



# Historic Preservation Commission

## Staff Report

June 07, 2023

<b>FILE NO:</b>	MAJCOA-020455-2023
<b>APPLICATION REQUEST:</b>	A request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-020455-2023) for the proposed demolition of one (1) single-family residence estimated to have been constructed in 1930.
<b>DATE SUBMITTED:</b>	January 05, 2023
<b>DEEMED COMPLETE:</b>	May 07, 2023
<b>ADDRESS:</b>	<b>1573 N. Orange Grove Ave.</b>
<b>APPLICANT:</b>	Kashe, Moe
<b>PROJECT PLANNER:</b>	Carlos Molina, Assistant Planner
<b>RECOMMENDATION:</b>	Approve File No. MAJCOA-020455-2023 and adopt Resolution No. 2023-007 (Attachment 1), approving the Certificate of Appropriateness.

---

### BACKGROUND:

According to the City of Pomona Historic Resources Inventory (1993), the building proposed for demolition was constructed circa 1930 in a period revival architectural style. The survey also designates the structure a rating of "NA" indicating that the building is non-contributing due to alterations.

### Guidelines for Evaluating Properties

In order to evaluate the properties for historic significance, staff utilized the guidance published by the National Park Service. Staff utilized the guidance in National Register Bulletins. That guidance includes:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Archaeological and Historic Preservation

National Register Bulletin 24: Guidelines for Local Surveys: A Basis for Preservation Planning

National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation

National Register Bulletin 16A: How to Complete the National Register Registration Form

National Register Bulletin 15: How to Complete the National Register Multiple Property Documentation Form

National Register Bulletin 39: Researching a Historic Property

## **Historic Research**

Planning, along with the Library staff, analyzed available building permits, Sanborn maps, City directories (1903-1951), Citywide Historic Resources Survey (1993), and the City of Pomona Historic Context Statement (2022).

- The subject parcel was not included as a recorded parcel within the available Sanborn maps which provided parcel data 1949 to 1959.
- City directories available through the City of Pomona Library from 1926-1951 produced results from 1927-1937. Consistent names associated with the site were Frank G Summers and Roy F Shields, who were identified as owners of the property at different times. Research into both names produced little information. Findings were limited to a Notice of Sale of Real Estate involving Roy Shields in 1930 and in regards to Frank G Summers, findings were limited to newspaper clippings pertaining to a birthday celebration and a robbery at the subject site.
- Available building permits spanned from 1930 – 2010. Notable permits include the original building permit for the home in 1930, the replacement of six windows in 2009, the demolition of a garage in 2009, and interior modification of walls in 2010. Miscellaneous permits include termite repair in 1944, electrical repairs in 2007, and additional plumbing repairs in 1959, 1971, etc. Research was conducted into John Ziegler, who was the owner listed in the 1930 building permit. Library research found newspaper clippings indicating Ziegler as a local builder and real estate agency owner who was responsible for the construction of homes primarily in northeast Pomona that would sell within the \$4,000-\$5,500 price range.
- Lastly, the 1993 Citywide Historic Resources Survey (Attachment 3) indicated the residential structure in question was constructed in 1930 in a period revival architecture style. However, given the limited presence of architectural features, staff is choosing to classify the style as a “vernacular bungalow”, which is defined by the absence of architectural details that would otherwise classify a structure as an example of any particular style.

## **Period of Significance**

According to the City of Pomona Historic Context Statement (2022), the date of construction of the subject, residence structure places the building construction within the significant period from 1920-1940 that saw three (3) primary historical themes. Those primary themes are: (1) growth and the automobile, (2) the Great Depression, and (3) population shifts.

### Growth of the Automobile

The population boom and growth of the automobile industry in southern California during the 1920s coalesced to make Pomona a hub for the automobile industry in the Pomona Valley. Most notably, the Federal Highway Act of 1921 jumpstarted access into the Pomona Valley through the creation of interconnected interstate highway systems. Pomona’s access to key transportation systems in a prime geographic location near to the coast and its developing harbors undoubtedly contributed to a major

growth of commercial, industrial, and civic development in the City such as the beginning of Pomona's comprehensive plan for the Los Angeles County Fairgrounds in 1928.

### The Great Depression

The stock market crash of 1929, which began the Great Depression undoubtedly, left its mark on the City of Pomona. The depression led to a halt in commercial development in Pomona and the Pomona Valley, famously known for its agricultural industry, also took an economic hit as national agricultural prices dropped by 65%. With unemployment at record numbers, the depression brought on forcible repatriations of Mexicans and Mexican-Americans into Mexico, which were replaced by white farmers fleeing the Dust Bowl of the Midwest.

### Population Shifts

By the start of the 1920s, the City of Pomona was a young and thriving city. From the time of Pomona's incorporation in 1888, the population was sitting at approximately 4,000 residents. However, with the booming agricultural industry across the region in the late 1800s, the city began to see rapid civic and public infrastructure advancements from the time of its incorporation. These advancements had grown the population to 10,000 residents by the year 1900 and by 1929; the City had become home to 25,000 residents. As the overall population of Pomona continued to grow during this period, the makeup of its ethnic communities began to exhibit notable shifts.

By 1920, the Chinese population had virtually disappeared and the Japanese community began to shift from predominantly male laborers to a small community of Japanese families. Despite the shift in the Japanese community, by 1939, the population was so small that the Japanese population was excluded from the *New World Sun Yearbook* which catalogued Japanese populations in cities across America. Census data from 1920 noted 28 mixed-race residents from several large families and in 1930, it was reported that there were eight black families in Pomona. During the same time, Pomona began to see growth in its Latino population, significant enough to spur the establishment of Spanish-language newspapers, political organizations, and baseball/softball leagues.

During this period, racialized inequities emerged, such "redlining" by real estate institutions and the federal government, which effectively created segregated communities. The subject site itself was included in the redlining maps instituted by the Federal Housing Authority; the site was given a grade of "C" which indicated the subject property and others with the same grade were considered to be in decline due to "an influx of Latino and African families". In conjunction with real estate agencies and mortgage lending companies, this practice led to a pattern of disinvestment and discrimination that reinforced systemic racism in the city. Additionally, Pomona was home to a local chapter of the Klu Klux Klan (KKK) during the 1920s on Thomas St. and had been documented in City Council documents as late as 1936.

### Eligibility Standards

In regards to eligibility for a designation as a historically significant parcel/structure, staff has determined that the site does not meet eligibility qualifications to be considered a historic site. The determination was informed by its vernacular architecture, significant modifications to the building,

lack of direct association with persons/events significant to the history of Pomona, and lack of direct association to any special pattern of development despite the property's ability to fit within the residential theme between 1920-1940. Residences that are eligible for an association with a trend or pattern of development from this period may be more appropriately evaluated as part of a historic district.

### **Historic Integrity**

As stated in the City of Pomona Historic Context Statement (2022), historic integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance and is defined as the "authenticity of a property's historic identity, evidenced by the survival of physical characteristics that existed during the property's historic period." The National Park Service defines seven aspects of integrity: location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association.

The subject site includes a primary residential dwelling built in 1930 identified as an example of the "vernacular bungalow" style as opposed to the "period revival" style indicated in the 1993 Historic Resources Inventory survey. As mentioned in *Preserving Pomona: The Pomona Guide to Historic Preservation*, vernacular bungalows were a common bungalow variation from 1900-1940 that were absent of architectural details that would otherwise categorize a bungalow in any particular style. Vernacular bungalows typically have a plain trim and wood clapboard siding, roofs could be either gabled or hipped, and include simple double or single-hung wood frame windows. As existing, materials commonly used during the period of construction are not present and exhibits evidence of modifications that negatively affect its historical integrity. Therefore, the structure does not include any features that can sufficiently convey its historic identity.

### **EVALUATION – 1573 N. ORANGE GROVE AVENUE:**

According to the City of Pomona Historic Resources Survey (1993) and the original building permit for the primary structure (1930), the site was developed with a single-family residence and a detached garage in 1930. As existing, the structure under review does not exemplify any key massing or architectural features eluding to any distinct style (revival or otherwise). Available images do show the presence of multi-paned windows which are common of the time period of construction, but no other features were found to be present in the past or present.

### **Theme**

Staff reviewed the Citywide Historic Context Statement and determined that Expansion, Growth, and Depression (1920-1940): Residential Development Theme from the Citywide Historic Context Statement is applicable to this property.

### **Location**

The geographical location for the residential theme from 1920-1940 is considered to citywide. The subject property is located northeast of historic downtown and nearest to the major intersection. N. Garey Avenue and N. Orange Grove Avenue. Based on the location parameter of the theme, the subject site does fit into this theme.

## **Designation Criteria**

Staff examined the designation criteria listed in the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance and followed any eligibility standard or registration requirement in the applicable theme in the Citywide Historic Context Statement.

**Criterion 1:** *It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or natural history;*

Based on the history found for the property, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

- There is no evidence that this property was the site of an event important in history; or that the property is significant enough to exemplify an important trend or pattern of development; or was a remnant feature representing early built resources from the period.
- The property and subject structure were not found to be a remaining example of early residential development in Pomona given its location and approximate period of construction.

**Criterion 2:** *It is identified with persons or events significant in local, state, or national history;*

Based on the history found for the property and contained in the staff report, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

- There is no evidence creating an association with persons significant in our past, including early pioneers in the history of Pomona; or a proven association with a specific significant ethnic or cultural group that made a demonstrable impact on the early community.

**Criterion 3:** *It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;*

Based on the architecture of the property and the history found for the property, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

- The structure fits the "vernacular bungalow" style common from 1900-1940, which by definition were not designed to include significant details capable of demonstrating a particular style of architecture.
- The subject structure has been significantly altered and in its current condition is not a good or rare example of any notable architectural style, property type, or method of construction.

**Criterion 4:** *It contributes to the significance of an historic area, being a geographically definable area possessing a concentration of historic or scenic properties or thematically related grouping of properties which contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by plan or physical*

*development;*

Based on the history in the historic context, staff reviewed the criteria and determined the following:

- The location of this property is not located within a potential historic area as identified in the potential historic properties map reviewed by the Historic Preservation Commission on March 1, 2023 (Attachment 4).

**Criterion 5:** *It is the work of a notable builder, designer, landscape designer or architect;*

Based on the architecture of the property and the history found for the property, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

- The subject structure was identified to be associated with a local builder of the time, although additional research did not produce information capable of designating the builder as a notable historical figure. Therefore, there is no evidence that this property is a distinctive work by a noted architect, landscape architect, builder, or designer.

**Criterion 6:** *It has a unique location or singular physical characteristics or is a view or vista representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the city of Pomona;*

Based on the history in the historic context and the location of the property, staff reviewed the criteria and determined the following:

- There is no evidence that the location of this property is unique or has singular physical characteristics.
- It is not a view or vista representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the city of Pomona.

**Criterion 7:** *It embodies elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation;*

Based on the architecture of the property and the history found for the property, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

- Due to alterations and the dwelling's vernacular architecture, the subject structure does not contain any original elements of a distinctive architectural style, details, materials, or artisanship. Therefore, the structure does not represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation.

**Criterion 8:** *It is similar to other distinctive properties, sites, areas, or objects based on an historic, cultural, or architectural motif;*

Based on the architecture of the property and the history found for the property, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

- The existing subject structure does not contain any significant architectural elements reminiscent of notable architectural styles commonly utilized during the time of construction.

**Criterion 9:** *It reflects significant geographical patterns, including those associated with different eras of settlement and growth, particular transportation modes, or distinctive examples of park or community planning;*

Based on the history found for the property, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

- There is no evidence that this property was the site of an event important in history; or that the property exemplified an important trend or pattern of development at the time of construction; or was a remnant feature representing early built resources from the period.

**Criterion 10:** *It is one of the few remaining examples in the city of Pomona, region, state, or nation possessing distinguishing characteristics of an architectural or historical type or specimen.*

Based on the history found for the property, staff reviewed it to the eligibility standards and determined the following:

- The subject structure is not characterized as one of the few remaining examples of early residential development in Pomona as it does not include any element(s) that may be a rare, remaining example of some of the city's earliest residential developments.

### **Determination**

The property does not meet the City's designation criteria for designation, and therefore, lacks the historic significance to be designated as a local historic landmark, or as a contributor to a potential historic district. Based on this evaluation, Staff has determined that the property is not historic.

### **CONCLUSION:**

Staff has determined that the property and structure in question does not meet the designation criteria requirements to be designated as a local historic landmark, or as a contributor to a potential historic district. Therefore, staff recommends approving the Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the single-family residence and the associated accessory structures provided in the application addressed as 1573 N. Orange Grove Avenue.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

1. Draft Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 2023-007
2. Photograph Exhibit
3. Historic Resources Inventory (1993)
4. Potential Historic Properties Map (2023)
5. Proof of Noticing