



CITY OF POMONA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION

COMMISSION

DATE: September 5, 2018

TO: HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

FROM: PLANNING DIVISION

SUBJECT: MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 9690-2018)
ON PROPERTY WITHIN THE R-1-6,000 (SINGLE FAMILY
RESIDENTIAL) LOCATED AT 522 SAN FRANCISCO AVENUE IN THE
LINCOLN PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

SUMMARY

Issue - The Historic Preservation Commission to review Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 9690-2018) to allow the demolition of an existing garage, the construction of an addition to a contributing single family residence, and the construction of new two car garage attached to new accessory dwelling unit (ADU) located at 522 San Francisco Avenue in the Lincoln Park Historic District.

Recommendation – Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution (Attachment 1) approving a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 9690-2018) to allow the demolition of existing garage and an addition to a contributing single family residence and construction of a new two car garage attached to new accessory dwelling unit on a property located at 522 San Francisco Avenue, subject to findings and conditions.

Applicable Codes and Guidelines -

- 1) Zoning Ordinance Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation)
- 2) Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties
- 3) Historic Preservation Design Guidelines dated July 19, 1999

Public Noticing Requirements – On August 23, 2018, the public notice was sent to the applicant, posted at the subject site, and mailed to all owners of property located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject site, complying with the 10 day minimum noticing requirement.

City Initiated Corrective Action –None.

Environmental Determination – Pursuant to the Guidelines for Implementation of the Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the proposed project meets the criteria for a Class 3 (New Construction of Small Structures), Section 15303, Categorical Exemption per Section 15303 (a).

BACKGROUND

The property is currently developed as a 1,188 square foot one-story single-family residence with a 323 square foot detached garage, located at 522 San Francisco Avenue in the Lincoln Park Historic District. The architectural style of the home is minimal transitional. The Primary Record survey for the property indicates that it was built in 1939. The single-family residential structure sits on 11,273 square-foot (0.26 acres) lot in the R-1-6,000 (Single Family Residential) zone (Attachment 2).

The Primary Record survey for the property identifies this residence as “contributing,” and it was identified as a contributing residence in the formation of the Lincoln Park Historic District in 1998. The survey provides the following description:

“This home was built in 1939 and was originally valued at \$3,600. It is a bungalow-sized home built with one main hipped roof and an extending hipped roof which forms the entryway. The extending hipped roof area forms the front porch and northwest room of the home. There is a three-light bay windows on the eastern side of the north exposure of this home. The corner porch is supported by a wrought iron post at the corner. A slanted bay window, with bell cast shed-style roof, is located next to the porch and a large red brick chimney is located on the west façade. The home was originally built of stucco, but more recently was sided in lap siding.”

Since its original date of construction, the single-family residential structure has undergone the following permitted alterations:

1. In 1998, a permit was issued for a wall in the side yard.

PROPOSED PROJECT

The project consists of demolition to existing garage, an addition to the rear of the existing single-family residence, and addition of a two-car garage to be attached to a new ADU. The 975 square foot addition at the rear of the single family residence will include a new bedroom, bathroom, walk-in closet, extension of the existing kitchen, family room, and a bedroom with bathroom. The addition will also include: a new rear door, three fixed windows, three sliding glass windows, and two double hung windows. The windows, as conditioned, will match the proportions, material, style and trim of the existing windows. The exterior will have siding to match the existing siding in color and style, and a new asphalt shingle roof will be added to match the existing roof in material and pitch. A new skylight, not visible from the public street view, will be installed in the new addition, but will not affect the integrity of the historic structure. The new ADU and attached garage will also have compatible exterior siding, same pitched roof and material, wooden windows, and doors, as conditioned, as the main historic building.

ANALYSIS

Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Ordinance requires that projects involving historic properties be consistent with the standards contained in that section and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The project is also analyzed for consistency with the City's Design Guidelines for historic preservation. Furthermore, per recent State law (SB 1069 and SB 299) pertaining to accessory dwelling units, the proposed ADU associated with this project is not being reviewed as part of this discretionary process. The ADU will be reviewed ministerially by the Planning Division upon plan check submittal to Building and Safety.

Consistency with Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation) of the Zoning Ordinance Standards:

Section .5809-13 requires that all certificates of appropriateness be reviewed for consistency with the standards contained in the code. As illustrated in Table 1, the demolition of the garage, proposed addition, and proposed garage, as conditioned, are consistent with the standards contained in Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Ordinance.

Table 1. Compliance with .5809-13 (Historic Preservation)

Historic Preservation Design Review			
Design Criteria	Review	Yes	No
Height	Is the height and bulk compatible with surrounding structures and in conformance with maximum allowable height?	X	
Proportions of Windows and Doors	Are proportions and relationships between doors and windows compatible with the architectural style and character of surrounding structures?	X, as conditioned	
Relationship of Building Masses and Spaces	Are proposed structures and/or remodeled spaces and created spaces consistent with the shapes and setbacks of existing adjacent structures?	X	
Roof Shape	Is the design of the roof compatible with the architectural character and style of surrounding structures?	X	
Scale	Is the scale of the structure compatible with the architectural character and style of the existing building?	X	
Directional Expression/Facades	Are facades compatible with the dominant horizontal and vertical expression of surrounding structures?	X	

Historic Preservation Design Review			
Design Criteria	Review	Yes	No
Architectural Details	Do architectural details like materials and textures make new construction compatible with the architectural style and character of the historic district?	X, as conditioned	
Architectural Rhythm and Articulation	Do proposed structures and façade remodeling show rhythmic repetition of architectural details for compatibility with façade articulation of existing adjacent buildings?	X, as conditioned	
New additions	When new additions and adjacent related new construction are removed, will essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment be impaired?	X	
Exterior mechanical equipment	Is the design, style, color and texture of the required screening method compatible with the existing or proposed building/façade design?	N/A	

Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's (SOI) Standards

The SOI Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties contains two standards that are directly related to additions and new construction. The standards are as follows:

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed project involves a 975 square foot addition to an existing single-family residence, and a new 400 square foot garage. The project has been designed to resemble the existing structure's architectural style. The windows and doors will be compatible with the existing windows and doors in proportion and material. Siding of the new exterior will be compatible with the existing siding as new siding is of cement fiber as opposed to the existing wood siding, thereby, differentiating the new addition from the existing structure. Exposure of the siding will be the same as the existing siding. As such, the proposed project will be consistent in style with the residence located in the Lincoln Park Historic District. The proposed project will not impact the historic character of the home and the surrounding historic district will not be negatively impacted. The exterior of the addition and garage will be finished with siding that match the existing siding of the residence, and

will have the same pitch and material as the existing roof. Windows and doors of both the addition and the garage will match, as conditioned, with the existing home.

New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed addition will not affect the significant architectural features of the residence and, therefore, will not have a negative impact on the essential form and integrity of the historic property. The connection point is in the rear, not visible from the public view.

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines

Addition:

The ideal preservation approach in the Design Guidelines state that new additions preserve the historic and architectural integrity of the existing residence and that the individual features such as windows, doors, roof, siding, and foundation maintain the same characteristics as the existing. As stated previously, the proposed addition will have the same style, proportions, detailing, and materials as the existing residence. The proposed 4:12 roof pitch will match the 4:12 roof pitch on the main residence. The exterior walls of the addition and garage will have siding that matches the existing residence. The new windows and doors will match the existing as conditioned. The skylight will be part of the new addition only, maintaining the integrity of the existing historic home. Therefore, the proposed addition is consistent with the ideal preservation approach described in the Design Guidelines.

Demolition:

The ideal preservation approach in the Design Guidelines states that before demolition is considered, possibilities for creative rehabilitation and reuse should be fully explored. Applicant has explored multiple options to preserve the existing garage. However, the garage is structurally unsound and relocation of the structure would be infeasible. The new garage to be attached to the ADU consists of the same design as the existing historic building.

New Construction:

The ideal preservation approach in the Design Guidelines states that Pomona encourages new construction projects within historic preservation districts if the projects are compatible with surrounding structures and help to preserve the character of the district as a whole. The new addition and garage have the same design elements, proportions, massing, and scale as the existing structure.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

The design and materials of the proposed major alteration meet the requirements of the Design Guidelines, the standards contained in Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Ordinance and the SOI Standards for Rehabilitation. The major alteration will reflect the architectural style of the

residence and will have no adverse impact on the architectural features of the residence or the Lincoln Park Historic District. Therefore, the project is consistent with the applicable standards and guidelines and staff recommends that Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution (Attachment 1) approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 9690-2018), subject to conditions.

Respectfully submitted,

Prepared by,

Mario Suarez, AICP
Development Services Director

Eunice Im, AICP
Assistant Planner

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1) Draft HPC Resolution
- 2) Location Map & Aerial Photograph
- 3) Historic Resources Survey Excerpt
- 4) Project Site Photographs
- 5) Site Plan