

UNOFFICIAL MINUTES
POMONA HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MAY 2, 2018

CALL TO ORDER: The Historic Preservation Commission meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Chair Gallivan.

FLAG SALUTE: Commissioner Tomkins led the Commission in the flag salute.

ROLL CALL: Roll was taken by Development Services Manager Stadnicki.

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Chair Gallivan; Commissioners Martin, Tomkins, Gomez, Kercheval, Garcia (arrived at 7:23 p.m.)

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: Commissioner Tessier

STAFF PRESENT: Development Services Director Suarez, Development Services Manager Stadnicki, Senior Planner Khan, City Engineer Rene Guerrero

ITEM D:
PUBLIC COMMENTS:

None

ITEM E:
CONSENT CALENDAR:

None

PUBLIC HEARINGS:

ITEM F-1 PUBLIC HEARING – MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 6888-2017) TO ALLOW THE DEMOLITION OF ONE SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE ON PROPERTY LOCATED AT 152 W. ARTESIA.

Item continued from April 4, 2018

Development Services Manager Stadnicki reported staff recommends continuing this item to a date uncertain.

Commissioner Tomkins asked if the applicant was requesting the continuance.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki confirmed the applicant was requesting.

Commissioner Martin commented that this applicant owns the property on the southeast corner of Artesia and Park Avenue and the front door and one window is boarded up. He noted prior to their ownership it was in original condition and they said there were going to rent it but it is still unoccupied. She expressed concerns because this seems to be pattern and these two properties connect.

Motion by Commissioner Martin, seconded by Commissioner Kercheval, carried by a unanimous vote of the members present (5-0-0-2), to postpone Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 6888-2017) to a date uncertain.

ITEM F-2

PUBLIC HEARING – MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 5264-2016) TO ALLOW THE DEMOLITION OF ONE SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE ON A PROPERTY LOCATED AT 734 W. EIGHTH STREET.

Item continued from April 4, 2018.

Senior Planner Ata Khan provided a report for the demolition of one pre-1945 single-family residence and associated structures on a property located at 734 W. Eighth Street. He spoke about the location, Council District 2, and R3 Zoning (multi-family). He provided a site plan and photos of the 7,200 square foot lot; front, side, roof line, rear property line facing the alley, garage, several rear structures, and interior. He listed key points to include: built in 1890 with an effective build date of 1920 according to LA County assessor records and re-roofing and foundation work took place in the 1940's and 1950's. He noted the property was unidentified in the 1993 Historic Survey conducted by Diane Marsh, it was not listed as contributing and there isn't any evidence of being linked to any significant persons, events or architects. He reported staff has reviewed the site design and found it not to be contributing to a historic streetscape, therefore staff recommends adopting the major Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to conditions found in the draft resolution.

Chair Martin inquired if there was a streetscape picture.

Senior Planner Khan replied not in this presentation.

Chair Martin stated in the past they have requested streetscape pictures be included in presentations for the demolition of an the individual property because the Commission likes to see if there is a cohesiveness of a neighborhood or if there has been a lot of infill throughout the neighborhood. She noted a brand new house would change the dynamic of a historic vision of the area.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki stated they can make streetscape photos available in the future. She spoke about the threshold for denying the demolition and stated she received clarification from the City Attorney. She reported his response was that, per code, if the Commission cannot determine this property is eligible as an individual landmark then it should be approved for demolition.

Chair Gallivan shared streetscape photos he took on his phone. He commented the home matches the house next door and across the street.

Commissioner Martin asked Chair Gallivan to email the photos to staff.

Commissioner Tomkins stated she reviewed the design guidelines for the demolition of historic structures built after 1945 which includes a list of criteria for demolition. She inquired if the City Attorney looked at this in combination or just the ordinance.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki stated she provided the City Attorney with an overview of what occurred at the last meeting with commissioner comments about the impact to the overall neighborhood and streetscape and this was his response.

Senior Planner Khan displayed a street view photo for the Commissioners to review.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki spoke about threshold limits by area and creating landmark districts for more protection.

Chair Gallivan invited the applicant to speak. He asked her about the plans for the property after demolition. He inquired if the home is currently occupied and wanted to know why she is interested in demolishing a functional home.

Susana Moreno, the applicant, stated her intention build a modest single-family residence and rent it. She confirmed the home is currently occupied, however, for many years it has needed constant costly repairs. She stated she wants to have a property that is more energy efficient and proud to lease.

Chair Gallivan asked about her rebuild timeline.

Ms. Moreno responded that as soon as her current tenants find a place to stay, she will begin the process, and estimated 1-3 months for the tenant's departure. She stated she is not planning to leave it as a vacant lot, as an investor she plans to build a home right away to recoup her costs.

Commissioner Tomkins asked Ms. Moreno if she has designed the replacement home.

Ms. Moreno replied she has consulted a designer and has plans for a single property residence with a garage.

Commissioner Gomez asked if the design of the home is similar to any of the other homes in the neighborhood or if it will be completely different.

Ms. Moreno stated the design will be similar, a 3 bedroom single-family residence as recommended by the architect for the lost size. She noted as a rental, it needs to fit in the neighborhood.

Commissioner Gomez spoke about pride of ownership in the neighborhood. She stated she understands there is sometimes a need to demolish and asked how quickly Ms. Moreno plans to build.

Ms. Moreno stated her intention is to move quickly. She has credit from the bank and is just waiting for permission from the Commission.

Chair Gallivan commented it would be nice to see the design of what is going to be constructed and requested to see the plans before making a decision.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki went on record stating that if the City Attorney was here he would state that the Commission does not have purview over the future plans of the new construction because it's not a historic district.

Chair Gallivan inquired if she could leave it as an empty lot.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki responded technically yes, because there is not a requirement to have a replacement project building permit before demolition.

Director Suarez stated that Development Services Manager Stadnicki is correct on the matter. The issue is demolition unless one finds landmark status or a reason for historic designation per the Historic Preservation Code or guidelines provided. He reported in this case you have an active property owner that is indicating they will move forward with a project; staff is willing to work with the applicant to ensure it matches architecturally with the neighborhood.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki stated for the record that Commissioner Garcia arrived at 7:23 p.m.

Commissioner Tomkins asked if the submitted plan has an approval from the City.

Ms. Moreno stated she has submitted a couple of options; first for a two family unit which was denied due the size of the lot and now she is proceeding with a single family residence.

Commissioner Tomkins asked if the applicant was going to wait for plan approval before doing demolition. She noted one speaker was concerned about having a vacant lot.

Ms. Moreno responded she is new to this process and was informed after approval it goes for a permit for demolition. She stated her intention is to build quickly.

Commissioner Tomkins inquired there was a timeframe in which an applicant must demolish after approval.

Senior Planner Khan responded the condition of approval includes a 30 day period for salvage opportunities and occurs on a date the property owner chooses to open up the home. Once the City gets notification and proof that this condition is complete the applicant can go to Building and Safety for a demolition permit and then they have six months to demolish.

Commissioner Kercheval commented he appreciates Ms. Moreno's desire to build something nice and that she is going through the right processes. He asked about the plans for the future home.

Ms. Moreno stated her husband did the plans for the home initially because of architect costs.

Chair Gallivan closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Kercheval commented that this is not the typical demolition situation because the home is not in a historic district; he feels the owner is doing her due diligence and plans to build a nice home in its place. He noted the home doesn't meet any criteria to keep from demolition and asked if any other commissioners feel a need to fight for this home.

Commissioner Tomkins stated the home is not in a historic district so the owner has the right to replace the home.

Commissioner Kercheval wanted to inform the owner that the Commission is proceeding cautiously because they have had multiple situations where owners have demolished and left a vacant lot.

Commissioner Tomkins stated she feels this owner will follow through and build something and recommended she review her timeline as permits can take longer to be approved than people anticipate and you don't want to create problems.

Director Suarez stated there is a vacant lot ordinance that requires maintenance if they don't end up building; however staff will watch this item closely and provide a decision letter with expectations as it relates to the 30 day demolition application. He noted staff will also be available to advise on the architectural features of the neighborhood.

Commissioner Martin agrees with other Commissioners. She stated she appreciates the honesty of the applicant and encouraged her to think historic when designing and noted the neighborhood is all one-story.

Commissioner Kercheval spoke about the opportunity for salvage. He commented that the front door may be original door. The photo of the door was reviewed and discussion determined it was a newer door.

Chair Gallivan reiterated that there was a neighbor who expressed concerns about the future plans for the property and he wanted to ensure this persons voice was heard tonight.

Motion by Commissioner Martin, seconded by Commissioner Garcia, carried by a unanimous vote of the members present (6-0-0-1), to approve the Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 5264-2016) to allow the demolition of one single-family residence on a property located at 734 W. Eighth Street.

ITEM F-3

PUBLIC HEARING – MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 9130-2017) TO ALLOW A MAJOR ALTERATION TO THE REAR FAÇADE OF AN EXISTING SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE LOCATED AT 495 LINCOLN AVENUE.

Item continued from April 4, 2018.

Commissioner Tomkins recused herself because she lives within 500 feet of this project. She left the dais.

Associate Planner Ata Khan provided a staff report to allow a major alteration to the rear façade of an existing single-family residence located at 495 Lincoln Avenue in the Lincoln Park Historic District. He reviewed the properties location and stated it was in Council District 4, zoned R1-6000, an 11,800 square foot lot. He provided photos of property; front of residence with carport, backyard looking to the 2nd story, existing closed balcony, full home from the backyard, He reported the proposed remodel includes: façade improvements, siding on the first floor, closed balcony improved with a stucco exterior, removal of bottom siding, and a new roof with pitch to match the existing roof line. Key features include: built in 1922, indentified in the Historic Resource survey as contributing and marked as a prairie style home, it has original stucco exterior, low slope roof line, double hung sash windows with lights, Kingston windows, a side entrance and many details provided in the staff report. Notable work done with records includes: 2009 siding and boarding, 1987 legal enclosure of the 2nd floor balcony, 1984 re-roof, shingles, and late 1970's a 15x 15 patio cover. He provided a site plan and floor plan for the proposed major alteration (new master bath, shower, toilet and two windows). He displayed a rear elevation. He noted an error on the window schedule about sliders, the architect has corrected that to have hung windows to match the existing windows on the rear and the front of the residence. Showed the new roof line to match existing roof pitch.

Chair Gallivan invited the applicant to speak.

Jeremy Busacca and Emily Acevedo, the applicants spoke. Ms. Acevedo stated this is a project they have always wanted to do and now they are financially able. She reported that during recent rainfalls they have noticed leaking requiring minor repairs, prompting the project.

Commissioner Martin asked if there were windows on the previous top floor addition.

Mr. Busacca stated there is one small window that faces west that does not match the ones in the rest of the house. He noted there is a problem with ventilation in that bathroom and is another reason to install more windows.

Chair Gallivan asked who the architect was.

Ms. Acevedo responded Brian, uncertain of his last name and Danny Reynosa was the designer.

Chair Gallivan closed the public hearing.

Motion by Commissioner Martin, seconded by Commissioner Kercheval, carried by a unanimous vote of the members present (5-0-1-1), to approve the Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 9130-2017) to allow a major alteration to the rear façade of an existing single-family residence located at 495 Lincoln Avenue.

ITEM G:
NEW BUSINESS:

1. Selection of new Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson

Development Services Manager Stadnicki asked for nominations.

Commissioner Gomez nominated Jim Kercheval for Chair.

Commissioner Garcia stated Commissioner Kercheval brings a lot of expertise to the Commission on historical development and projects. He stated he appreciates Commissioner Martin's leadership and nominated Commissioner Martin.

Development Services Director Suarez clarified the nominations.

Discussion ensued as to the voting process about nominations, seconds and voting.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki reminded the Commissioners that each nomination requires a second.

Commissioner Tomkins seconded the nomination for Commissioner Kercheval

The Commissioners placed votes for Commissioner Kercheval as Chair.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki asked for a second for Commissioner Garcia's nomination.

Chair Gallivan seconded the nomination for Commissioner Martin as Chair.

The Commissioners placed votes for Commissioner Martin as Chair.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki and Director Suarez provided direction; stated since both votes were a tie and there wasn't a majority typically discussion ensues and then a revote.

Development Services Director Suarez noted sometimes this decision is based on seniority or the two interested parties come to an amicable come to an agreement because there are two open positions.

Commissioner Tomkins stated the Commissioner Kercheval had served in the past, years ago on the Historic Preservation Commission and that Debra has tons of experience, so they would both make excellent Chairs.

Commissioner Kercheval stated he is fine being Vice Chair, and offered the position to Commissioner Martin.

Commissioner Martin requested to flip a coin because she feels they are truly equal colleagues.

Chair Gallivan stated the because of terms they would both have the opportunity to be Chair.

Commissioner Martin asked Commissioner Kercheval to call the coin and a staff member to flip the coin.

Commissioner Kercheval called “heads”.

Development Services Suarez reported the coin flip resulted in “tails”.

Development Services Director Suarez stated one more nomination, second and a vote to make the Chair position official.

Development Services manager Stadnicki clarified that Commissioner Kercheval lost the coin toss so they need one more vote (the final vote), someone nominating and seconding Commissioner Martin as Chair.

Motion by Commissioner Tomkins, seconded by Commissioner Kercheval, carried by a unanimous vote of the members present (6-0-0-1), to approve the assignment of Commissioner Debra Martin as Historic Preservation Commission Chair.

Commissioner Martin nominated Commissioner Kercheval for Vice Chair, seconded by Commissioner Gomez

Commissioner Kercheval nominated Commissioner Gomez for Vice Chair, seconded by Commissioner Garcia.

The Commissioners placed votes for Commissioner Kercheval as Vice-Chair.

Motion by Commissioner Martin, seconded by Commissioner Gomez, carried by a majority vote of the members present (4-2-0-1), to approve the assignment of Commissioner Jim Kercheval as Historic Preservation Commission Vice-Chair.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki stated there is now a definitive answer, therefore they will not move forward with Commissioner Kercheval’s motion.

ITEM H:
DISCUSSION:

1. Lincoln Park ADA Access and Pedestrian Supporting Improvement Project Update

Commissioner Tomkins recused herself because her personal residence is within 500 feet of the Park. She stated she will participate as a member of the audience.

City Engineer Guerrero gave a presentation with an update of the Lincoln Park project. He stated the project includes ADA accessibility and pedestrian supportive improvements (curb ramps, new crosswalk striping and stop sign) to Lincoln Park and specific intersections listed, along with Plaza improvements and the potential replacement of the entire Park irrigation system. He displayed a timeline of meetings and stated on July 10, 2017 City Council unanimously approved the Historic Preservation Commission’s recommendation for The Minimalist Collaborative Plan. He noted the

stop sign will control north and south bound traffic on Palomares. He displayed the plan for Plaza improvements to include replacing the existing uplifting concrete with decomposed granite and adding a picnic table that is ADA accessible. He stated the decision to install a new irrigation system will depend on the bids vs. the budget. He reported they have released the notice inviting bids which are due back from the contractors on May 30, 2018. He spoke about the expected timeline; he anticipates going before City Council in July 2018 to recommend an award of contract to the selected vendor, issuing the notice to proceed in September 2018 (construction will begin) and completion in January 2019.

Chair Gallivan spoke about being an ongoing proponent of the oak tree plaza area. He expressed concerns that the City Arborist has not been involved in the project to oversee the care of the tree. He stated the plan before him does detail specifics about the tree, therefore there needs to be communication between the Historic Preservation Commission and the Arborist to ensure the issues relative to the oak tree are addressed and all the previous work isn't lost. He mentioned hand removed blocks and the type of decomposed granite as an example.

City Engineer Guerrero reminded the Commission that these concerns were brought forward previously so the City contracted with a third party arborist who helped with the design of these plans and is still active with the project. He stated the City Arborist, Mr. Michael Sledd, was hired at end of the planning process and will not be incorporated into the decision making process at this time but rather take an observers role because this will be his park to manage and maintain.

Chair Gallivan spoke about getting a second opinion and expressed further concern for the oak tree being blocked off the base of the tree increasing the chances of root rot and water build up and the need for a drain. He stated he wants to make sure the finer details and the Commissions expertise is communicated to the outside arborist.

City Engineer Guerrero stated he understands Chair Gallivan's concerns but unfortunately the budget limits contracting multiple arborists. He stated staff noted the Commission's concerns during planning meetings and feel comfortable in the hiring of the third party arborist who will be on board observing the construction.

Chair Gallivan commented he does not want to see any surprises and would appreciate if there was communication with the arborist.

City Engineer Guerrero responded he doesn't want surprise changes either; the plans provided reflect what was as discussed and recommended by this body and approved by City Council. He expressed concerns that further recommendations while the project is active could impact the very limited budget.

Chair Gallivan spoke about the City Council having other ideas and spoke about providing input that was ignored.

Commissioner Martin spoke about Chair Gallivan concerns, stating his biggest concern is the hardening agent used around the tree which can create drainage issues for the oak tree.

City Engineer Guerrero responded a sealant will be used for that decomposed granite as they are addressing ADA accessibility; however, this is not the first time hearing these concerns so they have

sought guidance from the third party arborist as to what sealant can or cannot be used around the oak tree. He noted the base bid for this project, does not include the new irrigation system, so the City has listed it as an additive alternate in the bid request to get pricing from various contractors and compare with available budget.

Chair Gallivan commented that the oak trees really should not be watered. He stated that he appreciates that the ADA part is coming along so quickly.

City Engineer Guerrero noted Chair Gallivan's concerns and stated staff look forward to getting the project started and completed.

Commissioner Martin thanked Meg McWade, Public Works Director, for her hard work.

ITEM I:
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION COMMUNICATION:

Chair Gallivan spoke about a time change in the bylaws for meeting from 5:00-6:30 p.m. to 7:00 p.m. and inquired if the new bylaws are being worked on. He stated he handed out a list of action items that everyone can be discussing and working on for forward progress.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki stated they will make the change and the bylaws are being worked on.

Chair Gallivan asked for and updated on the list of historic homes on Park Street that was missing Casa Primera.

Senior Planner Khan responded that the resource sheet provided for 1634 N. Park presentation was an excerpt from the 1993 survey; however in addition staff has a master list of historic properties which includes Casa Primera.

Development Services Director Suarez offered a copy of the complete list to the Commissioners.

Commissioner Garcia commented that the language for "Casa Primera" is backwards. In Spanish it should be La Primera a Casa. He stated for future naming and to be accurate with the Spanish style this should be considered.

Chair Gallivan stated he emailed a list of action items to staff and commissioners so as time goes by these items can be addressed.

Development Services Director Suarez confirmed they did receive the list and the HPC tree sub-committees citizen input with two tree issues.

Commissioner Martin inquired if Chair Gallivan added the items they discussed.

Chair Gallivan responded that the list also needed to include Ganesha Park and Civic Center to be historically designated, nationally. He noted that part of the Commission's charter is to go after designations; therefore this is an important priority for the protection of historic places within Pomona. He reported that the online version of resolution 2000-72 (the Tree Ordinance) is missing a page, specifically page 4 which includes information about what type of Certificate of Appropriateness you need for cutting down an oak tree. He stated he turned in person, about three weeks ago, for cutting down an oak tree in a historical district and when he followed up there wasn't any record of it but staff said they would go and take a look at that today at 203 Garfield.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki will check on the oak tree and report back.

Commissioner Tomkins asked if the YMCA tree removal is coming before the Commission.

Chair Gallivan stated that never showed up as a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki responded that she believes this item is coming forward to the Commission for review.

Chair Gallivan commented they will see an item from the YMCA for a Certificate for the façade. He shared he was a presenter on behalf of the Historical Society of Southern California for the process to get the Civic Center designated. He commented there was a lot of good input and some were insisting on national designation because of the importance of the buildings.

Commissioner Martin thanked Jim Gallivan for being Chair the last year and half. She stated as the new Chair she is open to suggestions.

Chair Gallivan thanked all the Commissioners and expressed his appreciation for the City staff.

ITEM J:
DEVELOPMENT SERVICES MANAGER COMMUNICATION:

1. Minor Certificate of Appropriateness – January 2018 through April 2018.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki reported the Certificates from January which were missing at the last meeting are included this month to make a complete list. She reported four more positions will be added to the Planning Division and they look forward to being able to do more historic preservation work.

Chair Gallivan noticed that Spectra Co. was approved under a minor for a restore and repair of masonry on the exterior structure, he inquired what was happening.

Development Services Manager Stadnicki stated they provided a thorough application that included procedures and products. She noted they are familiar with the historic standards so staff approved.

ADJOURNMENT:

Chair Gallivan adjourned the meeting at 8:30 p.m. to the next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission on June 6, 2018, in the City Council Chambers.

Emily Stadnicki
Development Services Manager

Jessica Thorndike, Transcriber

The minutes of this meeting are filed in the Planning Division of City Hall, located 505 South Garey Avenue, Pomona, CA, 91766.