



CITY OF POMONA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION

COMMISSION REPORT

DATE: MARCH 1, 2017

TO: HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

FROM: PLANNING DIVISION

SUBJECT: MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 5720-2016)
TO ALLOW ADA ACCESSIBILITY IMPROVEMENTS TO LINCOLN PARK
AND SURROUNDING STREET INTERSECTIONS INCLUDING THE
INSTALLATION OF LANDSCAPED STREET CROSSING BULB-OUTS,
MEDIANS, ADA ACCESSIBLE RAMPS, NEW CROSSWALKS, AND
DECOMPOSED GRANITE PATHS AND PICNIC AREAS.

SUMMARY

Issue – Should the Historic Preservation Commission approve Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 5720-2016) to allow ADA accessibility improvements including the installation of landscaped street crossing bulb-outs, medians, ADA accessible ramps, new crosswalks, four street lamps, and decomposed granite paths in Lincoln Park and street intersections surrounding Lincoln Park?

Recommendation – Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 5720-2016), subject to conditions.

Applicable Codes and Guidelines –

- 1) Historic Preservation Design Guidelines dated July 19, 1999
- 2) Zoning Ordinance Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation) adopted June 15, 1998
- 3) Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties

Public Noticing Requirements – At a minimum of ten (10) days prior to the public hearing, notice was sent to the applicant, posted at the subject site, and delivered to all owners of property located within 1,000 feet from the subject site.

City Initiated Corrective Action – None.

Environmental Determination – Pursuant to the Guidelines for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the installation of ADA accessibility improvements in and around Lincoln Park meets the criteria for a Class 4 Categorical Exemption, Section 15304 – Minor Alterations to Land which exempts minor public or private alterations in the condition of land, water, and/or vegetation which do not involve the removal of

healthy, mature, scenic trees. The Historic Preservation Commission finds that the proposed project will not have a significant effect on the environment.

BACKGROUND

On November 2, 2016 the Historic Preservation Commission held a public hearing to consider approval of the proposed project. During their deliberations, commissioners requested more detailed plans and photo simulations and selected materials for use within proposed street medians and curb extension bulb-outs. Those requests were reaffirmed by the testimony from members within the public who also requested more details of proposed improvements and alternate landscaping materials for the street median and curb extension bulb-outs.

The Commission requested that Public Works Department staff hold an additional community meeting, confirm the details of the project, provide an accurate design and revised renderings of the project. As requested, another community meeting was held on December 10, 2016 and based on feedback received at that meeting and the prior public hearing, the project was revised and updated.

On February 1, 2017 the Historic Preservation Commission held a second public hearing to review the revised presentation and plans, and consider approval of the proposed project. During their deliberations, commissioners decided to continue the item to the March Historic Preservation Commission meeting to allow newly elected Commissioners additional time to review the proposed plans and instructed staff to prepare alternative designs to address ADA improvements at each intersection, including a proposal that does not contain bulb-outs; provide information regarding the consultant's qualifications and a listing of projects carried out in other jurisdictions; provide data from the Active Transportation Plan (ATP) regarding ADA improvements to City intersections; and provide a listing of similar and/or historic matters from other jurisdictions.

The attached presentation (Attachment 4) and project plans (Attachment 5) has been further revised and updated to address the February 1, 2017 Historic Preservation Commission comments.

Property Description & Background

Lincoln Park is located in the Lincoln Park Historic District and is built as a bulb shaped park bounded by Palomares Street and Como Drive (Attachment 2). Due to its current physical configuration, ADA accessibility and circulation is deficient. In response to recent litigation regarding insufficient ADA accessibility at various City owned properties, the Public Works Department of the City of Pomona is proposing a project within and around Lincoln Park to improve circulation and access. A preliminary traffic study was completed and community meetings were held on July 12, 2016 and December 10, 2016. The information received from the community meetings and traffic study was used to propose the improvements as described below and shown on attached plans:

Planned improvements related to traffic calming and control measures include:

- Installation of pedestrian bulb-outs at intersection pedestrian crossings (recommended at 3 intersections; however, only at one intersection for Potential Alternate #1, and at no intersections for Potential Alternate #2);
- Installation of landscaped medians (recommended in two locations; however, only at one location with Potential Alternates #1 & #2);
- Improved crosswalks and advance signage;
- ADA improvements and limited related pavement rehabilitation;
- Limited related landscape and irrigation work within the park.

Planned improvements for the circulation of pedestrian and bicyclists inside the park include:

- Installation of a pedestrian walkway within the perimeter of the park;
- Installation of ADA accessible ramps at entrances to the park from surrounding streets and/intersections (reduced with Potential Alternates #1 & #2);
- Rehabilitated and/or new landscape areas adjacent to improvements (limited for Potential Alternate #1 and essentially none for Potential Alternate #2).

In addition, repairs to the existing concrete picnic/plaza area, located at the northwest corner of the park are also proposed in order to enhance ADA accessibility and protect the health of an existing Oak tree planted in the center of the picnic/plaza area. Improvements to the picnic/plaza area include:

- Replacement of the existing concrete picnic area with decomposed granite (DG) (or pervious concrete as an alternate);
- Installation of a new ADA accessible access ramp;
- Repair of a missing portion of the existing the existing concrete wall surrounding the base of the existing Oak tree;
- Installation of a new ADA accessible picnic table, and height adjustments to the existing BBQ grill.

ANALYSIS

Section .5809-13 of the Zoning requires that proposed projects involving historic properties be consistent with the standards contained in that section and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The project is also analyzed for consistency with the City's Design Guidelines for historic preservation.

Consistency with Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation) of the Zoning Ordinance Standards:

Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Ordinance requires that major COA projects be guided by design standards that include a requirement that architectural details be treated so as to make new construction compatible with material and textures of the architectural style and character of the historic district. In this case, the materials and textures of the Lincoln Park historic district were reviewed and similar types are proposed as part of the Lincoln Park project.

Landscape areas with bulb-outs will have landscaping treatment consistent with each adjacent property owner's landscaping instead of a single treatment throughout (conditioned on property owners granting rights-of-entry, otherwise the original boulders, cobbles, and river rock will be used), walkways within the park, and the plaza area will have brown/beige decomposed granite (DG) to match the existing walkways within the park. All of these materials will have similar colors to match the existing surrounding character of the park and the surrounding neighborhood. Furthermore, improvements made to the existing picnic/plaza area will include the reconstruction of a missing portion of an existing planter wall, which will utilize materials to match the existing and replacement of concrete paving with DG in order to protect an Oak tree planted in the center of the plaza/picnic area (and for efficiency of continued maintenance).

Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's (SOI) Standards:

The proposed project to improve ADA accessibility to Lincoln Park and surrounding street intersections is consistent with the following SOI standards:

"The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided. Standard #2"

"Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence. Standard #6"

The Public Works Department is proposing these improvements in order to provide ADA access and pedestrian safety. Replacement of the existing concrete picnic/plaza area with DG is proposed because it mitigates possible damage to the Oak tree and roots and for efficiency of continued maintenance). The existing concrete wall for the tree well is proposed to be reconstructed in areas where it is missing. Existing steps at the southerly area of the park will remain as a historic feature. The existing steps and walkway will join to the new walkway that is being proposed around the park. Improvements to the surrounding street intersections will be carried out by using materials and designs that are consistent with the surrounding neighborhood.

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines:

The "Ideal Preservation Approach" in the Design Guidelines recommends that driveway and walkway alterations involving replacement, "keep material, surface finish and design details as close to the original as possible." Since the landscape materials such as the bulb-outs will have landscaping treatment consistent with each adjacent property owner's landscaping instead of a single treatment throughout (conditioned on property owners granting rights-of-entry, otherwise the original boulders, cobbles, and river rock will be used), walkways within the park and the plaza area will have brown/beige decomposed granite (DG) to match the existing walkways within the park, and the picnic/plaza area concrete wall, as conditioned, will be similar to the original, the proposed project will be consistent with the design guidelines.

Response to Commission and Public Concerns and Comments:

As requested by the Commission at the November 2, 2016 hearing, another community meeting was held on December 10, 2016. Notices were sent to adjacent residents of Lincoln Park, attendees from the November hearing, and the two local historic groups. Public Works Staff and the consultants working on the project were present at the meeting. The community meeting began with discussing each of the items that were brought up at the Historical Preservation Committee meeting and how they were being addressed. Many of these comments were related to the recommended cobblestone landscaping treatment for the bulb-out areas and street medians. In response to these comments, various alternates were presented at the community meeting, including brick, turf, drought tolerant plantings, and a concrete mosaic.

Renderings for each of the alternative material treatments and enlargements of civil plan areas were provided for the intersections of: Palomares St/Lincoln Avenue/Como Drive, Jefferson Avenue/Como Drive, Palomares Street/Jefferson Avenue/Como Drive, and Palomares Street/Lincoln Avenue. A revised rendering for the plaza/patio area showing a close-up of the seating wall using existing materials for repair was presented as well. Another item that was brought up was the location of the decomposed granite (DG) pathway shown in relationship to existing trees. The updated site layout plan showing the revised pathway, bulb-out/intersections, street lights, and related work was also presented and provided to residents.

After discussing and responding to the various comments, each intersection was walked and reviewed on-site with the corresponding close-up plan. At the end of the meeting Staff was given direction to ensure that the landscaping treatment at each of the bulb-out areas should be consistent with each adjacent property owner's landscaping instead of a single treatment used for each. Furthermore, Staff was given direction to use reclaimed brick to pave the two proposed medians at the Palomares/Lincoln and Jefferson/Como Intersections.

Based on the feedback received from the two community meetings and the HPC hearing, project plans have revised as shown in the attached presentation (Attachment 5) and project plans (Attachment 6).

As requested by the Commission at the February 1, 2017 hearing, additional time has been allotted to allow the Commissioners time to review the project. The attached presentation has been updated to provide two potential alternatives for the project, additional Consultant staff intend to appear at the March 1, 2017 meeting, information has been added to show how the proposed plans comply with the City's Active Transportation Plan requirements, and potential similar and/or historic projects from other jurisdictions are now also included in the attached presentation.

CONCLUSION

The proposed project meets the requirements of the, standards contained in Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Code, the SOI standards for rehabilitation and Design Guidelines. The proposed ADA improvements and repairs to the picnic/plaza area of Lincoln Park and surrounding street intersections will be similar in that the materials will closely match the color and texture of the

existing character of the historic district. As conditioned, the proposed project will be consistent with the requirements of Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Code.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 5720-2016) subject to conditions.

Respectfully submitted,



Brad Johnson
Development Services Manager

Prepared by,



Leonard Bechet
Associate Planner

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Draft HPC Resolution
2. Vicinity Map and Aerial Photograph
3. Major Certificate of Appropriateness Application
4. Presentation of Proposed Improvements to Lincoln Park and Surrounding Street Intersections
5. Project Plans
6. Information on Project Consultant (Stantec)