



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

DATE: August 6, 2025

FILE NO: MAJCOA-000298-2025

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness (File No. MAJCOA-000298-2025) to allow for the construction of a new 1,200 square foot accessory dwelling unit (ADU) in the rear of a contributing resource within the Lincoln Park Historic District.

ADDRESS: **374 and 376 E. Alvarado Street**

APPLICANT: Manny Lopes for Ruben Jimenez

PROJECT PLANNER: Irene Mouré, Assistant Planner

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW: This project is exempt for the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration and Rehabilitation) of the California CEQA Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION: Approve File No. MAJCOA-000298-2025 and adopt Resolution No. 25-019 (Attachment 1)

IMPORTANT DATES:

Date Submitted: March 18, 2025

Date Determined Complete: March 25, 2025

CRITICAL ISSUES:

- Architectural consistency
- Retention of historic streetscape
- Location and size of project structure

PROPERTY ARCHITECTURE AND BACKGROUND:

Located within the Lincoln Park Historic District on a 7,500 square foot lot, the primary dwelling is single-story Colonial Revival Bungalow style structure 1,098 square feet in area, with construction estimated to have been completed in 1905. The Lincoln Park Historic District (LPHD) survey identified the structure as a "Contributing" resource with minor alterations. These minor alterations include an enclosed portion of the porch to enlarge the living room area in 1956 and the replacement of clapboard siding with wood

shingle siding installed at an unknown time (Attachment 2.1). Furthermore, there was an addition of a covered porch attached to the rear of the primary structure in 1977 and a re-roof of in-kind composition shingles in 1999 (Attachment 3). Lastly, the survey also identified the structure as having bungalow elements that have concealed Colonial Revival characteristics.

While the LPHD survey claims there are elements that conceal the original Colonial Revival architecture style, the 1992 citywide survey identified the structure's style as "Transitional Bungalow" (Attachment 2.2). Also, the '92 survey identifies that the clapboard siding, which is associated with Colonial Revival style, was removed and replaced with wood shingle siding. In their assessment, both surveys identify the same character-defining elements.

On March 18, 2025, Staff received an application for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-000298-2025) for the construction of a new detached 1,200 square-foot accessory dwelling unit (ADU) at the rear of the property. The proposed project also includes the demolition and removal of unpermitted storage containers from the rear property. Project plans illustrating the ADU are provided for the Commission's review (Attachment 4).

The proposed project consists of the construction of a new detached ADU at the rear of the property, directly adjacent to a detached garage. The project is proposing the ADU to be 1,200 square feet, which is 102 square feet larger than the primary dwelling. The new structure will match the architectural style of the existing dwelling and incorporate several architectural features, such as matching the wood windows, dormers, and siding. All features on the primary resource will remain intact as the primary structure is not a part of this proposed project.

CHARACTER-DEFINING FEATURES:

1. One-story configuration
2. Hipped roof accented with hipped dormers and exposed rafters
3. Wood windows
4. Decorative solid doors
5. Wood shingle siding

DISCUSSION OF CRITICAL ISSUES

1. Architectural Consistency

The detached ADU project is proposed to maintain architectural consistency with the primary dwelling by incorporating its character-defining features unto the proposed ADU. This includes replicating the following features:

- 6:12 roof pitch
- Exposure of the wood shingle exterior siding
- Matching the material, size, and opening direction of the wood windows. Exposed rafters
- Hipped roof

- Hipped dormers on every elevation
- River rock border along the foundation

2. Location, Placement, and Massing

While the ADU is projected to be larger than the primary building by 102 square feet, the ADU will be located approximately 136 feet from the curb and will generally be placed behind the existing primary dwelling as well as the detached garage . Furthermore, the ADU will be setback 5 feet from both the rear-yard, side-yard, and the alleyway, which exceeds the minimum side- and rear-yard setback of 4 feet. The height of the ADU will be 16 feet, which is shorter than the existing primary dwelling. Overall, the visibility of the proposed detached ADU will be limited the public right-of-way or impact

3. Impacts on the Historic Streetscape

The proposed architectural consistency and placement of the ADU to the rear yard will not have an impact on the nationally recognized historic streetscape that contributes to the distinctive character and charm of the Lincoln Park Historic District.

DESIGN REVIEW:

The Historic Preservation Ordinance provides that the Commission is guided by the following areas in addition to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Staff has reviewed the project as it relates to these standards as well as any applicable design guidelines. Staff's analysis is below:

1. Height. The height of any proposed construction shall be compatible with the height and bulk of surrounding structures and in conformance with the maximum allowable height for the applicable zoning district.

The proposed detached ADU will be compatible with the height and bulk of surrounding structures and is compliant with the maximum allowable heights of the RND1 zoning district.

2. Proportions of Windows and Doors. The proportions and relationships between doors and windows shall be compatible with the architectural style and character of the surrounding structures, and be of an appropriate material.

The proportions and relationship between doors and windows of the proposed ADU will match those of the existing primary structure and, therefore, will be compatible with the architectural style and character of the existing Colonial Revival Bungalow.

3. Relationship of Building Masses and Spaces. The resulting relationships between proposed structures and created spaces, or between remodeled structures and created spaces, shall be consistent with the shapes and setbacks of existing adjacent structures.

The proposed ADU is compliant with applicable setback standards, provides sufficient space between existing structures, and does not create an unusual pattern of development not found in the neighborhood.

4. Roof Shape. The designs of the roof shall be compatible with the architectural character and style of the surrounding structures. Gables, turrets, and other roof forms shall be incorporated when appropriate to accomplish design compatibility with adjacent structures.

The proposed dwelling's roof has been designed to be compatible with the gable forms, pitch, and exposed rafter, elements typically found on Colonial Revival bungalow homes. Special attention has been paid to match the existing home. Furthermore, roofing equipment, such as vents, will be low profile.

5. Scale. The scale of the structure shall be compatible with the architectural character and style of the existing buildings. The new building shall blend in with surrounding buildings through the sensitive use of proper scale and materials.

The proposed ADU is designed to have a scale that is similar and appropriate to the existing primary Colonial Revival/Transitional bungalow on the site. Furthermore, the proposed architectural elements of the secondary accessory dwelling are elements that are found on the existing primary dwelling.

6. Directional Expression/Facades. Facades in a historic district shall blend in with other structures with regard to directional expression. Structures in an historic district shall be compatible with the dominant horizontal and vertical expression of surrounding structures.

The ADU shares the same directional expression as the primary structure, where both entrances and porches are on the north elevation.

7. Architectural Details. Architectural details, including materials and textures shall be treated so as to make any new construction compatible with the architectural style and character of the historic district.

The proposed detached ADU has been modeled after the existing architectural details of the existing contributing dwelling on the property. Said architectural details include in-kind wood shingle siding materials and exposure, roof materials, window and door trim, window fenestration, eave details, gable vent details, and colors among many other architectural elements.

8. Architectural Rhythm and Articulation. All proposed structures or facade remodeling shall show sufficient and rhythmic repetition of architectural details so as to be compatible with the facade articulation of existing adjacent buildings.

The proposed ADU is designed to uniformly create a consistent architectural rhythm and articulation of architectural details along all facades so as to match the façade articulation of the existing primary structure on the property.

9. New Additions/Construction. New additions and adjacent related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed ADU is proposed on the furthest rear portion of the parcel that is currently occupied by unpermitted storage containers. These containers will be removed, furthering sustaining the integrity of the historic property. Furthermore, no original structures are proposed to be removed or altered.

10. Mechanical Equipment. All exterior mechanical equipment shall be screened from view with appropriately designed screens, parapet walls, landscaping or any other form of screening which the commission or the planning and development services manager may deem acceptable. The design, style, color and texture of the required screening method shall be compatible with the existing or proposed building/facade design.

The proposed ADU is significantly detached from the right-of-way and is visually screened by existing primary and accessory structures and a 6-foot wooden fence. Furthermore, all exterior mechanical equipment will be conditioned to be located alongside and rear facades that do not front against the right-of-way.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

The Historic Preservation Ordinance provides that the Commission be guided by the latest Rehabilitation Standards contained in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. Staff reviewed the project for compliance with the applicable standards below:

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.

The detached ADU will continue the historically existing residential use of the property. Furthermore, all proposed alterations to the site are required to match the distinctive architectural features, spaces, and spatial relationships of the existing site.

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

The project is not proposing any removal of distinctive materials or alteration of existing features. The Colonia Revival/Transitional Bungalow architectural style and influences will be retained and preserved.

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

No conjectural features or elements are proposed to be borrowed from other historic properties, all features and elements of the proposed ADU are guided by the features found on the contributing resources located on the site. Therefore, the proposal is compliant with this standard.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

This standard does not apply as there are no singular features on the property that have acquired historic significance in their own right.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

All proposed materials, features, and finishes that characterize the Colonial Revival/Transitional Bungalow style of the existing structures will be preserved by the intentional replication of the character-defining features.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

The proposed dwelling will not impact any historic features and/or structures on the site as the placement of the detached ADU will be on an underutilized portion of the rear yard. Therefore, this standard is not applicable.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

Damaging treatments to the site are not proposed, therefore, the proposed project is compliant with this standard.

8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

The proposed project will not have an impact on any potential archaeological resources.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed detached ADU will not alter nor remove, and existing historic materials features nor significantly impact spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new ADU is designed to be significantly compatible with all historic features of the site and its surrounding environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The detached ADU is proposed to be on the rear portion of the parcel that is not occupied by any permitted buildings or significant landscaping features. Furthermore, no original structures are proposed to be removed or altered.

REQUIRED FINDINGS:

The findings required in Section. .1190.D.4 of the Pomona Zoning and Development Code for Certificates of Appropriateness are contained in the attached resolution (Attachment 1).

CONCLUSION:

Based on research, on-site inspections, and the provided analysis, the design of the proposed 1,200 square foot detached ADU is determined to be compatible with the Colonial Revival/Transitional Bungalow style of contributing resource. The proposed project is replicating the architectural elements and character-defining features to ensure the new project will be cohesive to the existing dwelling. Furthermore, the location of the proposed ADU will be obscured from the public-right-of-way, so this new project addition will not have an impact the historic streetscape of the Lincoln Park Historic District. Overall, the proposed project is in compliance with the criteria contained in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:

Staff is recommending the Historic Planning Commission determine that this project is exempt for the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Sections Section 15301, Class 1- Existing Facilities and 15331 – Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation of the California CEQA Guidelines.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

The Conditions of Approval are contained in the attached resolution (Attachment 1).

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1: Draft Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 25-019
- 2: Historic Surveys
- 3: Building Permit Records
- 4: Project Plans
- 5: Photographs of site and surrounding area
- 6: Proof of Public Noticing