



# CITY OF POMONA

## HISTORIC PRESERVATION

## COMMISSION

---

**DATE:** April 4, 2018

**TO:** HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

**FROM:** PLANNING DIVISION

**SUBJECT:** MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA-8223-2017) TO ALLOW THE DEMOLITION OF AN EXISTING 200 SQAURE FOOT GARAGE AS WELL AS THE CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW 504 SQUARE FOOT GARAGE AND A 510 SQUARE FOOT ADDITION TO AN EXISTING SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE LOCATED AT 1207 WISCONSIN STREET.

### SUMMARY

**Issue** – Should the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-8223-2017) to allow the demolition of an existing 200 square foot garage, construction of a new 504 square foot garage, and a 510 square foot addition to an existing single family residence located at 1207 Wisconsin Street?

**Recommendation** – Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached draft resolution to approve Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-8223-2017).

**Applicable Codes** – Zoning Ordinance Section .5809-13—Historic Preservation; Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties; Historic Preservation Design Guidelines dated July 19, 1999.

**Public Noticing Requirements** – At a minimum of ten (10) days prior to the public hearing, notice was sent to the applicant, posted at the subject site, and mailed to all owners of property located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject site.

**City Initiated Corrective Action** – None.

**Environmental Determination** – Categorical Exemption, Section 15303 – New construction or conversion of small structures.

## BACKGROUND

The subject property totals 5,940 square feet, is zoned R-1-7,200 Single-family Residential and is located in the the Wilton Heights Historic District. According to county assessor records, the property was first developed in 1924 with a single story, 952 square foot single-family residence. There is also an existing, detached single-car garage located in the rear half of the property.

A historical survey of the property was conducted in February of 1993 by Diane Marsh. At that time the single-family residence was identified as having a rating of “NA” – non-contributing due to age, condition, or non-distinctive architecture and “R” – potentially-recoverable building, could be changed to contributing if appropriately rehabilitated.

A second historic survey was conducted in April of 2005 by staffer Katie Horak. The survey identifies the property as a “contributor to a district that is listed or designated locally” and includes the following detailed description of the property:

*This building is a one story, Craftsman single family residence constructed in 1924. It has a rectangular floor plan and the east facing facade is asymmetrical. The foundation is concrete. The building has a wood framed structural system. The exterior is clad in stucco. It is covered by a moderately pitched cross gabled roof made of composition shingles. It has boxed, overhanging, eaves with exposed rafters. The single family residence has one chimney located on the north elevation. Decorative elements of this single family residence includes river rock at the base of the porch.*

*There are two windows on the facade. They are symmetrically spaced and consist of a squared fixed picture window with two narrow wood sash, double hung windows on either side. Windows on the other elevations are wood sash double hung. The main entry is located under the porch of the east elevation and consists of a iron security door.*

*The building fronts onto Wisconsin Street and is set behind a lawn that extends out to the sidewalk level. Landscaping elements include small shrubs and hanging plants. There is a concrete driveway that runs along the north side of the building, and a concrete pedestrian pathway that leads from the sidewalk to the front entrance. There appears to be a one car garage on the northwest end of the property.*

*Alterations include the removal of the original horizontal wood clapboard siding with stucco. The condition of the building good. The integrity is fair to good.*

*This Craftsman single family's character defining features include:*

- *Moderately pitched roof with wide overhanging eaves*
- *River rock on porch*

## Proposed Project

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness for the following scope of work:

1. Demolish the existing 200 square foot garage.
2. Construct a new 504 square foot garage.
3. Construct a new 510 square foot addition to the existing single-family structure.

The proposed addition and garage will match the color, style, and architecture of the existing dwelling, utilizing compatible materials.

## **ANALYSIS**

Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Ordinance requires that proposed projects involving historic properties be consistent with the standards contained in that section and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The project is also analyzed for consistency with the City's Design Guidelines for historic preservation.

### **Consistency with Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation) of the Zoning Ordinance Standards:**

Section .5809-13 requires that all projects approved under a Certificate of Appropriateness be reviewed for consistency with the standards contained in the code. The standards include reviewing the proposed project for compatibility with the adjacent historic buildings in terms of height, windows and doors, massing and spaces, roof shape, scale, architectural details, and architectural rhythm. The design of the addition and detached garage are compatible with the Craftsman architectural design of the single-family residence given that the windows, garage door and roof details will resemble the existing single-family residence. The height and pitch of the roof over the addition and detached garage is consistent with the roof of the existing single-family residence. Architectural details that match those on the existing single-family residence include river rock, decorative vertical slat gable vents, wood sash and double hung windows, exposed rafters and overhanging eaves. Therefore, the proposed addition and detached garage are consistent with the standards contained in Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Ordinance.

### **Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's (SOI) Standards**

The Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties contain two standards that are directly related to additions and new construction. The standards are as follows:

*New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The proposed project includes an addition and new detached garage. The design of the room addition and detached garage are compatible with the Craftsman architectural design of the single-family residence given that the massing, windows, and roof details will resemble the existing single-family residence. The height and pitch of the roof over the addition and detached garage is consistent with the roof of the single-family residence. Architectural details that match those on the single-family residence include river rock, decorative vertical

slat gable vents, wood sash and double hung windows, exposed rafters and overhanging eaves. Additionally, there are aspects of the addition and new garage that are differentiated from the original structure. The proposed materials, while compatible, are of modern design and production. Further, the new garage is utilizing an off-center configuration for the garage door placement as well as a (wood-look) vinyl-product door. Traditionally, a garage would have a center door placement, but this off-set will not be visible from the street. The historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property shall be maintained and will not be destroyed ensuring the new work is compatible with the integrity of the property and its environment.

*New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

The proposed project, as described above, will not impact the architectural features of the residence and, therefore, will not have a negative impact on the essential form and integrity of the historic property. If removed in the future, the new addition and detached garage will not affect the overall architectural character of the single-family residence or the surrounding historic properties in the district.

### **Consistency with the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines**

The ideal preservation approach in the Design Guidelines states that new additions preserve the historic and architectural integrity of the existing residence and that the individual features such as windows, roof, and foundation maintain the same characteristics as the original. The design of the addition and detached garage do not impact the architectural integrity of the existing residence as they were designed to be compatible with the Craftsman architectural design of the primary structure. As mentioned, the height and pitch of the roof over the addition and garage is consistent with the roof of the main residence. Architectural details that match those on the single-family residence include decorative river rock, decorative vertical slat gable vents, wood sash and double hung windows, exposed rafters and overhanging eaves. Therefore, the proposed addition and garage is consistent with the ideal preservation approach described in the Design Guidelines.

### **CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION**

The design and materials of the proposed addition and detached garage meet the requirements of the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, the standards contained in Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Ordinance, and the SOI Standards for Rehabilitation. The overall project will reflect the historic architectural style of the existing single-family residence and will have no adverse impact on the architectural features of the residence. Therefore, the project is consistent with the applicable standards and guidelines and staff recommends that Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA-8223-2017), subject to the attached conditions.

MAJCOA-8223-2017  
1207 Wisconsin Street  
Staff Report

Respectfully submitted by:

Emily Stadnicki, AICP  
Development Services Manager

Prepared by:

Vinny Tam, MURP, AICP  
Associate Planner

**ATTACHMENTS:**

1. Draft HPC Approval Resolution
2. Vicinity Map
3. Historic Resources Survey dated February 1993
4. Historic Resources Survey dated April 2005
5. Project Plans

I:\Planning\Master Planning\\_Case Files\Current\Wisconsin St\1207\MAJCOA-8223-2017\Final\2018-04-04(MAJCOA-8223-2017)(1207-Wisconsin)-SR.doc