



CITY OF POMONA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION

COMMISSION

DATE: March 6, 2019

TO: Historic Preservation Commission (HPC)

FROM: Development Services Department, Planning Division

SUBJECT: **MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 11378-2019)**
Major Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the construction of a new 360 square foot garage and a request to remove a Mexican Fan Palm tree located in the rear yard on a property with a contributing single-family residence located at 490 Preciado Street within the Hacienda Park Historic District.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution (Attachment 1) approving a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 11378-2019) to allow the construction of a 360 square foot garage and the removal of a Mexican Fan Palm tree, subject to conditions, on a property located at 490 Preciado Street (Attachment 2).

PROPERTY & APPLICANT INFORMATION

Address	490 Preciado Street
Assessor's Parcel Number (APN)	8359-021-007
Lot Size	16,635 SF (0.38 Acre)
General Plan Land Use Designation	Residential Neighborhood
Zoning District	R-1 7,200 Single Family Zoning District
Historic District	Hacienda Park Historic District
Specific Plan	N/A
City Council District	District 6
Applicant	James Kercheval
Property Owner	James & Kristie Kercheval

RELATED ACTIONS

Historic Preservation Commission	N/A
Building & Safety	1/18/56: 18x44 Swimming Pool 7/24/53: Remodel two bathrooms (2 nd floor) 5/3/57: Remodel kitchen, remove service porch partition, install cabinets 10/5/60: Extension of sun porch

	<p>7/8/98: Foundation seismic anchoring of two story SFD</p> <p>3/16/90: Chimney repair due to earthquake damage</p> <p>4/26/90: Install 2 chimney anchors</p> <p>11/17/03: Installation of new support beam in garage due to drywall installation</p> <p>1/24/05: Remodel existing bathroom, changing location of non-bearing wall</p> <p>9/20/06: Replace aluminum glass slider with wood framed French doors leading to rear yard (Minor Certificate of Appropriateness MISC 06-372)</p>
Planning	<p>MISC 05-183 Permit to trim two trees on property</p> <p>MISC 06-372 Minor Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the replacement of a glass slider with a wood framed French door</p> <p>EXHIST 11377-2019 Exemption permit to allow the removal of a Pine tree located adjacent to the fire place. Approval pursuant to Fire Code Section 325.2.1(4)</p>

EXISTING CONDITIONS

The property is currently developed as a two-story, 2,297 square foot, single-family dwelling with an attached two-car garage, located at 490 Preciado Street on a 16,635 square foot lot in the R-1-7,200 (Single Family Residential) Zoning District and within the Hacienda Park Historic District (Attachment 3).

HISTORIC SIGNIFICANCE

The Historic Resources Inventory Survey (Attachment 4) for the property identifies this structure as “contributing,” and it was identified as a contributing structure in the formation of the Hacienda Park Historic District in 2003. The survey provides the following description:

“This 1926 home is identifiable as a Tudor Revival by its steeply pitched roof, dominant cross-front-gable, and multiple groups of multi-paned windows. It is uncommon to see clapboard siding in a Tudor home, but not unheard of. The original owner was a manager at the local Kerckhoff-Cuzner Mill, and perhaps this accounts for the redwood siding of the home. Windows are casement windows, which is also typical of the style with eight panes each. The second story features French doors. The second story balcony is cantilevered and covered by the principle roof. The garage is attached and located at the back of the house. Some windows have been replaced on the west side of the house with aluminum framed windows in the 1950s.”

PROPOSED PROJECT

The proposed project includes the construction of a 360 square foot garage and the request to remove a Mexican Fan Palm tree located in the rear yard (Attachment 5). The proposed 1,200 square foot accessory dwelling unit will be reviewed under a separate ministerial permit. The proposed garage and accessory dwelling unit will include details such as exterior vertical siding that exhibits a board and batten look. Shingle roofing will be included on the garage and accessory dwelling unit compatible with the existing dwelling and to match the barn-style shed located in the rear yard. The roof color chosen will mimic wood shingle roofing material that was originally used on the existing dwelling and barn-style shed.

The photo below depicts the existing barn-style shed located in the rear yard that serves as inspiration for the proposed project. The steep pitched roof, board and batten siding, and vent are details that are included in the new garage and accessory dwelling unit.



The existing Mexican Fan Palm tree located in the rear yard will be replaced with a 24" boxed specimen tree and additional citrus trees may be planted.

APPLICABLE CODE SECTIONS AND GUIDELINES

1. Pomona Zoning Ordinance, Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation)
2. City Council Resolution 2000-72 (Historic Trees)
3. City of Pomona 1999 Design Guidelines for Historic Properties
4. Secretary of Interior (SOI) Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties

Per recent State law (SB 1069 and SB 299) pertaining to accessory dwelling units, the proposed accessory dwelling unit associated with this project is not being reviewed as part of this discretionary process. The accessory dwelling unit will be processed as a ministerial review upon plan check submittal to the Building and Safety Department.

ANALYSIS OF PROPOSED PROJECT

Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation) of the Zoning Ordinance Standards

As illustrated in Table 1, the demolition of the existing garage and proposed new garage are consistent with the standards contained in Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Ordinance.

Table 1. Compliance with .5809-13 (Historic Preservation)

Historic Preservation Design Review			
Design Criteria	Review	Yes	No
Height	Is the height and bulk compatible with surrounding structures and in conformance with maximum allowable height?	X	
Proportions of Windows and Doors	Are proportions and relationships between doors and windows compatible with the architectural style and character of surrounding structures?	X	
Relationship of Building Masses and Spaces	Are proposed structures and/or remodeled spaces and created spaces consistent with the shapes and setbacks of existing adjacent structures?	X	
Roof Shape	Is the design of the roof compatible with the architectural character and style of surrounding structures?	X	
Scale	Is the scale of the structure compatible with the architectural character and style of the existing building?	X	
Directional Expression/Facades	Are facades compatible with the dominant horizontal and vertical expression of surrounding structures?	X	

Architectural Details	Do architectural details like materials and textures make new construction compatible with the architectural style and character of the historic district?	X	
Architectural Rhythm and Articulation	Do proposed structures and façade remodeling show rhythmic repetition of architectural details for compatibility with façade articulation of existing adjacent buildings?	X	
New additions	When new additions and adjacent related new construction are removed, will essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment be impaired?		X
Exterior mechanical equipment	Is the design, style, color and texture of the required screening method compatible with the existing or proposed building/façade design?	X	

Secretary of the Interior's (SOI) Standards

The SOI Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties contains two standards that are directly related to additions and new construction. The standards are as follows:

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed project includes the construction of a new garage. The project has been designed to resemble the existing structure's architectural style. The garage side entry exterior door will consist of shaker style salvaged materials that will be compatible with the existing doors in proportion and material. Siding of the new exterior will be compatible with the existing siding as it is consistent with the existing barn-style shed located in the rear yard that exhibits vertical boards for a board and batten look. The garage will have the same pitch and material as the existing roof. As such, the proposed project will be compatible with the residences located in the Hacienda Park Historic District. The proposed project will not impact the historic character of the home and the surrounding historic district will not be negatively impacted.

New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed new garage will not affect the significant architectural features of the

residence and, therefore, will not have a negative impact on the essential form and integrity of the historic property. The proposed new garage and accessory dwelling unit are detached from the existing structure and will be located to the rear of the property.

1999 Historic Preservation Design Guidelines

The ideal preservation approach in the Design Guidelines state that new construction projects preserve the historic and architectural integrity of the existing residence and that the individual features such as windows, doors, roof, siding, and foundation maintain the same characteristics as the existing. As stated previously, the proposed garage and accessory dwelling unit will have the same style, proportions, detailing, and materials as the existing residence. The proposed roof pitch will match the roof pitch on that of the main residence. The exterior walls of the proposed garage and accessory dwelling unit will have siding that is consistent with the existing barn-style shed and is compatible with the existing residence. The new windows and doors will include a combination of salvaged materials that will be compatible with the existing. The new garage and accessory dwelling unit will have the same design elements, proportions, massing, and scale as the existing structure; therefore, the proposed new garage is consistent with the ideal preservation approach described in the Design Guidelines.

A new driveway will be installed on the western portion of the property for access to the proposed garage. The design details will be compatible with the period and architecture of the primary historic building as specified in the Design Guidelines.

PUBLIC NOTICING

On February 21, 2019, a notice was sent to the applicant, posted at the subject site, and mailed to all owners and occupants of property located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject site. No correspondence has been received to date.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Pursuant to the Guidelines for Implementation of the Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the proposed project meets the criteria for a Section 15303(e), (Class 3 - New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures) and Section 15304, (Class 4 - Minor Alterations to Land), because only an accessory structure is being built.

CONCLUSION

The design and materials of the proposed major alteration meet the requirements of the Design Guidelines, the standards contained in Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Ordinance, and the SOI Standards for Rehabilitation. The major alteration will reflect the architectural style of the residence and will have no adverse impact on the architectural features of the residence or the Hacienda Park Historic District. Therefore, the project is consistent with the applicable standards and guidelines and staff recommends that Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached

MAJCOA 11378-2019
490 Preciado Street
Page 7 of 7

resolution approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 11378-2019), subject to conditions.

Respectfully submitted,

Prepared by,

Anita D. Gutierrez, AICP
Acting Development Services Director

Sandra Elias
Assistant Planner

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1) Draft HPC Resolution
- 2) Location Map & Aerial Photograph
- 3) Project Site Photographs
- 4) Historic Resources Survey Excerpt
- 5) Project Plans