



CITY OF POMONA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

DATE: April 3, 2019

TO: Historic Preservation Commission (HPC)

FROM: Development Services Department, Planning Division

SUBJECT: **MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 5222-2016):**
Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an unpermitted 186 square-foot addition and allow the construction of a 111 square-foot addition on a property located at 443 Chester Place in the Wilton Heights Historic District.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution (Attachment 1) approving a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 5222-2016) to allow the demolition an unpermitted 186 square foot addition and the construction of a new 111 square-foot addition, subject to conditions.

PROPERTY & APPLICANT INFORMATION

Address	443 Chester Avenue
Assessor's Parcel Number (APN)	8340-012-010
Lot Size	7,362 (0.17 acres)
General Plan Land Use Designation	Residential Neighborhood
Zoning District	R-1-7,200 Single Family Residential
Historic District	Wilton Heights Historic District
Specific Plan	N/A
City Council District	District 1
Applicant	Carolina and Jose Ibarria
Property Owner	Carolina and Jose Ibarria

RELATED ACTIONS

Historic Preservation Commission	N/A
Code Enforcement	10/11/05: Code case for trimming three trees without a permit. Minor Certificate of Appropriateness obtained. Closed, 11/1/05. 2/11/11: Window change-out (unoriginal) without a permit. Referred case to Building Enforcement. Minor Certificate of

	Appropriateness obtained for window change-out. Closed, 5/10/18.
Building & Safety	2/27/07: Building case for a 186 square foot addition without a permit. Case remains active and Major Certificate of Appropriateness has been submitted (MAJCOA 5222-2016).
Planning	9/9/05: Minor Certificate of Appropriateness (MISC 40387-7002) for re-roof, like-for-like composition shingles. Approved. 11/1/05: Minor Certificate of Appropriateness (MINCOA 05-0394) for the trimming of two Pecan trees located in rear yard and one avocado tree in the front yard. Approved.

BACKGROUND

The single family home is located east of White Avenue and west of Wisconsin Street and is in the R-1-7,200 Single Family Residential Zone (Attachment 2). The property is currently developed with a 1,260 square-foot single-family home with a detached 361 square foot garage. The home is surrounded by single family residences to the north, east, south and west. Photos of the site have been included as Attachment 3.

Building permit records show a major addition consisting of two bedrooms and one bathroom addition, and minimal work such as installation of A/C, re-roofing and electrical. Illegal construction was identified consisting of a bonus room and storage room which will be demolished as part of this request. The proposed 111 square foot addition will expand the existing dining room.

SITE DESCRIPTION

The City of Pomona's Historic Inventory Survey prepared by Dianne Marsh in 1993 identifies the property as a Minimal Traditional home with a date of construction of 1939, the condition of the structure as good with moderate additions or alterations, and rated the structure as "NA - Building which does not contribute to the historic streetscape because it has been altered too much" (Attachment 4). The State of California Department of Parks and Recreation Primary Records identify the property as a Ranch style home built in 1939. The site was recorded by Katie Horak in 2005, and coded as 5D1 which identifies the property as "contributor to a district that is listed or designated locally" (Attachment 5). Although the surveys have conflicting architectural styles, staff utilized the Katie Horak Historic survey as it evaluated the site more intensively. Horak records the property as below:

"This Building is a one-story, single-family residence constructed in 1946 (note that building records confirm the year built as 1939) in the Ranch style. It has an asymmetrical façade facing south. The foundation is concrete. The wood framed structural system has a smooth cementitious stucco exterior cladding that does not appear to be original. It is sheltered by a low-pitched,

side-facing gabled roof with overhanging eaves and exposed rafters.

The façade is characterized by a partial-width interior porch that spans to east portion of the structure. The window to the west consists of a pair of single hung-hung multi-paned sash windows. The window to the east consists of a large multi-paned fixed window. All windows have wood casings and sills. Windows on other elevation are similar to those found on the front façade. The front entrance is located near the center of the front façade, in the porch. It consists of a single wood paneled door. There is a single sconce light fixture adjacent to the door, on the east side. There is an exterior stucco-clad chimney on the east elevation.

The building fronts south onto W. Chester Place and is set behind a flat lawn. Other landscaping elements include a mature tree at the west side of the lawn and rose bushes adjacent to the driveway. There is a concrete driveway that runs along the east side of the structure. It leads to a detached double-car garage. The garage is similar in design to the house and was likely built at the same time.

There have been a few alterations to this house. The cinderblock railing at the porch was likely a later addition. The condition of the structure is good to excellent. The integrity is good.

This Ranch style single-family residence's character defining features include:

- *Smooth cementitious stucco cladding*
- *A low-pitched side-facing gabled roof with exposed rafters*
- *Long, rectangular plan*
- *Partial –width porch at the facade*



Existing Condition

PROPOSED PROJECT

The project consists of the demolition of an unpermitted 186 square foot addition and the construction of a new 111 square-foot addition. The applicant has recently obtained a grant through the Housing Division to replace the existing vinyl windows with wood windows which will be a combination of single and double-hung windows.

The existing home has a kitchen, living area, four bedrooms, and one bathroom. The demolition will consist of removing an unpermitted bonus and storage room and the addition includes an expansion to the existing dining room (Attachment 6). The exterior façade of the new addition will now complement the existing structure. The addition to the property will have the same roofing material as the home (composition shingles) and maintain the minimum 3:12 roof pitch requirement per as required by the Pomona Zoning Code. The addition of the property will carry the same architectural details such as overhanging eaves and new double-hung wood windows which will complement the existing windows. The new exterior walls will also match the existing cementitious stucco exterior wall cladding.

APPLICABLE CODE SECTIONS

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance (Historic Preservation), *Major projects shall include changes which significantly alter the following: height, proportions, the relationship of the building mass and space, roof shape, scale or distinctive facades of the structure. Examples of major projects shall include, but not be limited to room additions, adding dormers, expanding a garage, adding a porch, removing distinctive shutters or part or all of a structure. This category also includes demolition and/or replacement of primary use buildings or structures, and construction/installation of new buildings, structures, new public sidewalks, new public streetscape improvements, new street lamps, new public buildings and structures, and development of new public spaces within an historic district.*

The existing structure is located within the Wilton Heights Historic District and additions require a Major Certificate of Appropriateness. Furthermore, the proposed project is subject to consistency with the City of Pomona's 1999 Historic Design Guidelines and Secretary of Interior (SOI) Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties.

ANALYSIS

Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Ordinance requires that projects involving historic properties be consistent with the standards contained in that section and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The project is also analyzed for consistency with the City's Design Guidelines for historic preservation.

Consistency with Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation) of the Zoning Ordinance Standards:

Section .5809-13 requires that all certificates of appropriateness be reviewed for consistency with the standards contained in the code. As illustrated in Table 1, the demolition of the existing garage and proposed new garage are consistent with the standards contained in Section .5809-13 of the Zoning Ordinance.

Table 1. *Compliance with .5809-13 (Historic Preservation)*

Historic Preservation Design Review			
Design Criteria	Review	Yes	No
Height	Is the height and bulk compatible with surrounding structures and in conformance with maximum allowable height?	X	
Proportions of Windows and Doors	Are proportions and relationships between doors and windows compatible with the architectural style and character of surrounding structures?	X, conditioned	
Relationship of Building Masses and Spaces	Are proposed structures and/or remodeled spaces and created spaces consistent with the shapes and setbacks of existing adjacent structures?	X	
Roof Shape	Is the design of the roof compatible with the architectural character and style of surrounding structures?	X	
Scale	Is the scale of the structure compatible with the architectural character and style of the existing building?	X	
Directional Expression/Facades	Are facades compatible with the dominant horizontal and vertical expression of surrounding structures?	X	
Architectural Details	Do architectural details like materials and textures make new construction compatible with the architectural style and character of the historic district?	X, conditioned	
Architectural Rhythm and Articulation	Do proposed structures and façade remodeling show rhythmic repetition of architectural details for compatibility with façade articulation of existing adjacent buildings?	X, conditioned	
New additions	When new additions and adjacent related new construction are removed, will essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment		X

	be impaired?		
Exterior mechanical equipment	Is the design, style, color and texture of the required screening method compatible with the existing or proposed building/façade design?	N/A	

Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's (SOI) Standards

The SOI Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties contains two standards that are directly related to additions and new construction. The standards are as follows:

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed project has been designed to resemble the existing structure's architectural style and the new windows will be compatible with the existing windows in proportion and material. Siding of the new exterior will be compatible with the existing siding which is of cementitious stucco exterior cladding. The proposed 3:12 roof pitch will complement the existing 4:12 roof pitch on the main residence to differentiate from the old and the roof height will be 10' 6" appose to the existing height which is 15 feet. Chester Place contains a wide range of architectural styles such as Ranch Style, Minimal Traditional, Spanish Colonial Revival Craftsman and Tudor Revival; therefore, the proposed change will be compatible with the historic integrity of the Wilton Heights Historic District.

New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed addition is designed in a manner that matches the existing form of the home by extending the eastern wall and maintaining a single-story height. As such, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines

The ideal preservation approach in the Design Guidelines states that new additions preserve the historic and architectural integrity of the existing building and that the individual features such as windows, doors, roof, siding, and foundation maintain the same characteristics as the existing. The proposed addition will have the same style, proportions, and materials as the existing residence. The proposed 3:12 roof pitch will complement the existing 4:12 roof pitch on the main residence and will consist of composition shingles. The exterior walls of the addition will have the same smooth cementitious stucco exterior cladding and the new windows will be double-hung windows. Therefore, the proposed addition is consistent with the ideal preservation

approach described in the Design Guidelines.

PUBLIC NOTICING

On March 20, 2019 a notice was sent to the applicant, and mailed to all owners and occupants of the property located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject site.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Pursuant to the Guidelines for Implementation of the Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the proposed project meets the criteria for a Class 1 Categorical Exemption (Existing Facilities) pursuant to Section 15301(e)(1) in that the project will not result in an increase of more than 50 percent of the floor area of the structures before the addition..

CONCLUSION

The proposed addition is consistent with the applicable standards and guidelines found in the Pomona Zoning Ordinance, Historic Preservation Guidelines and Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties. Staff recommends that Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 5222-2016), subject to conditions.

Respectfully submitted,

Prepared by,

Anita D. Gutierrez, AICP
Acting Development Services Director

Lynda Lara
Assistant Planner

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1) Attachment 1 – Draft HPC Resolution
- 2) Attachment 2 – Location Map & Aerial Photo
- 3) Attachment 3 – Site Photos
- 4) Attachment 4 – 1993 Historic Inventory Survey
- 5) Attachment 5 – 2005 Dept. of Parks & Recreation Historic Survey
- 6) Attachment 6 – Proposed Plans