



CITY OF POMONA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION

COMMISSION

DATE: April 3, 2019

TO: Historic Preservation Commission (HPC)

FROM: Planning Division

SUBJECT: MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 11397-2019)

Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 11397-2019) to allow for the demolition of four (4) pre-1945 single family residences on a property located at 961, 955, 953, 949 E. Phillips Blvd.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution (Attachment 1) approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 11397-2019) to allow the demolition of four (4) single-family residences located at 961, 955, 953, 949 E. Phillips Blvd., subject to conditions.

PROPERTY & APPLICANT INFORMATION

Address	961, 955, 953, 949 E. Phillips Blvd.
Assessor's Parcel Number (APN)	8333-031-013
Lot Size	38,777 s.f. (0.89 acres)
General Plan Land Use Designation	Residential Neighborhood
Zoning District	R-2
Historic District	None
Specific Plan	None
City Council District	3
Applicant	Harry Shang
Property Owner	Yongzhi Wan

RELATED ACTIONS

Historic Preservation Commission	None
Code Enforcement	None
Planning	Preapp-002515-2015 (949 E. Phillips Blvd.)

BACKGROUND

Applicant Harry Shang submitted an application for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to request the demolition of four (4) single-family residences with an estimated construction date of 1910, 1923, 1925, and 1924 per Los Angeles County Assessor data. The site is located within the R-2 Low Density Multiple Family Zone with S-overlay. It is located north of Phillips Street, south of Grand Ave, east of Towne Ave, and west of San Antonio Ave. (Attachment 2). The applicant intends to demolish the properties and develop a 12-unit, 2 stories townhome project consisting of four triplex buildings (Attachment 3). Photographs of the site have been included as Attachment 4.

APPLICABLE CODE SECTIONS

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, *“all applications for demolition of structures built prior to 1945 submitted to the building division shall be considered by Pomona historic preservation commission for a certificate of appropriateness even if the structure is not a designated landmark.”* Furthermore, a public hearing notice must be sent *“to the applicants and property owners of the nominated property and all property owners directly adjacent to, or directly across the street from the site at least 30 days prior to the date of the commission public hearing”* and *“legal notice shall be provided at least ten days prior to the public hearing in a newspaper of local circulation.”* In making a determination, the Historic Preservation Commission *“shall first consider if the property would likely meet the criteria used in historic landmark designation thus deeming it of historical significance,”* and if so, *“then a structure would be denied a certificate of appropriateness for demolition unless it meets the criteria for economic hardship.”*

ANALYSIS

Description of Residence

949 E. Phillips Blvd.

The City of Pomona’s Historic Resources Inventory conducted by Diane Marsh in June 1993 identified 949 E. Phillips Blvd (Attachment 5). As a single family residential, Craftsman Bungalow styled home, built approximately in 1910. It is further described as being *“poor”* in condition and *“moderate”* for additions and alterations. It is succinctly described with *“cinderblock rail”* and identified as *“NA,”* which means that building that does not contribute to the historic streetscape because it has been altered too much, and *“R,”* which means altered building that could become a contributing building if the alterations were reversed. The dwelling was not identified as eligible for local landmark status, eligible for listing in the California Register of Historic Resources, nor eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

The single-story craftsman home features a large covered front porch made of cinder block near the front entrance. The roof is both pitched and front gabled with overhanging eaves and exposed rafters. There are double hung, wooden framed windows with angled, decorative lintels on top of

windows and doors. The structure also has clapboard sidings typical of Craftsman Bungalow.

961 E. Phillips Blvd.

961 E. Phillips Blvd. is also identified in the City of Pomona's Historic Resources Inventory (Attachment 5). It was also evaluated by Diane Marsh in June 1993, and was identified as a California Bungalow. The condition of the structure was "*poor*" and there were no additions or alterations made; however, the structure was identified as "*N*," which means building does not possess architectural character. Structure was not identified as historic landmark status.

The structure is composed of side facing gabled roof, clapboard siding, small triangular knee braces on the side of the home, with a brick chimney.

The remaining two properties, 955 and 953 E. Phillips Blvd. are not identified in the City of Pomona's Historic Resources Inventory nor were any persons of significance associated with the structures found as noted in the historical research analysis below.

Building Permit History

Staff has completed a review of the City Sanborn Map and all building permit history on file with the Building and Safety Division. Staff was unable to identify the building permits for the original construction of the homes. However, building permits were identified for work as identified in the Building Permit History Table. The property was not identified on the City's Sanborn Map.

Building Permit History Table	
949 E. Phillips Blvd.	Addition – 5/8/1956 Plumbing (house drain, sewer) – 6/8/1956 Electrical – 9/26/1956 Electrical – 6/7/1956 Electrical (garbage disposal)– 3/25/1996 Plumbing (kitchen sink and disposal) – 3/25/1996
953 E. Phillips Blvd.	**Alteration/addition (move from Monte Vista, 1100 sq. ft. install foundation and minor repairs) – 8/27/56 Plumbing & gas – 8/20/1956 Building (reroof) – 2/23/1965 Plumbing (shower) – 3/25/1996 Electrical (dryer, heater, disposal) – 3/25/1996 Building (reroof) – 2/03/1997
955 E. Phillips Blvd.	Alteration/addition (framing)– 12/14/1956 Electrical – 1/28/1957 Plumbing and Sewer - 2/27/1957 Building (reroof) – 3/24/2003
961 E. Phillips Blvd.	Plumbing (cesspool) – 1/18/1927

Plumbing (cesspool) – 8/18/1936
Alteration/Addition (install 3 windows) – 3/25/1954
Building (reroof) – 5/11/1965
Building (demo existing garage, porch, and shed) – 12/17/1986
Electrical (upgrade electrical panel) – 3/14/1996
Plumbing (toilet, shower, water heater, wash basin, kitchen sink)-
3/20/1996
HVAC (wall heater) – 3/28/1996
Electrical – 3/28/1996
Building (window change out) – 3/14/1996
Building (reroof) – 6/26/2000
Building (covered patio) – 3/7/2013

The Los Angeles County Assessor's (Assessor) records identify the following information for each of the existing structures:

Address	Year Built	Effective Year Built	Area (sq. ft.)
949	1910	1924	1,260
953	1923	1930	895
955	1925	1925	958
961	1924	1927	864

According to the Assessor, year built is the calendar year in which at least 50% of the original construction was complete and effective year built is the adjusted year built taking into account any subsequent new construction or renovation.

Historical Resources Analysis

Staff has reviewed the City Directory (Attachment 6) available at the Pomona Public Library to identify any persons associated with these properties, who made significant contribution to local, state, or national history. Staff has identified the following persons associated with the subject property:

1. *Diehl Francis M (poultry breeders) (1926)*
2. *Diehl Francis M (poultry) (1928)*
3. *Wood Wesley C (rancher) (1931)*
4. *McGuire Louise (1934)*
5. *Diehl Francis (1934)*
6. *Sharpe Arth J (1937-1938)*
7. *Northup Ann (1940)*
8. *Wasmund Arnold (1945)*
9. *Angel Luther (1945)*

10. Woodward Virgil (1948)
 11. Lewman Clarence (1951)

Staff has also reviewed the following City resources to evaluate the historical significance of the persons identified with the subject property. Persons of historical significance were not identified.

Historic Resources	Research
24 th Annual Pomona Heritage Home Tour	No historical significance found.
28 th Annual Pomona Heritage Home Tour	No historical significance found.
Pomona Centennial History by Pomona Centennial-Bicentennial Committee	No historical significance found.
Pomona Centennial History by Gloria Ricci Lothrop	No historical significance found.
History of Pomona Valley California with Biographical Sketches	No historical significance found.

Historic Landmark Designation Criteria

The two properties identified in the City of Pomona's 1993 Historic Resources Inventory Survey, 949 and 961 E. Phillips Blvd., were identified as either structures with no architectural characters or altered to lose its architectural value. The structures do not possess special characteristics that distinguish them from other structures of the period and were not listed as a potential candidate for local, state, or national landmark status. Staff has determined that the structures cannot be identified with persons or events significant in local history and would not meet the landmark designation criteria.

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Commission shall first consider if the property would likely meet the following criteria used in historic landmark designation:

Criteria	Analysis
<i>It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or natural history;</i>	The City of Pomona Historic Resources Survey did not identify 955 and 953 E. Phillips Blvd. in the survey, and 949 E. Phillips was identified as Craftsman Bungalow home that has been altered, yet with potential to be a contributing structure should the alterations be reversed. 961 E. Phillips Blvd. has been identified as a California Bungalow; however, it does not possess architectural character. In addition, the structures are not eligible for local landmark status, eligible for listing in the California Register of Historic Resources, nor eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. The subject structures appear to have been constructed in 1910, 1923, 1925, and 1924

	per Assessor records, although the original building permits have not been identified. Furthermore, the structures also do not exemplify any special elements of the City's history according to research conducted through the City directories and literature.
<i>It is identified with persons or events significant in local, state, or national history;</i>	No evidence has surfaced in staff's research in City directories and literature that the structure can be identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.
<i>It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;</i>	The structure has characteristics of a Craftsman Bungalow and California Bungalow; however, Diane Marsh has recorded that structure has been altered and is architecturally noncontributing. There are no indications of a distinctive method of construction used on the structure, or of any indigenous materials or craftsmanship used in the construction.
<i>It contributes to the significance of a historic area, being a geographically definable area possessing a concentration of historic or scenic properties or thematically related grouping of properties which contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by plan or physical development;</i>	The City's General Plan has identified three potentially eligible historic/merit districts: Kingsley Tract, Kellogg Park and Westmont Estates. The subject site is not located in the potentially eligible historic/merit districts. The subject site is located approximately 1.25 miles south from the nearest historic district, which is Lincoln Park. The area surrounding the property does not possess a unifying character and does not have a concentration of related historic or scenic properties.
<i>It is the work of a notable builder, designer, landscape designer or architect;</i>	The subject properties were built approximately in 1910, 1923, 1925, and 1924 and the builder could not be identified.
<i>It has a unique location or singular physical characteristics or is a view or vista representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the city of Pomona;</i>	The structure is located on East Phillips Blvd. which is an urbanized area of the City. Surrounding land uses are church to the east, and residential neighborhood. The area is developed with single family residences and multi-family residential uses adjacent to the properties. There are no unique characteristics or an established and familiar feature surrounding these properties.
<i>It embodies elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant</i>	The structures do not possess significant architectural character, and does not possess any distinguishing details, structural and architectural innovations. In addition, according to <u><i>A Field Guide to American Houses</i></u> by Virginia Savage McAlester, the structure

<i>structural or architectural achievement or innovation;</i>	lacks many architectural details that distinguish a home as Craftsman Bungalow such as roof being supported by tapered square columns, or columns and piers extending to ground level.
<i>It is similar to other distinctive properties, sites, areas, or objects based on an historic, cultural, or architectural motif;</i>	The subject structure has not been found to be similar to distinctive properties, sites, or areas in the City, based on an historic, cultural, or architectural motif. The structures have been identified as Craftsman Bungalow and California Bungalow; however, it has been altered to no longer hold architectural significance.
<i>It reflects significant geographical patterns, including those associated with different eras of settlement and growth, particular transportation modes, or distinctive examples of park or community planning;</i>	The subject structures do not reflect significant geographic patterns of settlement and growth. It is located in a neighborhood comprised of single-family residential buildings of different eras. The site does not involve any structures associated with transportation, park or community planning.
<i>It is one of the few remaining examples in the city of Pomona, region, state, or nation possessing distinguishing characteristics or an architectural or historical type or specimen.</i>	The structure does not possess an architectural style or characteristic that distinguishes it from others of its kind. It is not one of few remaining examples of its architectural type in the City, the region, or the state.

PUBLIC NOTICING

On February 28, 2019, a public hearing notice was sent to the applicant, posted at the subject site, and mailed to all owners of property located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject site. Per section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, demolitions of pre-1945 structures require a thirty (30) day notice to all property owners directly adjacent to, or directly across the street prior to the date of the commission public hearing. On February 28, 2019 a public hearing notice was also sent to all local historical groups and HPC commissioners and was published in the Inland Valley Daily Bulletin on March 2, 2019. As of date, Planning has received no inquiries about possible relocation of the structures.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Pursuant to the Guidelines for Implementation of the Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the proposed project meets the criteria for a Class 1, Section 15301 Categorical Exemption in that the project involves the demolition and removal of duplex or similar multifamily residential

structure. In urbanized areas, this exemption applies to duplexes and similar structures where not more than six dwelling units will be demolished.

CONCLUSION

In summary, the structures located at 961 East Phillips Boulevard were identified as Craftsman Bungalow and California Bungalow; however, the structures have been altered to no longer possess architectural significance. The structures are not listed as a potential candidate for local, state, or national landmark status in the 1993 Historic Resource Inventory Survey. The structures also have no historical, cultural, social, and political significance based on the research conducted through the City's historical resources. Staff has determined that the structure does not meet the historic landmark designation criteria and therefore, its demolition would not cause a potentially significant impact as a historic resource.

Respectfully submitted by:

Anita D. Gutierrez, AICP
Acting Development Services Director

Prepared by:

Eunice Im, AICP
Assistant Planner

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1) Draft HPC Resolution
- 2) Location Map & Aerial Photo
- 3) Proposed 8-Unit Condo Development
- 4) Site Photographs
- 5) Historic Resources Inventory Form
- 6) City Directory Excerpts for 961 E. Phillips Blvd.