



Historic Preservation Commission

Staff Report

June 7, 2023

FILE NO:	MAJCOA-020613-2023
APPLICATION REQUEST:	Major Certificate of Appropriateness for a new 228 square foot addition to the existing detached garage that is being converted into an accessory dwelling unit (ADU) and for the removal of a diseased citrus tree at the rear of a contributing resource within the Wilton Heights Historic District.
DATE SUBMITTED:	January 25, 2023
DEEMED COMPLETE:	May 5, 2023
ADDRESS:	355 Chester Place
APPLICANT:	Omar & Nayeli Barbosa
PROJECT PLANNER:	Alan Fortune, Assistant Planner
ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:	This project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historic resource Restoration/Rehabilitation) of the California CEQA Guidelines as the project consists of minor alterations to an existing structure and is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.
RECOMMENDATION:	Approve Major Certificate of Appropriateness MAJCOA-020613-2023 and adopt Resolution No. 23-008.

BACKGROUND:

The contributing resource located at 355 Chester Place consists of a single family residence estimated to have been constructed in 1921. The surveys that evaluated this property identified the structure as

Craftsman Bungalow architecture and give the resource a "Contributing" rating with minimal alterations made to the building and the house remaining relatively unaltered (Attachment 2). The survey identifies the integrity of the house to be good and the condition of the building as being good to excellent. The property was included as a contributing resource with the adoption of the Wilton Heights Historic District in 1999. Site photographs have been provided for Commission review (Attachment 3).

On January 25, 2023, Planning Staff received an application for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 20613-2023) for a new 228 square foot addition to the existing detached garage that is being converted into an accessory dwelling unit. Project plans have been attached for Commission consideration (Attachment 4).

Based on the two historic resource surveys and staff visits to the site, the condition of the structure is good with no major alterations or additions having been made since the estimated time of construction in 1921. The structure also retains all of its character defining features. The proposed project consists of the addition to the detached garage at the rear of the property into an accessory dwelling unit (ADU). The street facing façade of the detached garage is proposed to retain its visual appearance as a garage with the faux garage doors to replace the existing garage doors with the same size and location. The proposed addition will match the architectural style of the home and incorporate several character defining features. All features on the primary resource will remain intact as the primary structure is not a part of this proposed project.

Two trees are proposed for removal in association with this project as they are located within the area of the proposed addition. These include a peach tree (*Prunus persica*) that is not protected due to its size. It has a Diameter at Breast Height (DBM) of approximately 2", which is less than the protection size threshold of 10" DBM for this species. The other tree is an orange tree (*Citrus sinensis*) with a DBM of approximately 14"; this exceeds the protection size threshold of 10" DBM for this species and is therefore protected. Observations by Planning Staff and the Parks and Landscapes Supervisor found that the subject tree is in serious decline (site pictures attached). Because this tree is protected, a condition of approval requiring the replacement of the tree has been included in the resolution.

CHARACTER-DEFINING FEATURES:

The primary structure is a one-story, single-family residence of Craftsman Bungalow style. The character defining features present on this Craftsman Bungalow structure include:

1. Exterior clapboard wood siding
2. Roof features such as the moderately pitched cross-gabled roofs, overhanging eaves with exposed rafters, and vertical wood vents within the gables
3. Fixed and double-hung windows surrounded by wood trim
4. Tapered wood piers and flared fieldstone pier supports
5. Fieldstone porch railing

DISCUSSION OF EXISTING CONDITIONS

1. Site Design/Building Layout: The subject site consists of one single-family residential unit and one detached garage. The detached garage is located near the west property line to the rear of the primary structure. The proposed addition will be at the rear of the existing detached garage, will not be particularly visible from the street, and meets development standards of ADU Urgency Ordinance No. 4324.
2. Architecture: Based on the features of the subject residence observed by Staff and in the two recorded surveys, the existing primary structure is of Craftsman Bungalow architecture and style according to the Historic Architecture Guidelines approved by the Historic Preservation Commission. The detached garage was constructed at a similar time as the primary residence and has a similar architectural style. The proposed addition will be at the rear of the existing garage and will not be visible from the street; additionally, the street facing façade of the garage is proposed to continue appearing as a garage to limit visual impact of the ADU on the street or neighboring properties.
3. Roof: Among the character defining features present on this home is the moderately pitched, cross gabled roof with composite roof shingles as well as the open overhanging eaves with exposed rafters and vertical wood vents within the gables. The proposed ADU to the rear is proposed to match and complement the roof and architecture of the primary structure by incorporating a similar roof pitch, roof material, style of exposed rafters and wood vents within the gables.

DESIGN REVIEW:

The Historic Preservation Ordinance provides that the Commission is guided by the following areas in addition to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Staff has reviewed the project as it relates to these standards as well as any applicable design guidelines. Staff's analysis is below:

1. Height. *The height of any proposed construction shall be compatible with the height and bulk of surrounding structures and in conformance with the maximum allowable height for the applicable zoning district.*

The proposed addition will be slightly shorter than the height of the existing structure. The existing detached garage stands at 15'-6" while its addition will be at 12'-10". This height difference is minimal and will be compatible with the existing height of the detached structure. The addition will create a new roof gable similar to the existing roof style of the primary home. The ADU will have a similar roof pitch and eave style to be compatible with the primary structure. Therefore, the project meets this criterion.

2. Proportions of Windows and Doors. *The proportions and relationships between doors and windows shall be compatible with the architectural style and character of the surrounding structures, and be of an appropriate material.*

The windows proposed on the accessory dwelling unit will match the style and material of those on

the existing home. The windows are proposed to be wooden and either single-hung or double-hung and will be of similar dimensions and opening directions. The proposed windows and doors will be Craftsman in style. The existing garage door facing Chester Place will be replaced with a faux door to retain the appearance of a street facing garage. Therefore, the project meets this criterion.

3. Relationship of Building Masses and Spaces. *The resulting relationships between proposed structures and created spaces, or between remodeled structures and created spaces, shall be consistent with the shapes and setbacks of existing adjacent structures.*

The volume of the addition to the garage (future ADU) will be relatively smaller than the existing detached garage as it will have larger setbacks than the existing detached structure to be in compliance with current applicable development standards with the R-1-7,200 Zoning District of the Pomona Zoning Ordinance as well as ADU Urgency Ordinance No. 4324. The ADU addition will provide a four foot side and rear yard. This proposed construction will be compatible with the existing primary structure and the existing portion of the ADU, as well as with the surrounding structures on neighboring properties. Therefore, the project meets this criterion.

4. Roof Shape. *The designs of the roof shall be compatible with the architectural character and style of the surrounding structures. Gables, turrets, and other roof forms shall be incorporated when appropriate to accomplish design compatibility with adjacent structures.*

The addition will create new roof gables and have a roof pitch of 5:12, to match the roof pitch of the primary home. The roof will be composed of a similar composition shingle and have a similar eave style and exposed rafters, a character defining feature of the Craftsman architecture of the primary home. The roof pitch of the existing garage is 7:12 and is proposed to remain the same. Therefore, the project meets this criterion.

5. Scale. *The scale of the structure shall be compatible with the architectural character and style of the existing buildings. The new building shall blend in with surrounding buildings through the sensitive use of proper scale and materials.*

The proposed project will continue the Craftsman Bungalow architecture of the existing home to be compatible with the rest of the historic resource as well as be compatible with the style and period of the neighborhood. Therefore, the project meets this criterion.

6. Directional Expression/Facades. *Facades in an historic district shall blend in with other structures with regard to directional expression. Structures in an historic district shall be compatible with the dominant horizontal and vertical expression of surrounding structures.*

The Craftsman Bungalow style of the existing house will be matched by the proposed accessory dwelling unit. The proposed ADU will have a matching siding material with that of the existing home. The project will have new wood clapboard siding with a three (3) inch exposure to match the existing. The additional roof will have a similar pitch (5:12) with exposed rafters to match the existing home. The existing roof will retain its 7:12 pitch but will have similar exposed rafters. Therefore, the project meets this criterion.

7. Architectural Details. *Architectural details, including materials and textures shall be treated so as to make any new construction compatible with the architectural style and character of the historic district.*

The proposed addition will match all architectural details including siding material and exposure, roof pitch and material, and character-defining eave style with exposed rafters. The roof pitch of the existing portion of the garage will retain its 7:12 roof pitch. The entire ADU, including existing portions, will have a siding material and style to match that of the existing home. The porch/entrance to the ADU will have a wood column atop a tapered stone base to match the character defining columns of the primary home. All new construction will be compatible with the architectural style and character of the home and the historic district. Therefore, the project meets this criterion.

8. Architectural Rhythm and Articulation. *All proposed structures or facade remodeling shall show sufficient and rhythmic repetition of architectural details so as to be compatible with the facade articulation of existing adjacent buildings.*

All new construction will be compatible with the architectural style and character of the home and the surrounding adjacent buildings. The accessory dwelling unit will have the same siding material and style with that of the existing home and have the same siding exposure. The roof pitch of the existing garage is 7:12 and is proposed to remain the same while the roof pitch of the additions are to have 5:12 pitch to match the roof of the primary home. In addition to the roof pitch, features such the exposed rafters will be incorporated to match. Therefore, the project meets this criterion.

9. New Additions/Construction. *New additions and adjacent related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

The addition will not be altering the primary structure. The addition to the existing detached garage will have different setbacks from the existing garage to differentiate new construction from the existing structure and to meet ADU development standards. The detached structure will be re-sided to replace the existing vertical siding with horizontal siding that will bring the structure closer to Craftsman Bungalow architecture and match the style of the primary home. The roof pitch of the existing garage is 7:12 and is proposed to remain the same while the roof pitch of the additions are to have 5:12 pitch to match the roof of the primary home. If the addition of the detached structure is removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property will be unimpaired. Therefore, the project meets this criterion.

10. Mechanical Equipment. *All exterior mechanical equipment shall be screened from view with appropriately designed screens, parapet walls, landscaping or any other form of screening which the commission or the planning and development services manager may deem acceptable. The design, style, color and texture of the required screening method shall be compatible with the existing or proposed building/facade design.*

The proposed project is not proposing any mechanical equipment. Any required new roof venting will be low profile to be the least visually impactful. Therefore, the project meets this criterion.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

The Historic Preservation Ordinance provide that the Commission be guided by the latest Rehabilitation Standards contained in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. Staff reviewed the project for compliance with the applicable standards below:

1. *A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.*

The existing garage will be expanded and converted into an accessory dwelling unit that will be approximately 601 square feet. The addition to the detached structure will match in architecture to the primary home while the street facing façade of the garage will have minimal change so that its appearance as a garage can be kept. The vertical siding of the existing accessory structure will be removed and replaced with horizontal wood or clapboard siding to match style, material, and exposure of the siding on the primary home. The proposed use of the primary dwelling unit will not change.

2. *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

The Craftsman Bungalow historic character of the contributing resource will be retained and preserved. A number of character defining features will be incorporated into the design of the accessory dwelling unit, such has the exposed raters, horizontal wood siding, single-hung or double-hung windows, and tapered wood column atop a tapered stone base. Distinctive characteristics, such as the garage door facing Chester Place and the 7:12 roof pitch of the existing structure, will be retained and preserved.

3. *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

The proposed addition does not create a false sense of historical development as the new accessory dwelling unit will be in Craftsman Bungalow style that is compatible and matching with the style of the existing home and the appearance of the garage facing the street will be retained. The vertical siding on the existing garage will be replaced with a horizontal siding material to match the style of the primary home and be better compatible with Craftsman Bungalow style architecture. Features or elements from other historic properties or styles are not proposed.

4. *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

Does not apply. There are no changes on the property that have acquired historic significance in their

own right.

5. *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

All distinctive woodworking and craftsmanship present on the home will be preserved and distinctive materials have been retained. The new accessory dwelling unit will incorporate similar design elements to match. Therefore, the project meets this standard.

6. *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

Does not apply. No existing features garage are proposed to be removed.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

Does not apply. No damaging treatments are proposed.

8. *Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

Does not apply. The proposed project will not impact any potential archaeological resources.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The proposed alteration will be compatible with the architectural style of the existing home in that it incorporates design elements and features to match. The addition will be differentiated from the old existing structure in that it will have different setbacks from the side and rear property lines, as required by current development standards of the Pomona Zoning Ordinance as well as ADU Urgency Ordinance No. 4324, and the roof pitch will be lowered to match the house instead of the existing garage roof pitch. Therefore, the project meets this standard.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The addition to the existing detached structure will have different setbacks from the existing garage to differentiate new construction from the existing structure and to meet ADU development standards. The detached structure will be re-sided to replace the existing vertical siding with horizontal siding that will bring the structure closer to Craftsman Bungalow architecture and match the style of the primary home. The roof pitch of the existing garage is 7:12 and is proposed to remain the same while the roof pitch of the additions are to have 5:12 pitch to match the roof of the primary home. If the addition of the detached structure is removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property will be unimpaired. Therefore, the project meets this standard.

REQUIRED FINDINGS:

The findings required in Section .589-13(F)(6) of the Pomona Zoning Ordinance for a Certificate of Appropriateness are included in the attached resolution (Attachment 1).

CONCLUSION:

The proposed addition to the garage is compatible with the architectural style and period of the existing home and the existing adjacent contributing homes in the immediate neighborhood. All of the defining features of the character of the primary structure character will remain unchanged as the project is limited to the detached garage in the rear. The addition to the garage will not be visible from the street and will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historical resource. Staff has conditioned that all the features of the accessory dwelling unit will match the features of the house. Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the major certificate of appropriateness (MAJCOA 20613-2023) and adopt draft Resolution No. 23-008.

PUBLIC NOTICING:

On May 25, 2023, a public hearing notice was mailed to the applicant and to all owners of properties located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject sites (Attachment 5). As of the date of this staff report, Planning Division Staff has not received correspondence regarding the proposed project.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:

Staff has determined that this project is exempt for the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historic Rehabilitation)

of the California CEQA Guidelines as the project is a minor alteration to an existing structure and is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. Therefore no further environmental review is required.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

The Conditions of Approval are contained in the attached resolution (Attachment 1).

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Draft Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 23-008
2. Wilton Heights Historic District Survey Form
3. Site Photographs
4. Project Plans
5. Notice of Public Hearing