



Historic Preservation Commission

Staff Report

September 7, 2022

FILE NO:	MAJCOA-018024-2022
	A request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-018024-2022) for the proposed demolition of a six-unit multifamily development and one single family dwelling, estimated to have been constructed in 1885 and 1895, respectively.
ADDRESS:	548 and 554 W. Center Street
APPLICANT:	Ali Dashti
PROJECT PLANNER:	Alan Fortune, Assistant Planner
ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:	This project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15301 of the CEQA Guidelines.
RECOMMENDATION:	Approve File No. MAJCOA-18024-2022 and adopt Resolution No. 2022-025 (Attachment 1)

BACKGROUND:

In May of 2022, Ali Dashti, submitted an application to demolish all structures located on two adjacent properties, one single family dwelling and a six-unit multifamily development, all constructed prior to 1945. According to the City of Pomona Historic Resources Inventory, the six-unit multi-family structure at 548 W. Center Street is estimated to have been constructed in 1885 while the single family dwelling located at 554 W. Center Street is estimated to have been constructed in 1895. The dwelling was listed in the 1993 City Wide Historic Resource Inventory as a Folk Victorian and identified by Planning Staff as Victorian Vernacular style (Attachment 2). The request for demolition is the for the purpose of development of the site. The development of the site requires the approval of a Major Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of a pre-1945 primary structure.

The properties are located on the south side of W. Center Street approximately mid-block between N. White Avenue and N. Rebecca Street (Figure 1).

Figure 1. Location Map



ANALYSIS:

The single family dwelling located at 554 W. Center Street is listed in the 1993 City of Pomona Historic Resources Inventory which identifies the structure as Folk Victorian architecture with an estimated construction date of 1895. The condition of the structure is “good” with moderate additions or alterations having been made over the years. The home rated as “CM” which refers to a building which may be contributing in spite of its alterations. Planning Staff conducted a thorough review of archival materials and has determined that the subject structure has had the windows replaced, stuccoed over siding, as well as an addition to the rear, altering the original appearance of the structure. Although the structure has been identified as a Folk Victorian, its current condition is not considered a good example of this architectural style due to missing character-defining features. A 384 square foot addition to the house was permitted in 2010 consisting of a master bedroom with a bathroom and walk-in closet. Other building permits associated with the structure include stuccoing house, adding a bathroom, and repairing and remodeling house. The series of alterations has severely affected the structure’s architectural and historic integrity.

The six-unit multi-family development located at 548 W. Center Street is listed in the Historic Resources Inventory and is identified as having Italianate architecture with an estimated construction date of 1885.

The condition of the structure is "good" with moderate alterations and additions having been made. Similarly, this structure is rated as "CM," referring to be contributing with modifications. The existing development is composed of three attached structures with the two structures at the rear having been added after the initial construction date. Additions to the structure were made in 1925, 1935, 1958, and 1960 according to City of Pomona Building and Safety Division permit records. Other alterations include the changing of the porch from original wood material to a porch composed of CMU block. For this style of home most of the home's character-defining features would have been contained in the porch. This one alteration severely affects the structure's architectural and historic integrity.

Neither property was previously identified in the 1993 City of Pomona Historic Resources Inventory as a potential local landmark nor national register candidate.

Due to the severity of the alterations to these structure, both subject structures are no longer considered good examples of their respective architectural styles, Italianate and Folk Victorian. The remaining structures have not retained enough of the character-defining features of these architectural styles to have integrity. Photographs of the exterior of the property are included as Attachment 4.

Archived Publications

Staff has reviewed the archived City Directories available online from the Pomona Public Library to identify any persons associated with the property who may be significant to local, state, or national history. Staff has identified the following persons associated with the subject property as listed below (Figure 4):

Name	Occupation	Year of Source
554 W. Center Street		
Matthew D. Gantenbein & Anna D.	Not listed	1907, 1911*, 1914*, 1916*, 1919, 1922*, 1931, 1940, 1945, 1948, 1951 Directories
Mr. Dippo	Fleming's Cement Works	1896* Directory
Cyrus Lewis	Retired	1898* Directory
Miss Francis Lewis	Dressmaker	1898* Directory
Dawson Spence	Clerk Bradley & Russell	1903* Directory
Frank Arnold	Clerk Saddle Rock Rest	1907* Directory
John King	Plaster and Cement Worker	1909* Directory
548 W. Center Street		
Harriet A McGilliard	Not listed	1926 Directory

**Resident at subject site*

Progress Bulletin articles pertaining to these addresses include obituaries for Anna B. Gantenbein and Dawson G. Spence, an article regarding the response of Pomona police officers to a vagrant possum at

554 W. Center Street in 1949, an article regarding a reported suicide victim at 548 W. Center Street in 1958, an article stating that one of the occupants of 548 W. Center Street was involved in an automobile accident in 1949. A Daily Progress article in 1908 identifies Dawson G. Spence, a resident of 554 W. Center Street, was a member of Company D and the Seventh Regiment Band.

As identified in the archived City Directories, Staff has reviewed archived publications to identify those persons associated with the property who may be significant to local, state, or national history. The persons associated with the property were not identified as being significant to local, state, or national history in the following publications:

- Pomona Centennial History by Pomona Centennial-Bicentennial Committee ('76).
- Pomona Centennial History by Gloria Ricci Lothrop ('88)
- History of Pomona Valley California with Biographical Sketches ('20)
- Sanborn Maps (1959)

CONCLUSION:

Based on Staff research and analysis, Staff has determined that the property does not meet any of the Historic Landmark Designation criteria as contained in Section .5809-13(D) of the Pomona Zoning Ordinance. Therefore, the property does not qualify for designation as a local single historic landmark nor a contributing structure to any potential historic district.

REQUIRED FINDINGS:

The findings required in Section .580913(F)(8) of the Pomona Zoning Code shall be considered to determine if the property would likely meet the criteria for historic landmark designation are contained in the attached resolution.

PUBLIC NOTICING:

On August 5, 2022, a public hearing notice was mailed to the applicant and to all owners of properties located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject sites (Attachment 5). On August 26, 2022, a copy of the public hearing notice was published in the Inland Valley Daily Bulletin. As of the date of this staff report, Planning Division Staff has not received correspondence regarding the proposed project.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:

The City of Pomona, as lead agency, has conducted an environmental review on the proposed project per the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Pursuant to the provisions of CEQA (Public Resources Code, Section 21084 et. seq.), the guidelines include a list of classes of projects which have been determined not to have a significant effect on the environment and which shall, therefore, be exempt from the provisions of CEQA. Staff has determined that this project is exempt from the CEQA pursuant to Article 19, Section 150301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) in that the project consists of the demolition and removal of individual small structures including one single-family residence and one multifamily residential structure. The proposed project described above hereby meets the guidelines for a Categorical Exemption, therefore no further environmental review is required.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

The draft Conditions of Approval are contained in the attached resolution, Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 2022-025.

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1: Draft HPC Resolution No. 2022-026
- 2: Historic Resources Inventory, 1993
- 3: Site Photographs
- 4: Public Hearing Notice

HPC RESOLUTION NO. 2022-026

**A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
OF THE CITY OF POMONA, CALIFORNIA APPROVING MAJOR
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA-018024-2022) TO
ALLOW FOR THE DEMOLITION OF PRE-1945 STRUCTURES
LOCATED AT 548 AND 554 W. CENTER STREET**

**THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF POMONA
DOES RESOLVE AS FOLLOWS:**

WHEREAS, the applicant, Ali Dashti, has submitted an application for Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-018024-2022) to allow for the demolition of a multifamily development located at 548 W. Center Street and one single family dwelling located at 554 W. Center Street (APN 8340-030-006 & 8340-030-012);

WHEREAS, available records indicate that the structure was constructed in approximately 1885 and 1895, respectively;

WHEREAS, the City of Pomona's Historic Resources Inventory, prepared in 1993 by Diane Marsh, identified the primary structure located on the subject property located at 548 W. Center Street as Italianate architecture and the subject property located at 554 W. Center Street as Folk Victorian;

WHEREAS, in accordance with Section .5809-13.F.8(b), all property owners directly adjacent to the site were notified of the application on August 5, 2022;

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission must make findings as described in Section .5809-13.F.8 of the Pomona Zoning Ordinance (PZO) to approve Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-018024-2021) for the demolition of any primary structure constructed before 1945;

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Pomona, has, after giving notice thereof as required by law, held a public hearing on September 7, 2022, concerning the requested Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-018024-2021); and

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission has carefully considered all pertinent testimony and the staff report offered in the case presented at the public hearing;

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT HEREBY RESOLVED by the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Pomona, California, as follows:

SECTION 1. Pursuant to the Guidelines for Implementation of the Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the proposed project meets the criteria for a Class 1, Section 15301 Categorical Exemption in that the project involves the demolition and removal of a single-family residence.

SECTION 2. Section .5809-13.F.6 of the PZO requires the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether the structure meets any of the criteria for designation as a local historic landmark before approving a Major Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of a pre-1945 structure. The Historic Preservation Commission hereby finds as follows:

1. *It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or natural history;*

The City of Pomona Historic Resources Inventory identified 548 W. Center Street as an Italianate structure and 554 W. Center Street as a Folk Victorian home. The structure has been altered to the point where some character defining features no longer exist. The structure does not exemplify or reflect special elements related to the City's history, according to research conducted through the City permits, directories and literature. Therefore the property does not meet this criterion.

2. *The property is identified with persons or events significant in local, state, or national history.*

Staff's research of City directories and literature did not indicate that the structures could be identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history. Therefore the property does not meet this criterion.

3. *The property embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship.*

The structure has been significantly altered and no longer embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction. The materials used in construction are not identified as indigenous materials and it is not a unique example of craftsmanship. Therefore the property does not meet this criterion.

4. *The property contributes to the significance of an historic area, being a geographically definable area possessing a concentration of historic or scenic properties or thematically related grouping of properties that contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by plan or physical development.*

The structure no longer possesses qualities that could contribute to the area. Though the surrounding and adjoining residential structures were built in same time period between 1880 and 1940, the subject properties and adjacent properties in the neighborhood are not within the boundaries of the nearby Center Street Potential Local Historic District which was listed as a potential historic district in the 1993 Historic Resources Survey, therefore it is not part of a geographically definable area possessing a concentration of historic or scenic properties. Therefore the property does not meet this criterion.

5. *The property is the work of a notable builder, designer, landscape designer, or architect.*

The subject structures were approximately built in 1885 and 1895 with no identifiable builder. Staff's research did not identify evidence of any involvement with a noted architect, builder, designer, or person with exemplary talents. Therefore the property does not meet this criterion.

6. *The property has a unique location or singular physical characteristics or is a view or vista representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the City of Pomona.*

The structure is located on West Center Street, a residential neighborhood of the City that lies in an urbanized area of the City. Due to urban development throughout the last few decades, the setting, feel, and character of the neighborhood has irreversibly changed and does not possess a familiar visual feature of a unified physical characteristic or a familiar visual feature. Therefore, the property does not have a unique established and familiar location or view and does not meet this criterion.

7. *The property embodies elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation.*

The structure no longer possesses significant architectural character, and does not possess any distinguishing details, craftsmanship, structural significance, or architectural innovation. Therefore the property does not meet this criterion.

8. *The property is similar to other distinctive properties, sites, areas, or objects based on a historic, cultural, or architectural motif.*

The subject structure has not been found to be similar to distinctive properties, sites, or areas in the City, based on an historic, cultural, or architectural motif. The structures have been identified as Italianate and Folk Victorian; however, they are not considered good examples due to their condition and they are not the last of their style. Therefore the property does not meet this criterion.

9. *The property reflects significant geographical patterns, including those associated with different eras of settlement and growth, particular transportation modes, or distinctive example of park or community planning.*

The subject structure does not reflect significant geographic patterns of settlement and growth as the neighborhood it is located in, is comprised of single-family structures mostly from the 1890s era. The site does not involve any structures associated with transportation, park or community planning. Therefore the property does not meet this criterion.

- 10. The property is one of the few remaining examples of the City of Pomona, region, state, or nation possessing distinguishing characteristics of an architectural or historical type of specimen.*

The structure no longer possesses an architectural style or characteristic that distinguishes it from others of its kind. Though there is not an abundance of examples of its architectural type in the City the subject structure is no longer considered a “prime example” of this architectural style. Therefore the property does not meet this criterion.

SECTION 3. The Historic Preservation Commission hereby approves the Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-018783-2021) to allow for the demolition of one structure with the following conditions:

1. This approval shall lapse and become void if the privileged authorized is not utilized through the issuance of a building permit for demolition and work has not commenced within one (1) year from the date of approval (September 7, 2022). The project is subject to a twenty (20) day appeal period. Written appeals may be filed with the City Clerk within twenty (20) days by the applicant or other interested person. The appeal shall be filed with the City Clerk within twenty (20) days from the date of action by the Planning Commission.
2. Before issuance of a building permit for demolition of the existing structure, the applicant is encouraged to take those steps, necessary to either (a) allow interested person or organizations a 30 day period for reasonable salvage opportunity or, (b) instruct the applicant’s demolition contractor to salvage, rather than destroy, those historic elements found within the house.
3. The applicant shall document the structure photographically and present a copy of the record to the Special Collections Division of the Pomona Public Library.

SECTION 4. The Secretary shall certify to the adoption of this Resolution and forward the original to the City Clerk.

APPROVED AND PASSED THIS 7TH DAY OF SEPTEMBER, 2022.

CHARA SWODECK
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON

ATTEST:

GEOFFREY STARNES, LEED AP BD+C
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION SECRETARY

STATE OF CALIFORNIA)
COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES)ss
CITY OF POMONA)

AYES:
NOES:
ABSTAIN:
ABSENT:

Pursuant to Resolution No. 76-258 of the City of Pomona, the time in which judicial review of this action must be sought is governed by California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.6.

CITY OF POMONA
Historic Resources Inventory
(Short Form - Exterior)

(1) Address: 548 W CENTER ST (2) Neighborhood: _____

(3) Property Category:

Single Family Residential	<u>X</u>	Multi-Family Residential	____#of Units____
Commercial	____	Industrial	____
Other	____		

(4) Architectural Style (see attached sheet): ITALIANATE

(5) Estimated Construction Date(s): 1885 (6) Condition of Structure GOOD

(7) Additions or Alterations: Major Moderate Few None

Description: PORCH + WINDOWS

(8) Other comments or observations: _____

(9) Rating: "C" "CM" "N" "NA" "R"

(10) Evaluator: D. MARSH
Date of Evaluation MAY 1993

- (Place Picture Here) -

CITY OF POMONA
Historic Resources Inventory
(Short Form - Exterior)

(1) Address: 554 W. CENTER ST (2) Neighborhood: _____

(3) Property Category:

Single Family Residential	<u>X</u>	Multi-Family Residential	_____#of Units_____
Commercial	_____	Industrial	_____
Other	_____		

(4) Architectural Style (see attached sheet): FOLK VICTORIAN

(5) Estimated Construction Date(s): 1895 (6) Condition of Structure GOOD

(7) Additions or Alterations: Major Moderate Few None

Description: WINDOW CHANGED SEVERAL YEARS AGO

(8) Other comments or observations: _____

(9) Rating: "C" "CM" "N" "NA" "R"

(10) Evaluator: D. MARSH
Date of Evaluation MAY 1993

- (Place Picture Here) -

548 W. Center Street





554 W. Center Street





CITY OF POMONA PLANNING DIVISION

NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING

This is not a citation (Esto no es una citación).

If you are receiving this notice, your property is located directly across or adjacent to the proposed project.

PROPOSED PROJECT

The Historic Preservation Commission will conduct a public hearing to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 18024-2022) associated with the proposed demolition of a six-unit multifamily structure and one single family residence, estimated to have been constructed in 1885 and 1895, respectively.

Applicant	Ali Dashti
Location	548 and 554 W. Center Street
Assessor's Parcel No(s).	8340-030-006 & 8340-030-012
Hearing Body	Planning Commission
Case File(s)	MAJCOA 18024-2022

Environmental Determination

The City of Pomona, as lead agency, has conducted an environmental review on the proposed project per the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Pursuant to the provisions of CEQA (Public Resources Code, Section 21084 et. seq.), the guidelines include a list of classes of projects which have been determined not to have a significant effect on the environment and which shall, therefore, be exempt from the provisions of CEQA. The Historic Preservation Commission will consider adopting a Categorical Exemption in compliance with Article 19, Section 150301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) in that the project consists of the demolition and removal of individual small structures including one single-family residence and one multifamily residential structure. The proposed project described above hereby meets the guidelines for a Categorical Exemption, therefore no further environmental review is required.

PUBLIC HEARING INFORMATION

Time & Date	Historic Preservation Commission Meeting, Wednesday, September 7, 2022, 6:30 p.m.
Location	City Council Chambers, 505 S. Garey, Pomona, CA 91766 (in-person meeting)
Questions	Alan Fortune, Assistant Planner Available to contact at (909) 620-2449 or at alan.fortune@pomonaca.gov

Written Comments: Written comments may be submitted to DevServicesComments@pomonaca.gov, by 5:30 p.m. the day of the hearing. Comments must be limited to 200 words. Please title your email "HPC Public Comment 9-7-22". Comments received via email will be made a part of the official record of the meeting.

The staff report on this matter will be available no later than September 1, 2022 on the City of Pomona website, which may be accessed at <https://pomona.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx> or by emailing the case planner, Alan Fortune.

PLEASE NOTE: If you challenge this matter in court, you may be limited to raising only those issues you or someone else raised at the public hearing described in this notice, or in written correspondence delivered to the City of Pomona, Planning Division at, or prior to, the public hearing.

Para Información en Español, llame (909) 620-2439.