



# Historic Preservation Commission

## Staff Report

November 06, 2024

<b>FILE NO:</b>	MAJCOA-000056-2024
	A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-000056-2024) to construct a new, detached, single-story 1,000 square foot accessory dwelling unit at the rear of a contributing resource within the Lincoln Park Historic District.
<b>ADDRESS:</b>	<b>677 N. Gibbs St.</b>
<b>APPLICANT:</b>	Julio Segura
<b>PROJECT PLANNER:</b>	Carlos Molina, Assistant Planner
<b>ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:</b>	Pursuant to the provisions of CEQA (Public Resources Code, Section 21084 et. seq.), the guidelines include a list of classes of projects which have been determined not to have a significant effect on the environment and which shall, therefore, be exempt from the provisions of CEQA. The Planning Commission will consider adopting a Categorical Exemption in compliance with Section 15331, Class 31 (Historic Rehabilitation) in that the project is consistent with the applicable general plan designation, all applicable policies, zoning regulations and is not on a project site greater than five acres. The proposed project described above hereby meets the guidelines for a Categorical Exemption. Therefore, no further environmental review is required.
<b>RECOMMENDATION:</b>	Approve File No(s). MAJCOA-000056-2024 and adopt Resolution No. 24-044 (Attachment 1)

---

### IMPORTANT DATES:

<b>Date Submitted:</b>	January 01, 2024
<b>Date Determined Complete:</b>	October 08, 2024
<b>Deadline to make a Decision:</b>	December 22, 2024

### **CRITICAL ISSUES:**

- Massing of the proposed ADU.

### **PROPERTY ARCHITECTURE AND BACKGROUND:**

The existing primary dwelling, located at 677 N. Gibbs Street, within the Lincoln Park Historic District is estimated to have been constructed in 1900. According to Los Angeles County Assessor Records, the dwelling measures at approximately 1,014 square feet. The site's survey included in the 1998 Lincoln Park Historic District Survey identified the existing primary dwelling as an example of the Folk Victorian architecture style. The notable Folk Victorian features identified on the primary structure include shiplap siding, a hipped and projected gabled roof, tall narrow double-hung sash windows, and a picture window located on the front façade (attachment 2).

### **APPLICATION SUBMITTAL INFO**

On January 11, 2024, Planning Staff received a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-000056-2024) for the addition of a new-build, single-story, 1,000 square foot accessory dwelling unit at the rear of the subject property. Over the course of the project's review period, the project plans have undergone a total of four comprehensive revisions. The scope of the revisions dealt with appropriately addressing ADU development standards, refining architectural and massing details to ensure sufficient compatibility with existing buildings on the site and the adjacent historic neighborhood.

### **CHARACTER-DEFINING FEATURES:**

The primary structure is a one-story, single family residence built in the Folk Victorian style approximately constructed in 1900. The property was included in the 1998 adoption of the Lincoln Park Historic District as a contributing resource. Character-defining features of the primary structure include the following:

1. Steep-pitched roof
2. Gable front and wing
3. Spindle-work on porch
4. Boxed roof-wall junction
5. Decorative truss at gable roof ends
6. Double-hung wood-framed windows
7. Horizontal wood siding w/ corner boards

### **DISCUSSION OF CRITICAL ISSUES**

1. Size and massing of the 1,000 square foot ADU in relation to the existing 1,014 square foot primary dwelling on the site.

In order to accommodate the typical roof pitches associated with the Victorian Style, the originally proposed ADU was designed with a greater overall height of the existing primary dwelling. Although the originally proposed height was compliant with ADU height standards, the massing and scale relationship was capable of presenting a significant contrast in the typical relationship of scale and massing between primary and accessory structures. For the purpose of maintaining an acceptable relationship within the district, the ADU's roof pitch was revised from a 12:12 roof pitch to a 8:12 roof pitch which produced a peak building height of 17'-6" as opposed to the primary dwelling's peak height of 20'-4" (see sheet C-1 of the proposed plans in Attachment 4).

## **DESIGN REVIEW:**

The Historic Preservation Ordinance provides that the Commission is guided by the following areas in addition to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Staff has reviewed the project as it relates to these standards as well as any applicable design guidelines. Staff's analysis is below:

1. Height. *The height of any proposed construction shall be compatible with the height and bulk of surrounding structures and in conformance with the maximum allowable height for the applicable zoning district.*

For the purpose of maintaining an appropriate scale between primary and accessory buildings, the ADU will have a peak height that is less than the primary dwelling unit. Therefore, the ADU is meeting all applicable height requirements/guidelines.

2. Proportions of Windows and Doors. *The proportions and relationships between doors and windows shall be compatible with the architectural style and character of the surrounding structures, and be of an appropriate material.*

The proposed windows and doors are to match the proportions typical of the Folk Victorian style and those found on the existing primary dwelling. Modifications in proportions may occur in order to accommodate minimum window provisions set forth by the Los Angeles County Fire Code and California Building Code.

3. Relationship of Building Masses and Spaces. *The resulting relationships between proposed structures and created spaces, or between remodeled structures and created spaces, shall be consistent with the shapes and setbacks of existing adjacent structures.*

The proposed addition will be utilizing an established building mass style of the Folk Victorian style and will accommodate required setbacks. Given the rectangular configuration of the lot and existing and proposed buildings on the site, the building configurations will not create any inconsistencies between building spaces and creates spaces.

4. Roof Shape. *The designs of the roof shall be compatible with the architectural character and style of the surrounding structures. Gables, turrets, and other roof forms shall be incorporated when appropriate to accomplish design compatibility with adjacent structures.*

The design features of the ADU roof have been designed to match the features of the primary dwelling on the property. However a visual difference may be noticeable due to the modification to the roof slope which has been incorporated in order to maintain an appropriate scale between primary and accessory structure on the site and within the historic district.

5. Scale. *The scale of the structure shall be compatible with the architectural character and style of the existing buildings. The new building shall blend in with surrounding buildings through the sensitive use of proper scale and materials.*

The scale of the proposed ADU is consistent with the architectural character and style of the existing buildings and has been designed to maintain the scale relationship between primary and accessory buildings in the historic district.

6. Directional Expression/Facades. *Facades in an historic district shall blend in with other structures with regard to directional expression. Structures in an historic district shall be compatible with the dominant horizontal and vertical expression of surrounding structures.*

The directional expression of the proposed ADU will utilize the direction expression of the existing primary dwelling. Therefore, the proposed structure will compatible with the dominant horizontal and vertical expression of surrounding structures.

7. Architectural Details. *Architectural details, including materials and textures shall be treated so as to make any new construction compatible with the architectural style and character of the historic district.*

The architectural details of the new-build ADU have been carefully considered to be significantly compatible with the architectural style and character of the primary dwelling on the site. Said details will include siding material and style, roof-wall junction, window surrounds, gable and cornice brackets, gable end details, brackets and cornice on patio, etc.

8. Architectural Rhythm and Articulation. *All proposed structures or facade remodeling shall show sufficient and rhythmic repetition of architectural details so as to be compatible with the facade articulation of existing adjacent buildings.*

The proposed ADU has been designed to have a consistent rhythmic repetition of architectural details on all facades to sufficiently match the level of details provided for all facades of historic structures.

9. New Additions/Construction. *New additions and adjacent related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

The new construction addition to the garage conversion to ADU will be significantly detached from the primary dwelling and will not include any modifications to the existing structure(s) on the site. Therefore, the essential form and integrity of the historic property will be unimpaired.

10. Mechanical Equipment. *All exterior mechanical equipment shall be screened from view with appropriately designed screens, parapet walls, landscaping or any other form of screening which the*

*commission or the planning and development services manager may deem acceptable. The design, style, color and texture of the required screening method shall be compatible with the existing or proposed building/facade design.*

The proposed ADU is significantly detached from public view as the ADU will be located to the rear of the lot and therefore screened by the primary dwelling fronting Gibbs St. The existing six foot fencing along the side and rear property will provide sufficient additional screening of any required and proposed mechanical equipment.

### **Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.**

The Historic Preservation Ordinance provide that the Commission be guided by the latest Rehabilitation Standards contained in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. Staff reviewed the project for compliance with the applicable standards below:

1. *A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.*

The proposed ADU is intended for residential purposes and has been further designed to maintain the distinctive character of residential uses on the property therefore no use change will occur.

2. *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

The project scope solely accounts for the build-out of a new residential dwelling and does not propose the removal of any distinctive materials or alteration of features on existing structures, therefore the historic character of the property will be retained and preserved.

3. *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

The proposed ADU does not include any conjectural features and all proposed architectural features reference the features found on the existing Folk Victorian dwelling on the property.

4. *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

This standard does not apply as there are no changed on the property that have acquired historic significance in their own right.

5. *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

The proposed ADU will have in-kind materials and finishes typical of the Folk Victorian, such as in-kind horizontal siding, side-gabled roof, window treatments, etc. Therefore, the characteristics of the property will be preserved.

6. *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

Because the scope of the proposed project solely includes the construction of a new accessory dwelling unit detached from the existing primary dwelling, there are no changes proposed and therefore this standard does not apply.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

The proposed ADU will be newly built with no alterations to historically significant structures on the site, therefore this standard does not apply.

8. *Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

The proposed project will not impact any potential archaeological resources. Therefore, this standard does not apply.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The project plans propose to match key architectural features of the primary dwelling including its boxed roof-wall junction, windows style and trim, siding type and orientation, decorative trusses, etc. Furthermore, the proposed dwelling will maintain an appropriate scale relationship with the existing primary structure on the site therefore protecting the integrity of the property and its environment.

*10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

The new-build accessory dwelling unit will be significantly detached and to the rear of the existing historic resource thereby preserving the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment.

**REQUIRED FINDINGS:**

The findings required in Section .1190.D.4. of the Pomona Zoning Code for Certificates of Appropriateness are contained in the attached resolution (Attachment 1).

**CONCLUSION:**

The overall design of the proposed ADU is compatible with the Folk Victorian style of the existing primary dwelling and the adjacent contributing resources in the immediate neighborhood. Additionally, the scale and placement of the accessory dwelling unit will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historic resource. Therefore, staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission approve Major Certificate of Appropriateness application (MAJCOA-000056-2024) and adopt Resolution No. 24-044.

**PUBLIC NOTICING:**

On October 23, 2024 a public hearing notice was mailed to the applicant and to all owners of properties located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject sites (Attachment 5). As of the date of this staff report, Planning Division Staff has not received correspondence regarding the proposed project.

**ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:**

The City of Pomona, as lead agency, has conducted an environmental review on the proposed project per the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Pursuant to the provisions of CEQA (Public Resources Code, Section 21084 et. seq.), the guidelines include a list of classes of projects which have been determined not to have a significant effect on the environment and which shall, therefore, be exempt from the provisions of CEQA. The Planning Commission will consider adopting a Categorical Exemption in compliance with Section 15331, Class 31 (Historic Rehabilitation) in that the project is consistent with the applicable general plan designation, all applicable policies, zoning regulations and is not on a project site greater than five acres. The proposed project described above hereby meets the guidelines for a Categorical Exemption. Therefore, no further environmental review is required.

**CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:**

The Conditions of Approval are contained in the attached resolution (Attachment 1).

**ATTACHMENTS:**

1. Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 24-044
2. LPHD Historic Site Survey
3. Site Photographs
4. Preserving Pomona's Historic Architecture - Victorian Vernacular Architecture
5. Proposed Architectural Plans
6. Proof of Public Noticing