



CITY OF POMONA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION

COMMISSION

DATE: March 6, 2019

TO: Historic Preservation Commission (HPC)

FROM: Planning Division

SUBJECT: MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 11065-2018)

Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 11207-2019) to allow for the demolition of a pre-1945 single family residence on a property located at 1150 Buena Vista Avenue.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution (Attachment 1) approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 11207-2019) to allow the demolition of a single-family residence located at 1150 Buena Vista Avenue, subject to conditions.

PROPERTY & APPLICANT INFORMATION

Address	1150 Buena Vista Avenue
Assessor's Parcel Number (APN)	8349-027-029
Lot Size	29,819 s.f. (.685 acres)
General Plan Land Use Designation	Residential Neighborhood
Zoning District	R-2
Historic District	None
Specific Plan	None
City Council District	2
Applicant	Twen Ma
Property Owner	Honghua Shang

RELATED ACTIONS

Historic Preservation Commission	None
Code Enforcement	None
Planning	None

BACKGROUND

The applicant, Twen Ma has submitted an application for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the demolition of one single-family residence with an estimated construction date of 1912. The site is located within the R-2 Low Density Multiple Family Zone and is located south of 11th Street (Attachment 2). The applicant intends to demolish the property and construct an 8-unit condominium project consisting of four duplex buildings (Attachment 3).

APPLICABLE CODE SECTIONS

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, *“all applications for demolition of structures built prior to 1945 submitted to the building division shall be considered by Pomona historic preservation commission for a certificate of appropriateness even if the structure is not a designated landmark.”* Furthermore, a public hearing notice must be sent *“to the applicants and property owners of the nominated property and all property owners directly adjacent to, or directly across the street from the site at least 30 days prior to the date of the commission public hearing”* and *“legal notice shall be provided at least ten days prior to the public hearing in a newspaper of local circulation.”* In making a determination, the Historic Preservation Commission *“shall first consider if the property would likely meet the criteria used in historic landmark designation thus deeming it of historical significance,”* and if so, *“then a structure would be denied a certificate of appropriateness for demolition unless it meets the criteria for economic hardship.”*

ANALYSIS

Description of Residence

The City of Pomona’s Historic Resources Inventory conducted in 1993 identified the dwelling as a Craftsman Bungalow which contributes to the historic streetscape only, in spite of its alterations (Attachment 4). The dwelling was not identified as eligible for local landmark status, eligible for listing in the California Register of Historic Resources, or eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

The two-story craftsman home features a large covered front porch with tapered squared brick columns that lead to the front entrance. The roof is both pitched and gabled with overhanging eaves and exposed rafters. There is an attached two-car garage on the west elevation and an attached enclosed patio enclosure to the rear of the property with similar brick columns. The home also features a large dormer on the second story, vinyl windows and horizontal clap board siding. There is a wrought iron fence with brick pilasters within the front yard setback area which matches the long tapered columns. The home also features a pool, an attached patio enclosure, and a detached patio cover.

Building Permit History

Staff has completed a review of all building permit history on file with the Building and Safety Division. Staff was unable to identify the building permits for the original construction of the home. However, building permits were identified for the installation of vinyl windows, an attached solid patio enclosure, detached patio cover, and pool, which were constructed between 1971 and 1993. The Los Angeles County Assessor's (Assessor) records indicate that the dwelling is 1,808 square-feet in area, a "year built" of 1912 and an "effective year built" of 1930. According to the Assessor, year built is the calendar year in which at least 50% of the original construction was complete and effective year built is the adjusted year built taking into account any subsequent new construction or renovation.

Historic Landmark Designation Criteria

The residence was identified in the City of Pomona's 1993 Historic Resources Inventory Survey as a contributing structure to the historic streetscape only; however, the neighborhood has evolved and changes since the survey. The structure itself does not possess special characteristics that distinguish it from other structures of the period located in the City and was not listed as a potential candidate for local, state, or national landmark status. Staff has determined that the structure cannot be identified with persons or events significant in local history and would not meet the landmark designation criteria.

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Commission shall first consider if the property would likely meet the following criteria used in historic landmark designation:

- a. The proposed change will not adversely affect any significant historical, cultural, architectural, or aesthetic features of the concerned property or the historic district in which it is located.*

The City of Pomona Historic Resources Survey did not identify the single family home in its survey of structures along Buena Vista as eligible for local landmark status, eligible for listing in the California Register of Historic Resources, or eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. The subject structure appears to have been constructed in 1912 per Assessor records, although the original building permits have not been identified. The architectural style is described as a Craftsman Bungalow in the City of Pomona's Historic Resources Inventory. It has no special characteristics that distinguish it from other structures of the period located in the City. The structures also do not exemplify any special elements of the City's history.

- b. The structure is not identified with person or events significant in local, state, or national history.*

No evidence has surfaced that the structure can be identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

- c. *The structure does not embody distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction, nor is it a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship.*

The structure has characteristics of a Craftsman Bungalow; however, there are no indications of a distinctive method of construction used on the structure, or of any indigenous materials or craftsmanship used in the construction.

- d. *The structure does not contribute to the significance of an historic area, being a geographically definable area possessing a concentration of historic or scenic properties or thematically related grouping of properties that contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by plan or physical development.*

The onsite structure no longer contributes to the historic streetscape identified in the 1993 historic resource inventory survey. The architectural character of the neighborhood has changed over the past few decades and a few undeveloped lots remain on Buena Vista Avenue. The neighborhood has evolved with ongoing improvement projects that have altered the overall historical context of the structures and historical streetscape. Therefore, the area surrounding the property does not possess a unifying character and does not have a concentration of related historic or scenic properties.

- e. *The structure is not the work of a notable builder, designer, landscape designer, or architect.*

The subject residence was built in approximately 1912 and the builder could not be identified.

- f. *The structure does not embody elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation.*

The structure does not retain a significant architectural character, and does not possess any distinguishing details, structural and architectural innovations. As such, it was not listed as a potential candidate for local, state, or national landmark status.

- g. *The structure does not have a unique location or singular physical characteristics nor is it a view or vista representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the City of Pomona.*

The structure is located on Buena Vista Avenue which is an urbanized area of the City. The area is developed with single family residences and multi-family residential uses adjacent to the property. Because of the urban development throughout the last few

decades, the setting, feel, and character of the neighborhood has irreversibly changed. Therefore, the property does not have a unique established and familiar location or view.

- h. The structure does not embody elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation.*

The structure does not retain a significant architectural character, and does not possess any distinguishing details, structural and architectural innovations. As such, it was not listed as a potential candidate for local, state, or national landmark status.

- i. The structure is not similar to other distinctive properties, sites, areas, or objects based on a historic, cultural, or architectural motif.*

The subject structure has not been found to be similar to distinctive properties, sites, or areas in the City, based on an historic, cultural, or architectural motif. The structure is a Craftsman Bungalow constructed in 1912, and has undergone several alterations.

- j. It does not reflect significant geographical patterns, including those associated with different eras of settlement and growth, particular transportation modes, or distinctive example of park or community planning.*

The subject structure does not reflect significant geographic patterns of settlement and growth. It is located in a neighborhood comprised of single-family residential buildings of different eras. The site does not involve any structures associated with transportation, park or community planning.

- k. It is one of the few remaining examples of the City of Pomona, region, state, or nation possessing distinguishing characteristics of an architectural or historical type of specimen.*

The structure does not possess an architectural style or characteristic that distinguishes it from others of its kind. It is not one of few remaining examples of its architectural type in the City, the region, or the state.

PUBLIC NOTICING

On February 4, 2019, a public hearing notice was sent to the applicant, posted at the subject site, and mailed to all owners of property located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject site. Per section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, demolitions of pre-1945 structures require a thirty (30) day notice to all property owners directly adjacent to, or directly across the street prior to the date of the commission public hearing. On February 4, 2019 a public hearing notice was also sent to all local historical groups and HPC

commissioners and was published in the Inland Valley Daily Bulletin on February 7, 2019. As of February 25, 2019, Planning has received no inquiries about possible relocation of the structures.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Pursuant to the Guidelines for Implementation of the Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the proposed project meets the criteria for a Class 1, Section 15301 Categorical Exemption in that the project involves the demolition and removal of one single-family residence.

CONCLUSION

In summary, the residence located at 1150 Buena Vista Avenue does possess the Craftsman Bungalow architectural style however was not listed as a potential candidate for local, state, or national landmark status in the 1993 Historic Resource Inventory Survey. Despite the residence being identified as contributing to the historic streetscape, the architectural character of the neighborhood has changed over the past few decades, which have altered the overall historical context of the structures and historical streetscape. Staff has determined that the structure does not meet the historic landmark designation criteria and its demolition would not cause a potentially significant impact to a historic resource.

Respectfully submitted by:

Prepared by:

Anita D. Gutierrez, AICP
Acting Development Services Director

Lynda Lara
Assistant Planner

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1) Draft HPC Resolution
- 2) Location Map & Aerial Photo
- 3) Proposed 8-Unit Condo Development
- 4) Historic Resources Inventory Form
- 5) Site Photographs