. Original windows were single-paned and double-hung. *These windows have been since been replaced with vinyl windows since being surveyed in 2004
- 4. Front porch is simple with a covered entryway with iron supports
- 5. Front door and iron door knocker
- 6. Wall cladding is composed of smooth stucco
- 7. Garage is detached

DISCUSSION OF EXISTING CONDITIONS

- Site Design/Building Layout: The subject site consists of one single-family residential unit and one
 detached garage. The detached garage is located near the south west property line to the rear of the
 primary structure alongside the alley. The proposed project will be at the rear of the existing detached
 garage, will not be particularly visible from the street, and meets development standards of ADU
 Urgency Ordinance No. 4353.
- 2. <u>Architecture</u>: Based on the features of the subject residence observed by Staff and in the recorded survey, the existing primary structure is of Minimal Traditional architecture and style according to Chapter 2 of the "Pomona Guide to Historic Preservation." The detached garage was constructed at a similar time as the primary residence and has a similar architectural style. The proposed construction will be at the rear of the existing garage and will not be visible from the street and the primary home is not within the proposed scope of work.
- 3. <u>Roof</u>: Among the character defining features present on this home is a relatively low pitched roof with composite roof shingles with some exposed rafters on some gables and elevations. The proposed

ADU to the rear is proposed to match and complement the roof and architecture of the primary structure by incorporating a similar roof pitch, roof material, and style of exposed rafters. A smaller roof element is proposed at the ADU entrance to match that of the primary home.

DESIGN REVIEW:

The Historic Preservation Ordinance provides that the Commission is guided by the following areas in addition to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Staff has reviewed the project as it relates to these standards as well as any applicable design guidelines. Staff's analysis is below:

1. <u>Height.</u> The height of any proposed construction shall be compatible with the height and bulk of surrounding structures and in conformance with the maximum allowable height for the applicable zoning district.

The proposed height will be less than that of the primary home to maintain compatibility with that of the primary home on the property. This is in conformance with the allowable height within the respective zoning district.

2. <u>Proportions of Windows and Doors.</u> The proportions and relationships between doors and windows shall be compatible with the architectural style and character of the surrounding structures, and be of an appropriate material.

The proposed windows will be composed of wood and be single or double hung. This style is compatible with the original windows of the primary home. All windows and doors on the accessory structure are conditioned to have matching trim to that of the primary house.

3. Relationship of Building Masses and Spaces. The resulting relationships between proposed structures and created spaces, or between remodeled structures and created spaces, shall be consistent with the shapes and setbacks of existing adjacent structures.

The relationship between the two structures will remain the same after as the structure will be detached at the rear. The structure will not be visible from the street, only from the alley.

4. <u>Roof Shape.</u> The designs of the roof shall be compatible with the architectural character and style of the surrounding structures. Gables, turrets, and other roof forms shall be incorporated when appropriate to accomplish design compatibility with adjacent structures.

The proposed roof shape is proposed to match and continue the existing roof of the detached accessory structure which is similar to that of the primary home. The new structure will have a matching roof pitch and have a small porch entrance. Any new roof venting is conditioned to be low

profile.

5. <u>Scale.</u> The scale of the structure shall be compatible with the architectural character and style of the existing buildings. The new building shall blend in with surrounding buildings through the sensitive use of proper scale and materials.

The scale of the structure will be compatible with the architectural character and style of the existing buildings on site and in the surrounding buildings in the neighborhood. The proposed accessory structure will be toward the rear of the property. The perceived scale of the structure when viewed from the public right of way on Ganesha Place will continue to be similar.

6. <u>Directional Expression/Facades.</u> Facades in an historic district shall blend in with other structures with regard to directional expression. Structures in an historic district shall be compatible with the dominant horizontal and vertical expression of surrounding structures.

The facades of the proposed addition will blend in with the other structures in regard to direction expression as it will be constructed to match the architectural elements of the existing primary home in style and materials.

7. <u>Architectural Details.</u> Architectural details, including materials and textures shall be treated so as to make any new construction compatible with the architectural style and character of the historic district.

The architectural detailing, including materials, textures, and all other character-defining elements will be compatible with the Minimal Traditional architectural style and character of the home and nearby surrounding homes in the Hacienda Park Historic District.

8. <u>Architectural Rhythm and Articulation.</u> All proposed structures or facade remodeling shall show sufficient and rhythmic repetition of architectural details so as to be compatible with the facade articulation of existing adjacent buildings.

The proposed project will continue to be compatible with the façade articulation of the existing buildings as it is not substantially increasing the volume of the structure visible from the street.

9. <u>New Additions/Construction.</u> New additions and adjacent related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed new structure will be detached from the primary contributing resource therefore if removed, it will not have an impact on the integrity of the historic property.

10. Mechanical Equipment. All exterior mechanical equipment shall be screened from view with appropriately designed screens, parapet walls, landscaping or any other form of screening which the commission or the planning and development services manager may deem acceptable. The design, style, color and texture of the required screening method shall be compatible with the existing or proposed building/facade design.

The proposed project is not proposing any mechanical equipment. Any required new roof venting will be low profile to be the least visually impactful. Therefore, the project meets this criterion.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

The Section 800 (Historic Preservation) of the Pomona Zoning and Development Code provides that the Commission be guided by the latest Rehabilitation Standards contained in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. Staff reviewed the project for compliance with the applicable standards below:

- 1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.
 - The use of the property will not change; the single family home will remain unaltered. The detached structure will function as an accessory dwelling unit, maintaining the property use as residential.
- 2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
 - The historic character of the property will be retained and preserved as the new detached accessory structure will continue all of the character-defining features of the Minimal Traditional architectural style to be appropriate for the period and neighborhood.
- 3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
 - The proposed addition will continue the existing features on the primary home to match. The construction of the detached accessory dwelling unit and garage structure will not create a false sense of historical development as it will be appropriate to the period of the home and neighborhood. The

alley facing garage door will either be of a style that matches that of the other existing garage. The proposed accessory structure will match elements of the style and will be compatible with the period and neighborhood.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

Does not apply. There are no changes on the property that have acquired historic significance in their own right.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The character-defining features of the Minimal Traditional home will be kept as these features and elements will be incorporated into the proposed new construction to match the house primary house.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

Does not apply. No deteriorated historic features are proposed for removal.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

Does not apply. No damaging treatments are proposed.

8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

Does not apply. The proposed project will not impact any potential archaeological resources

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The new construction will not destroy any features and spatial relationship that characterize the property as it will be constructed in a similar location toward the rear of the property. The construction will continue the character-defining architectural features of the primary home.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed new structure will be detached from the primary contributing resource therefore if removed, it will not have an impact on the integrity of the historic property.

REQUIRED FINDINGS:

The findings required in Section .1190.D.4 of the Pomona Zoning and Development Code for a Certificate of Appropriateness are included in the attached draft HPC Resolution No. 24-009 (Attachment 1).

CONCLUSION:

Staff believes that the construction of a 1,200 square-foot accessory dwelling unit, 450 square-foot two-car garage, and 4' tall block wall is appropriate to the primary home as the construction will be made to match all architectural detailing and will continue any character-defining features of the Minimal Traditional home.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:

Staff has determined that this project is exempt for the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15331, Class 31 – Historical Resource Restoration and Rehabilitation and Section 15301, Class 1 – Existing Structures of the CEQA Guidelines.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

The Conditions of Approval are contained in the attached Draft Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 25-003 (Attachment 1).

ATTACHMENTS:

1: Draft Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 25-003

- 2: Hacienda Park Historic District Survey Form
- 4: Site Plans and Elevations
- 5: Site Photographs