



# Historic Preservation Commission

## Staff Report

October 5, 2022

<b>FILE NO:</b>	MAJCOA-018024-2022 (Continued from September 7, 2022)
	A request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-018024-2022) for the proposed demolition of a six-unit multifamily development and one single family dwelling, estimated to have been constructed in 1885 and 18955, respectively.
<b>ADDRESS:</b>	<b>548 and 554 W. Center Street</b>
<b>APPLICANT:</b>	Ali Dashti
<b>PROJECT PLANNER:</b>	Alan Fortune, Assistant Planner
<b>RECOMMENDATION:</b>	Approve File No. MAJCOA-18024-2022 and adopt Resolution No. 2022-025 (Attachment 1), approving the Certificate of Appropriateness

### BACKGROUND:

At the September 7, 2022 Historic Preservation Commission meeting, staff presented an application for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-018024-2022) to demolish two residential structures, a six-unit multi-family development and one single family dwelling, both constructed prior to 1945. According to the City of Pomona Historic Resources Inventory, the six-unit multi-family structure at 548 W. Center Street is estimated to have been constructed in 1885 while the single family dwelling located at 554 W. Center Street is estimated to have been constructed in 1895. Staff recommended that the application be approved because neither structure met the local criteria for designation and, therefore, were not historic. Multiple members of the public provided public comment; two individuals representing the applicant spoke in favor of the request and ten individuals spoke in opposition.

At the meeting, the Commission made two motions. The first was a failed motion to approve Staff's recommendation and extend the time for the tenants to vacate the property by an additional 60 days for a total of 120 days. The Commission on a second motion, subsequently denied Staff's recommendation and directed Staff to return to Commission with findings for denial, with attention to several specific criteria for historic designation, including Criteria 1, 2, 6, and 8. This motion passed on a 5-2-0-0 vote.

Staff re-examined Criteria 1, 2, 6, and 8 as well as the all of the local designation criteria to identify reasons that these properties may be historic. When evaluating a property for historic significance, staff takes

into account multiple factors: theme or area of significance, historic significance, period of significance, and historic integrity.

### **Guidelines for Evaluating Properties**

In order to evaluate the properties for historic significance staff utilized the guidance published by the National Park Service and guidance in National Register Bulletins. The following guiding documents include:

- The Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Archaeological and Historic Preservation
- National Register Bulletin 24: Guidelines for Local Surveys: A Basis for Preservation Planning
- National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation
- National Register Bulletin 16A: How to Complete the National Register Registration Form
- National Register Bulletin 15: How to Complete the National Register Multiple Property Documentation Form
- National Register Bulletin 39: Researching a Historic Property

### **Historic Significance**

As stated in Appendix C: Guidelines for Evaluation and Registration Programs of the Pomona Citywide Historic Context Statement, "The definition of historic significance used by the California Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) in its administration of the California Register is based upon the following definition used by the National Park Service for the National Register." Cities across California have based their own local criteria on this same definition.

That definition (From National Register Bulletin 16A) is as follows:

*Historic significance is [defined as] the importance of a property to the history, architecture, archaeology, engineering, or culture of a community, State, or the nation. It is achieved in several ways:*

- *Association with important events, activities or patterns*
- *Association with important persons*
- *Distinctive physical characteristics of design, construction, or form*
- *Potential to yield important information*

*A property may be significant individually or as part of a grouping of properties.*

While Pomona has different designation criteria, they fits into these four areas and are consistent with both the California and National Register criteria.

### **Period of Significance**

When evaluating a property for historic significance, a period of significance must also be determined. The National Park Service defines the Period of Significance as:

*"the length of time when a property was associated with important events, activities or persons, or attained the characteristics which qualify it for...listing. The period of significance usually begins with the date when significant activities or events began giving the property its historic significance; this is often a date of construction."*

### **Historic Integrity**

As stated in our historic context statement, historic integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance and is defined as the "authenticity of a property's historic identity, evidenced by the survival of physical characteristics that existed during the property's historic period." The National Park Service defines seven aspects of integrity: location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association.

These qualities are defined as follows:

- **Location** is the place where the historic property was constructed or the place where the historic event took place.
- **Design** is the combination of elements that create the form, plan, space, structure, and style of a property.
- **Setting** is the physical environment of a historic property.
- **Materials** are the physical elements that were combined or deposited during a particular period of time and in a particular pattern or configuration to form a historic property.
- **Workmanship** is the physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during any given period in history or prehistory.
- **Feeling** is a property's expression of the aesthetic or historic sense of a particular period of time.
- **Association** is the direct link between an important historic event or person and a historic property.

While it is not necessary for a property to retain all seven aspects of integrity, or indeed, "all its historic physical features or characteristics," the National Park Service notes that the property must retain "the essential physical features that enable it to convey its historic identity. The essential physical features are those features that define both why a property is significant and when it was significant.

### **Character-Defining Features**

Every historic building is unique, with its own identity and its own distinctive character. Character-defining features are those visual aspects and physical features or elements, constructed during the property's period of significance, that give the building its historic character and contribute to the integrity of the property. Character-defining features should be considered in the planning and design of a project to preserve them to the maximum extent possible. Character-defining features can identify the building as an example of a specific building type, usually related to the building's function; they can exemplify the use of specific materials or methods of construction, or embody a historical period or architectural style; and they can convey the sense of time and place in buildings associated with significant events or people.

In order to be considered eligible for designation as a historic resource, a property must possess both sufficient historic significance to meet at least one of the designation criteria, and sufficient historic integrity to convey its significance through the physical features that reflect the property's character and identity.

### **EVALUATION PROCESS:**

Staff used the following process to evaluate the properties:

1. Review the Citywide Historic Context Statement and identify what, if any, themes in the Context Statement are applicable to the properties.
2. Review the Context Statement Theme(s) to determine eligibility standards.
3. Review the designation criteria to determine if the properties meet any of the criteria.
4. Review the Theme and criteria to determine the period of significance.
5. Review the Context Statement to determine integrity standards.
6. Review the seven aspects of integrity to see if the properties have integrity.
7. Review Registration Requirements to see if property meets requirements.
8. Make a determination regarding each property.

### **EVALUATION - 548 WEST CENTER STREET:**

As stated in last month's staff report the estimated construction date is 1885, taken from the 1993 citywide survey. The property is also identified as being designed in the Italianate architectural style. Staff reviewed these determinations and concurred with them.

#### **Step 1: Theme**

Staff reviewed the Citywide Historic Context Statement and determined that the Growing Community (1865-1887): Residential Development Theme from the Citywide Historic Context Statement is applicable to this property.

##### Location

The location of this theme is generally downtown. This property is located just north of what we define today as downtown, but is part of the original Pomona Land and Water Company development, and would therefore meet the location requirements. The area, based on the theme could be a potential historic district.

#### **Step 2: Determine Eligibility Standards**

The theme has both general Eligibility Standards and Registration Requirements in order to qualify for designations. They are broken down by criteria as follows:

##### **Criteria 1 and 9 (Events/Patterns of Development)**

Individual residential properties that are eligible under this criterion may be significant:

- As the site of an event important in history; or

- For exemplifying an important trend or pattern of development; or
- As a rare remaining example of early residential development in Spadra or Pomona. This includes remnant adobe residences reflecting the city's association with the Rancho era; or rare, remaining examples of some of the city's earliest residential development; or
- As a remnant feature representing early built resources from the period.

#### Registration Requirements

To be eligible under this criterion a property must:

- Date from the period of significance; and
- Have a proven association with an event important in history; or
- Represent an important catalyst for a pattern or trend in residential development; or
- Represent a rare remaining example of early residential development in Pomona or Spadra; and
- Display most of the character-defining features of the property type or style; and
- Retain the essential aspects of historic integrity.

#### **Criterion 2 (Important Persons)**

Individual residential properties eligible under this criterion may be significant:

- For an association with persons significant in our past, including early pioneers in the history of Spadra or Pomona; or
- For a proven association with a specific significant ethnic or cultural group that made a demonstrable impact on the early community.

Note that according to National Park Service guidance, persons significant in our past refers to individuals whose activities are demonstrably important within a local, state, or national historic context. A property is not eligible if its only justification for significance is that it was owned or used by a person who is a member of an identifiable profession, class, or social or ethnic group. In addition, the property must be associated with a person's productive life, reflecting the time period when he or she achieved significance.

#### Registration Requirements

To be eligible under this criterion a property must:

- Have a proven association with the productive period of a person important to local, state, or national history; and
- Display most of the character-defining features of the property type or style from the period of significance (i.e., the period when the property was associated with the important person); and
- Retain the essential aspects of integrity.

#### **Criteria 3, 5, and 7 (Architecture and Design)**

Individual residential properties that are eligible under this criterion may be significant as:

- A good or rare example of an architectural style, property type, or method of construction; or
- A distinctive work by a noted architect, landscape architect, builder, or designer.

#### Registration Requirements

To be eligible under this criterion a property must:

- Date from the period of significance; and
- Represent a good/excellent or rare example of a style or type; and
- Display most of the character-defining features of the style or type; and
- Retain the essential aspects of integrity.

The Theme does not address Criteria 4, 6, 8, and 10. Staff examined those criteria in Step 3.

### **Step 3: Designation Criteria**

Staff examined the designation criteria listed in the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance and followed any eligibility standard or registration requirement in the applicable theme in the Citywide Historic Context Statement.

**Criterion 1:** *It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or natural history;*

Based on the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. There is no evidence that this property was the site of an event important in history; or that the property exemplified an important trend or pattern of development; or was a remnant feature representing early built resources from the period.
2. The property may be a rare remaining example of early residential development in Spadra or Pomona as it may be a rare, remaining examples of some of the city's earliest residential development. *(We will check for integrity later)*

**Criterion 2:** *It is identified with persons or events significant in local, state, or national history;*

Based on the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. There is no evidence creating an association with persons significant in our past, including early pioneers in the history of Spadra or Pomona; or a proven association with a specific significant ethnic or cultural group that made a demonstrable impact on the early community.

**Criterion 3:** *It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction,*

*or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;*

Based on the architecture of the property and the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. The property may be a good or rare example of an architectural style, property type, or method of construction. *(We will check for integrity later)*
2. There is no evidence that this property is a distinctive work by a noted architect, landscape architect, builder, or designer.

**Criterion 4:** *It contributes to the significance of an historic area, being a geographically definable area possessing a concentration of historic or scenic properties or thematically related grouping of properties which contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by plan or physical development;*

Based on the history in the historic context, staff reviewed the criteria and determined the following:

1. The location of this property may be located within a potential historic area. *(We will check for integrity later)*

**Criterion 5:** *It is the work of a notable builder, designer, landscape designer or architect;*

Based on the architecture of the property and the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. There is no evidence that this property is a distinctive work by a noted architect, landscape architect, builder, or designer.

**Criterion 6:** *It has a unique location or singular physical characteristics or is a view or vista representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the city of Pomona;*

Based on the history in the historic context and the location of the property, staff reviewed the criteria and determined the following:

1. There is no evidence that the location of this property is unique or has singular physical characteristics.
2. It is not a view or vista representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the city of Pomona.

**Criterion 7:** *It embodies elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that*

*represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation;*

Based on the architecture of the property and the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. While the property may embody elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship, since this house is one of several examples in Pomona, those elements do not represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation.

**Criterion 8:** *It is similar to other distinctive properties, sites, areas, or objects based on an historic, cultural, or architectural motif;*

Based on the architecture of the property and the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. The property is similar to other properties from the same time period but there is no evidence that the similarity is based on a historic or cultural motif. In addition, there is no concentration of Italianate style architecture that would show a deliberate architectural motif being used instead of the random coincidence of choosing the same style of home to build or buy.

**Criterion 9:** *It reflects significant geographical patterns, including those associated with different eras of settlement and growth, particular transportation modes, or distinctive examples of park or community planning;*

Based on the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. There is no evidence that this property was the site of an event important in history; or that the property exemplified an important trend or pattern of development; or was a remnant feature representing early built resources from the period.
2. The property may be a rare remaining example of early residential development in Spadra or Pomona as it may be a rare, remaining examples of some of the city's earliest residential development. *(We will check for integrity later)*

**Criterion 10:** *It is one of the few remaining examples in the city of Pomona, region, state, or nation possessing distinguishing characteristics of an architectural or historical type or specimen.*

Based on the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:



1. The property may be one of the few remaining examples of early residential development in Pomona as it may be a rare, remaining examples of some of the city's earliest residential development. *(We will check for integrity later)*

### **Step 3 Conclusion**

From this evaluation, staff determined that the property may meet the following criteria, however final determination is based upon the whole review (Steps 1 through 7):

#### **Criterion 1, 3, 4, 9, and 10**

### **Step 4: Period of Significance**

Based on the theme, the period of significance would be 1865-1887. This is limited by the construction date, which is estimated to be 1885. Since there is no evidence of significant events or persons associated with the property, the construction date is used as a period of significance. Therefore the period of significance is 1885.

### **Step 5: Review the Context Statement to Determine Integrity Standards**

Staff reviewed the Growing Community (1865-1887: Residential Development Theme from the Citywide Historic Context Statement for integrity standards for Criterion 1, 3, 4, 9, and 10. Staff found the following:

#### **Criteria 1 and 9**

##### Integrity Considerations

In order to be eligible for designation under this criterion, a property must retain sufficient integrity to convey its historic significance. Properties from this period are rare and represent early settlement of Spadra and Pomona; therefore, a greater degree of alteration may be acceptable.

- Residential properties from this period should retain integrity of location, design, feeling, and association, at a minimum, in order to convey their significance.
- An individual property that is eligible for a historic association must retain the essential physical features that made up its character or appearance during the period of its association with an event or historical pattern.
- A property that has lost some historic materials or details can be eligible if it retains the majority of the features that illustrate its style in terms of the massing, spatial relationships, proportion, pattern of windows and doors, texture of materials, and ornamentation.
- The setting may have changed (surrounding buildings and land uses).
- Note that some properties that may not retain sufficient integrity for listing in the National Register may remain eligible for listing at the state and local levels.

### **Criteria 3, 5, and 7**

#### Integrity Considerations

In order to be eligible for designation under this criterion, a property must retain sufficient integrity from the period of significance to convey its architecture. Properties from this period are rare; therefore, a greater degree of alteration may be acceptable.

- Residential properties significant under this criterion should retain integrity of design, materials, workmanship, and feeling, at a minimum.
- A property that is eligible for designation as a good/excellent or rare example of its style or type retains most - though not necessarily all - of the character-defining features of the style.
- A property important for illustrating a particular architectural style or construction technique must retain most of the physical features that constitute that style or technique. A property can be eligible if it has lost some historic materials or details but retains the majority of the essential features from the period of significance. These features illustrate the style in terms of the massing, spatial relationships, proportion, pattern of windows and doors, texture of materials, and ornamentation.
- A property is not eligible if it retains some basic features conveying massing but has lost the majority of the features that once characterized its style.

### **Step 6: Review the Integrity**

#### **Criteria 1, 3, and 9**

Staff first reviewed the integrity considerations for Criteria 1, 3, and 9. The applicable considerations for Criteria 1, and 9 are as follows:

- Residential properties from this period should retain integrity of location, design, feeling, and association, at a minimum, in order to convey their significance.
- A property that has lost some historic materials or details can be eligible if it retains the majority of the features that illustrate its style in terms of the massing, spatial relationships, proportion, pattern of windows and doors, texture of materials, and ornamentation.
- The setting may have changed (surrounding buildings and land uses).

This property has lost some historic materials or details. Although it could still be eligible, it is not because while it retained the majority of the features that illustrate its style in terms of the pattern of windows and doors, and texture of materials, the alterations and additions destroyed the massing, spatial relationships, proportion, and ornamentation features of the property.

The applicable considerations for Criterion 3 are as follows:

- Residential properties significant under this criterion should retain integrity of design, materials, workmanship, and feeling, at a minimum.

- A property that is eligible for designation as a good/excellent or rare example of its style or type retains most - though not necessarily all - of the character-defining features of the style.
- A property important for illustrating a particular architectural style or construction technique must retain most of the physical features that constitute that style or technique. A property can be eligible if it has lost some historic materials or details but retains the majority of the essential features from the period of significance. These features illustrate the style in terms of the massing, spatial relationships, proportion, pattern of windows and doors, texture of materials, and ornamentation.
- A property is not eligible if it retains some basic features conveying massing but has lost the majority of the features that once characterized its style.

This property does not retain some basic features, such as conveying massing, and has lost the majority of the features that once characterized its style. Therefore it is not eligible.

Staff then reviewed the seven aspects of integrity for Criteria 4 and 10 since the context does not have any considerations. The applicable considerations for Criteria 4 and 10 are as follows:

#### **Criterion 4 and 10**

Since Criterion 4 relates to the property contributing to a historically significant area, staff examined whether or not the area could be a district and whether the property could contribute to it.

The property is located in an area that could be historic based on the theme. The original 1993 Citywide survey identified a potential Center Street Historic District the ends with the house at the corner of Rebecca Street and Center Street. The survey evaluated properties west of the proposed boundary but chose not to include them in the historic district. Staff visited the neighborhood and found that most of the homes west of the proposed district boundary had been significantly altered.

Criterion 10 relates to the property being one of the few remaining examples in Pomona possessing distinguishing characteristics of an architectural or historical type or specimen. In order to meet this criterion the property must have integrity of Design and Materials.

#### Location

The property is in its original location and has integrity of location.

#### Design

The Design, according to National Register Bulletin 15 "is the combination of elements that create the form, plan, space, structure, and style of a property".

Since the property would be designated because of its architecture National Register Bulletin 15 states:

*"The property is not eligible, however, if it retains some basic features conveying massing but has lost the majority of the features that once characterized its style."*

The property has numerous alterations including the front porch and a large addition in the rear of the building. This property doesn't even retain the massing and spatial arrangement portions of design. The addition altered the massing. The architectural details are also missing. The front porch replacement altered the porch roof and architectural details expected to be found on an Italianate building.

Many of the character-defining features of the Italianate architectural style are missing, including:

- Rectangular in plan.
- Large mass to emphasize its vertical proportions.
- Height helped emphasize vertical proportions of building.
- Small porches
- Elaborately decorated facades.
- Ornate details.
- Decorative paired brackets and cornices on soffits
- Decorative corner boards
- Spindled balustrades
- Decorative brackets under projecting roof

Staff concluded the property does not have integrity of design.

#### Setting

The setting has changed, but the Citywide Historic Context recognizes the change in the setting and states that it is acceptable. Therefore, the property has integrity of setting.

#### Materials

Materials, according to National Register Bulletin 15, "are the physical elements that were combined or deposited during a particular period of time and in a particular pattern or configuration to form a historic property".

Since the property would be designated because of its architecture National Register Bulletin 15 states:

*"A property must retain the key exterior materials dating from the period of its historic significance."*

The period of significance for the property is 1885, and there are numerous materials, including concrete block, that are after the period of significance. Staff concluded that the property does not have integrity of materials.

### Workmanship

Workmanship, according to National Register Bulletin 15, "is the physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during any given period in history or prehistory."

National Register Bulletin 15 provides examples of workmanship. It states:

*"Examples of workmanship in historic buildings include tooling, carving, painting, graining, turning, and joinery."*

The elements that could have showed workmanship have been removed, and therefore staff has concluded that the property does not have integrity of Workmanship.

### Feeling

Feeling, according to National Register Bulletin 15, "is a property's expression of the aesthetic or historic sense of a particular period of time."

National Register Bulletin 15 states that feeling:

*"Results from the presence of physical features that, taken together, convey the property's historic character."*

This property has been altered to a point that you cannot readily identify it as an Italianate building. The alterations have caused a loss of the historic character. Staff concluded that the property did not have integrity of Feeling.

### Association

This aspect of integrity does not apply since the property is not associated with an important event or person

Staff has concluded that the property does not have the integrity necessary for Criteria 1, 3, 4, 9, and 10. In addition, based on previous historic district designations, a building with this little integrity would be classified as a non-contributing structure.

## **Step 7: Registration Requirements**

There are registration requirements for Criteria 1, 3, and 9.

### Criteria 1 and 9

The registration requirements are as follows:

### Registration Requirements

To be eligible under this criterion a property must:

- Date from the period of significance; and
- Have a proven association with an event important in history; or
- Represent an important catalyst for a pattern or trend in residential development; or
- Represent a rare remaining example of early residential development in Pomona or Spadra; and
- Display most of the character-defining features of the property type or style; and
- Retain the essential aspects of historic integrity.

Staff has concluded that the property does not retain the essential aspects of historic integrity, and therefore, does not meet the registration requirements.

### Criterion 3

The registration requirements are as follows:

### Registration Requirements

To be eligible under this criterion a property must:

- Date from the period of significance; and
- Represent a good/excellent or rare example of a style or type; and
- Display most of the character-defining features of the style or type; and
- Retain the essential aspects of integrity.

Staff has concluded that the property does not represent a good/excellent or rare example of a style or type, display most of the character-defining features of the style or type, and does not retain the essential aspects of historic integrity, and therefore, does not meet the registration requirements.

## **Step 8: Determination**

The property lacks the integrity to be designated as a local historic landmark, or as a contributor to a potential historic district, therefore staff determined that the property is not historic.

## **EVALUATION - 554 WEST CENTER STREET:**

As stated in last month's staff report the estimated construction date is 1895, taken from the 1993 Citywide survey. The property is also identified as being designed in the Victorian Vernacular architectural style. Staff reviewed these determinations and concurred with them.

### **Step 1: Theme**

Staff reviewed the Citywide Historic Context Statement and determined that the Incorporation and Civic Improvements (1888-1899): Residential Development Theme from the Citywide Historic Context Statement is applicable to this property.

### Location

The location of this theme is generally downtown. This property is located just north of what we define today as downtown, but is part of the original Pomona Land and Water Company development,

and would therefore meet the location requirements. The area, based on the theme could be a potential historic district.

## **Step 2: Determine Eligibility Standards**

The theme has both general Eligibility Standards and Registration Requirements in order to qualify for designations. They are broken down by criteria as follows:

### **Criteria 1 and 9 (Events/Patterns of Development)**

Individual residential properties that are eligible under this criterion may be significant:

- As the site of an event important in history; or
- For exemplifying an important trend or pattern of development; or
- As a rare remaining example of early residential development in Pomona from an important boom period; or
- As a remnant feature representing early built resources from the period.

### Registration Requirements

To be eligible under this criterion a property must:

- Date from the period of significance; and
- Have a proven association with an event important in history; or
- Represent an important catalyst for a pattern or trend in residential development; or
- Represent a rare remaining example of early residential development in Pomona; and
- Display most of the character-defining features of the property type or style; and
- Retain the essential aspects of historic integrity.

### **Criterion 2 (Important Persons)**

Individual residential properties eligible under this criterion may be significant:

- For an association with persons significant in our past, including early pioneers in the history of Pomona; or
- For a proven association with a specific significant ethnic or cultural group that made a demonstrable impact on the early community.

Note that according to National Park Service guidance, persons significant in our past refers to individuals whose activities are demonstrably important within a local, state, or national historic context. A property is not eligible if its only justification for significance is that it was owned or used by a person who is a member of an identifiable profession, class, or social or ethnic group. In addition, the property must be associated with a person's productive life, reflecting the time period when he or she achieved significance.

### Registration Requirements

To be eligible under this criterion a property must:

- Have a proven association with the productive period of a person important to local, state, or national history; and
- Display most of the character-defining features of the property type or style from the period of significance (i.e., the period when the property was associated with the important person); and
- Retain the essential aspects of integrity.

### **Criteria 3, 5, and 7 (Architecture and Design)**

Individual residential properties that are eligible under this criterion may be significant as:

- A good or rare example of an architectural style, property type, or method of construction; or
- A distinctive work by a noted architect, landscape architect, builder, or designer.

### Registration Requirements

To be eligible under this criterion a property must:

- Date from the period of significance; and
- Represent a good/excellent or rare example of a style or type; and
- Display most of the character-defining features of the style or type; and
- Retain the essential aspects of integrity.

The Theme does not address Criteria 4, 6, 8, and 10. Staff examined those criteria in Step 3.

### **Step 3: Designation Criteria**

Staff examined the designation criteria listed in the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance and followed any eligibility standard or registration requirement in the applicable theme in the Citywide Historic Context Statement.

**Criterion 1:** *It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or natural history;*

Based on the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. There is no evidence that this property was the site of an event important in history; or that the property exemplified an important trend or pattern of development; or was a remnant feature representing early built resources from the period.



2. The property may be a rare remaining example of early residential development in Pomona as it may be a rare, remaining example of some of the city's earliest residential development. *(We will check for integrity later)*

**Criterion 2:** *It is identified with persons or events significant in local, state, or national history;*

Based on the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. There is no evidence creating an association with persons significant in our past, including early pioneers in the history of Pomona; or a proven association with a specific significant ethnic or cultural group that made a demonstrable impact on the early community.

**Criterion 3:** *It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;*

Based on the architecture of the property and the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. The property may be a good or rare example of an architectural style, property type, or method of construction. *(We will check for integrity later)*
2. There is no evidence that this property is a distinctive work by a noted architect, landscape architect, builder, or designer.

**Criterion 4:** *It contributes to the significance of an historic area, being a geographically definable area possessing a concentration of historic or scenic properties or thematically related grouping of properties which contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by plan or physical development;*

Based on the history in the historic context, staff reviewed the criteria and determined the following:

1. The location of this property may be located within a potential historic area. *(We will check for integrity later)*

**Criterion 5:** *It is the work of a notable builder, designer, landscape designer or architect;*

Based on the architecture of the property and the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. There is no evidence that this property is a distinctive work by a noted architect, landscape architect, builder, or designer.

**Criterion 6:** *It has a unique location or singular physical characteristics or is a view or vista representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the city of Pomona;*

Based on the history in the historic context and the location of the property, staff reviewed the criteria and determined the following:

1. There is no evidence that the location of this property is unique or has singular physical characteristics.
2. It is not a view or vista representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the city of Pomona.

**Criterion 7:** *It embodies elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation;*

Based on the architecture of the property and the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. While the property may embody elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship, since this house is one of many examples in Pomona, those elements do not represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation.

**Criterion 8:** *It is similar to other distinctive properties, sites, areas, or objects based on an historic, cultural, or architectural motif;*

Based on the architecture of the property and the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. The property is similar to other properties from the same time period but there is no evidence that the similarity is based on a historic or cultural motif. In addition, there is no concentration of Victorian Vernacular style architecture that would show a deliberate architectural motif being used instead of the random coincidence of choosing the same style of home to build or buy.

**Criterion 9:** *It reflects significant geographical patterns, including those associated with different eras of settlement and growth, particular transportation modes, or distinctive examples of park or community planning;*

Based on the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. There is no evidence that this property was the site of an event important in history; or that the property exemplified an important trend or pattern of development; or was a remnant feature representing early built resources from the period.
2. The property may be a rare remaining example of early residential development in Pomona as it may be a rare, remaining example of some of the city's earliest residential development. *(We will check for integrity later)*

**Criterion 10:** It is one of the few remaining examples in the city of Pomona, region, state, or nation possessing distinguishing characteristics of an architectural or historical type or specimen.

Based on the history found for the property and contained in last month's staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

1. The property may be one of the few remaining examples of early residential development in Pomona as it may be a rare, remaining example of some of the city's earliest residential development. *(We will check for integrity later)*

### **Step 3 Conclusion**

From this evaluation, staff determined that the property might meet the following criteria, however final determination is based upon the whole review (Steps 1 through 7):

**Criterion 1, 3, 4, 9, and 10**

### **Step 4: Period of Significance**

Based on the theme, the period of significance would be 1888-1899. This is limited by the construction date, which is estimated to be 1895. Since there is no evidence of significant events or persons associated with the property, the construction date is used as a period of significance. Therefore, the period of significance is 1895.

### **Step 5: Review the Context Statement to Determine Integrity Standards**

Staff reviewed the Incorporation and Civic Improvements (1888-1899): Residential Development Theme from the Citywide Historic Context Statement for integrity standards for Criterion 1, 3, 4, 9, and 10. Staff found the following:

#### **Criteria 1 and 9**

##### Integrity Considerations

In order to be eligible for designation under this criterion, a property must retain sufficient integrity to convey its historic significance. Properties from this period are rare and represent early settlement of Pomona; therefore, a greater degree of alteration may be acceptable.

- Residential properties from this period should retain integrity of location, design, feeling, and association, at a minimum, in order to convey their significance.
- An individual property that is eligible for a historic association must retain the essential physical features that made up its character or appearance during the period of its association with an event or historical pattern.
- A property that has lost some historic materials or details can be eligible if it retains the majority of the features that illustrate its style in terms of the massing, spatial relationships, proportion, pattern of windows and doors, texture of materials, and ornamentation.
- The setting may have changed (surrounding buildings and land uses).
- Note that some properties that may not retain sufficient integrity for listing in the National Register may remain eligible for listing at the state and local levels.

### **Criteria 3, 5, and 7**

#### Integrity Considerations

In order to be eligible for designation under this criterion, a property must retain sufficient integrity from the period of significance to convey its architecture. Properties from this period are rare; therefore, a greater degree of alteration may be acceptable.

- Residential properties significant under this criterion should retain integrity of design, materials, workmanship, and feeling, at a minimum.
- A property that is eligible for designation as a good/excellent or rare example of its style or type retains most - though not necessarily all - of the character-defining features of the style.
- A property important for illustrating a particular architectural style or construction technique must retain most of the physical features that constitute that style or technique. A property can be eligible if it has lost some historic materials or details but retains the majority of the essential features from the period of significance. These features illustrate the style in terms of the massing, spatial relationships, proportion, pattern of windows and doors, texture of materials, and ornamentation.
- A property is not eligible if it retains some basic features conveying massing but has lost the majority of the features that once characterized its style.

### **Step 6: Review the Integrity**

#### **Criteria 1, 3, and 9**

Staff first reviewed the integrity considerations for Criteria 1, 3, and 9. The applicable considerations for Criteria 1, and 9 are as follows:

- Residential properties from this period should retain integrity of location, design, feeling, and association, at a minimum, in order to convey their significance.
- A property that has lost some historic materials or details can be eligible if it retains the majority of the features that illustrate its style in terms of the massing, spatial relationships, proportion, pattern of windows and doors, texture of materials, and ornamentation.

- The setting may have changed (surrounding buildings and land uses).

This property has lost much of its historic materials and details. Although it could still be eligible, it is not because it did not retain the majority of the features that illustrate its style in terms of the pattern of windows and doors, and texture of materials. The alterations and additions destroyed the massing, spatial relationships, proportion, and ornamentation features of the property.

The applicable considerations for Criterion 3 are as follows:

- Residential properties significant under this criterion should retain integrity of design, materials, workmanship, and feeling, at a minimum.
- A property that is eligible for designation as a good/excellent or rare example of its style or type retains most - though not necessarily all - of the character-defining features of the style.
- A property important for illustrating a particular architectural style or construction technique must retain most of the physical features that constitute that style or technique. A property can be eligible if it has lost some historic materials or details but retains the majority of the essential features from the period of significance. These features illustrate the style in terms of the massing, spatial relationships, proportion, pattern of windows and doors, texture of materials, and ornamentation.
- A property is not eligible if it retains some basic features conveying massing but has lost the majority of the features that once characterized its style.

This property does not retain some basic features, such as conveying massing, and has lost the majority of the features that once characterized its style. Therefore, it is not eligible.

Staff then reviewed the seven aspects of integrity for Criteria 4 and 10 since the context does not have any considerations. The applicable considerations for Criteria 4 and 10 are as follows:

#### **Criterion 4 and 10**

Since Criterion 4 relates to the property contributing to a historically significant area, staff examined whether or not the area could be a district and whether the property could contribute to it.

The property is located in an area that could be historic based on the theme. The original 1993 citywide survey identified a potential Center Street Historic District the ends with the house at the corner of Rebecca Street and Center Street. The survey evaluated properties west of the proposed boundary but chose not to include them in the historic district. Staff visited the neighborhood and found that most of the homes west of the proposed district boundary had been altered.

Criterion 10 relates to the property being one of the few remaining examples in Pomona possessing distinguishing characteristics of an architectural or historical type or specimen. In order to meet this criterion the property must have integrity of Design and Materials.

### Location

The property is in its original location and has integrity of location.

### Design

The Design, according to National Register Bulletin 15 "is the combination of elements that create the form, plan, space, structure, and style of a property".

Since the property would be designated because of its architecture National Register Bulletin 15 states:

*"The property is not eligible, however, if it retains some basic features conveying massing but has lost the majority of the features that once characterized its style."*

The property has numerous alterations including the replacement of windows, wood siding being covered with stucco, removal of window trim, and a large addition in the rear of the building. This property does not even retain the massing and spatial arrangement portions of design. The addition altered the massing. The architectural details are also missing. The stucco and window replacement removed architectural details expected to be found on a Victorian Vernacular building.

Many of the character-defining features of the Victorian Vernacular architectural style are missing, including:

- Cornices with brackets
- Wood siding with corner boards, shingles on gable roof ends, and simple trim around windows and doors.
- Simple decorative trusses on the gable ends were a common feature.
- Bargeboards were very simple. Braces (or brackets) were used to support the eaves.
- Very simple trim and details.
- Double hung wood frame windows, arranged in a two over two or a two over one pattern.
- Large veranda or porch.
- Simple detailing including the corner posts, porch posts, and railings. Usually flat cut trim.
- Spindlework on porches also used.
- Braces (or brackets) were used to support the exposed roof rafters.

Staff concluded the property does not have integrity of design.

### Setting

The setting has changed, but the Citywide Historic Context recognizes the change in the setting and states that it is acceptable. Therefore, the property has integrity of setting.

### Materials

Materials, according to National Register Bulletin 15, "are the physical elements that were combined or deposited during a particular period of time and in a particular pattern or configuration to form a historic property".

Since the property would be designated because of its architecture National Register Bulletin 15 states:

*"A property must retain the key exterior materials dating from the period of its historic significance."*

The period of significance for the property is 1895, and there are numerous materials, including stucco and modern windows that are after the period of significance. Staff concluded that the property does not have integrity of materials.

### Workmanship

Workmanship, according to National Register Bulletin 15, "is the physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during any given period in history or prehistory."

National Register Bulletin 15 provides examples of workmanship. It states:

*"Examples of workmanship in historic buildings include tooling, carving, painting, graining, turning, and joinery."*

The elements that could have showed workmanship have been removed, and therefore staff has concluded that the property does not have integrity of Workmanship.

### Feeling

Feeling, according to National Register Bulletin 15, "is a property's expression of the aesthetic or historic sense of a particular period of time."

National Register Bulletin 15 states that feeling:

*"Results from the presence of physical features that, taken together, convey the property's historic character."*

This property has been altered to a point that you cannot readily identify it as a Victorian Vernacular building. The alterations have caused a loss of the historic character. Staff concluded that the property did not have integrity of Feeling.

### Association

This aspect of integrity does not apply since the property is not associated with an important event or person

Staff has concluded that the property does not have the integrity necessary for Criteria 1, 3, 4, 9, and 10. In addition, based on previous historic district designations, a building with this little integrity would be classified as a non-contributing structure.

## **Step 7: Registration Requirements**

There are registration requirements for Criteria 1, 3, and 9.

### Criteria 1 and 9

The registration requirements are as follows:

#### Registration Requirements

To be eligible under this criterion a property must:

- Date from the period of significance; and
- Have a proven association with an event important in history; or
- Represent an important catalyst for a pattern or trend in residential development; or
- Represent a rare remaining example of early residential development in Pomona; and
- Display most of the character-defining features of the property type or style; and
- Retain the essential aspects of historic integrity.

Staff has concluded that the property does not retain the essential aspects of historic integrity, and therefore, does not meet the registration requirements.

### Criterion 3

The registration requirements are as follows:

#### Registration Requirements

To be eligible under this criterion a property must:

- Date from the period of significance; and
- Represent a good/excellent or rare example of a style or type; and
- Display most of the character-defining features of the style or type; and
- Retain the essential aspects of integrity.

Staff has concluded that the property does not represent a good/excellent or rare example of a style or type, display most of the character-defining features of the style or type, and does not retain the essential aspects of historic integrity, and therefore, does not meet the registration requirements.



### **Step 8: Determination**

The property lacks the integrity to be designated as a local historic landmark, or as a contributor to a potential historic district, therefore staff determined that the property is not historic.

### **CONCLUSION:**

Staff has determined that the properties in question do not meet the designation criteria or the integrity requirements to be designated as a local historic landmark, or as a contributor to a potential historic district. Therefore, staff still recommends approving the Certificate of Appropriateness. If the Commission still thinks that these properties meet the requirements for designation, staff requests that Commissioners detail which criteria the properties meet, and how the properties meet those criteria.

### **ATTACHMENTS:**

1. Draft Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 2022-026
2. Historic Preservation Commission Staff Report, September 7, 2022
3. Photographs of site and surrounding area
4. Historic Resources Inventory Surveys, 1993