



CITY OF POMONA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

DATE: June 5, 2019

TO: Historic Preservation Commission (HPC)

FROM: Planning Division

SUBJECT: MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 11397-2019)

Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 11397-2019) to allow for the demolition of four (4) pre-1945 single family residences on a property located at 961, 955, 953, 949 E. Phillips Blvd.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission, after providing further clarification on historical significance of structure D, adopt the attached resolution (Attachment 1) with additions from the Commission, denying Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 11397-2019) to allow for the demolition of four (4) pre-1945 single family residences on a property located at 961, 955, 953, 949 E. Phillips Blvd.

PROPERTY & APPLICANT INFORMATION

Address	961, 955, 953, 949 E. Phillips Blvd.
Assessor's Parcel Number (APN)	8333-031-013
Lot Size	38,777 s.f. (0.89 acres)
General Plan Land Use Designation	Residential Neighborhood
Zoning District	R-2
Historic District	None
Specific Plan	None
City Council District	3
Applicant	Harry Shang
Property Owner	Yongzhi Wan

RELATED ACTIONS

Historic Preservation Commission	None
Code Enforcement	None
Planning	None

BACKGROUND

On April 3, 2019, the Historic Preservation Commission held a public hearing and considered all pertinent testimony and discussed in detail the request to demolish the four structures in question (Attachment 2). The Commission ultimately requested staff to continue the item to the next regular hearing on June 5, 2019 and return with a recommendation to deny the request for demolition of all four structures. However, after reviewing the minutes, there is insufficient evidence to support the findings for structure D (961 E. Phillips Blvd.), therefore staff seeks further direction from the Commission on what features of the home provide historical significance (Attachment 3).

Additionally, subsequent to the closing of the public hearing additional information was submitted by the applicant in the form of a Historic Peer Review report, dated May 9, 2019, analyzing the historic significance of the subject structures. The report was prepared by Carrie Chasteen, MS of Sapphos Environmental, Inc. (Attachment 4).

APPLICABLE CODE SECTIONS

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, *“all applications for demolition of structures built prior to 1945 submitted to the building division shall be considered by Pomona historic preservation commission for a certificate of appropriateness even if the structure is not a designated landmark.”* Furthermore, a public hearing notice was not sent out since this item was continued to a definite date from prior public hearing. In making a determination, the Historic Preservation Commission *“shall first consider if the property would likely meet the criteria used in historic landmark designation thus deeming it of historical significance,”* and if so, *“then a structure would be denied a certificate of appropriateness for demolition unless it meets the criteria for economic hardship.”*

ANALYSIS

Historic Landmark Designation Criteria

Of the four structures located on the subject site, only two were identified in the City of Pomona’s 1993 Historic Resources Inventory Survey (Survey), 949 and 961 E. Phillips Blvd. The Survey identified 949 E. Phillips Blvd. as a “Building that does not contribute to the historic streetscape because it has been altered too much” as well as an “Altered building that could become a contributing building if the alterations were reversed.” The Survey identified 961 E. Phillips Blvd. as a “Building which does not possess architectural character.” However, the Commission disagreed with the assessments identified in the Survey and expressed numerous reasons why the structures held historical significance.

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Commission shall first consider if the property would likely meet the following criteria used in historic landmark designation:

949 E. Phillips Blvd. (Structure A)

Criteria	Analysis
<i>It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or natural history;</i>	The Commissioners find that the porch, sidings, eaves underneath the roof and windows are original. In addition, much of the interior of the home such as flooring and moldings have been kept intact. The Commissioners also emphasized that the structure could be contributing once the front porch was modified and that the original condition of the home reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's aesthetic and architectural history.
<i>It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship</i>	The Commissioners find the home to be distinct in that the front fascia boards angled out, adding an "Asian flare" to the home. The original windows and the window to the attic also added a distinct characteristic to the style of Craftsman home. Though "not wholeheartedly craftsman," one Commissioner believed that the home was a transition from Victorian to Craftsman. The Commissioners also noted that the home is 109 years old.
<i>It embodies elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation;</i>	The Commissioners find that the original state of the exterior and interior of the home is historically significant and holds enough craftsmanship indicative of Craftsman Bungalow homes.

In summary, the Commissioners find that 949 E. Phillips Blvd. was historically significant in that the home held its original style and material. The original condition of the interior and exterior of the home, and it's potential to become a contributing structure once alterations were reversed make this structure historically significant.

953 E. Phillips Blvd. (Structure B)

Criteria	Analysis
<i>It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or</i>	The Commissioners find that the interior fireplace located within the living room to be of significance. The Commissioners' opinion is that the images of covered wagons on the fireplace could possibly reflect special elements of the City of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, or natural

<i>natural history;</i>	history.
<i>It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;</i>	The Commissioners find that the home exhibits distinctive characteristics of Tudor architectural style, such as the steeply pitched, side-gabled roof and the tall narrow multi-pane windows. The chimney of the home was also considered to be distinctive and most of the interior fixtures and kitchen appear to be in original condition.

The Commissioners have noted that the interior fireplace, original kitchen, and the original interior condition of the home to be of historical significance. The Commissioners have noted that the features of the home such as the chimney, interior fireplace, and Tudor-type architectural style brought distinctive characteristics to this home.

955 E. Phillips Blvd. (Structure C)

Criteria	Analysis
<i>It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;</i>	The Commissioners find that much of the interior of the home has been kept intact, the interior exhibits beautiful mouldings, and that the interior kitchen and doors seem to be of original materials.

Based on the Commissioner's previous findings, staff finds 955 E. Phillips Blvd. to be of historical significance because much of the interior structure, finishes, and mouldings appear to be original.

961 E. Phillips Blvd. (Structure D)

After reviewing the minutes, staff found insufficient findings of historical significance for 961 E. Phillips Blvd. Staff is requesting that the Commission provide further guidance and/or findings regarding the historical significance of 961 E. Phillips Blvd.

PUBLIC NOTICING

On February 28, 2019, a public hearing notice was sent to the applicant, posted at the subject site, and mailed to all owners of property located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject site. Per section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, demolitions of pre-1945 structures require a thirty (30) day notice to all property owners directly adjacent to, or directly across the street prior to the date of the commission public hearing. On February 28, 2019 a public hearing notice was also sent to all local historical groups and HPC

commissioners and was published in the Inland Valley Daily Bulletin on March 2, 2019. Further public noticing materials were not sent for June 5, 2019 hearing as the item has been continued from previous public hearing. As of date, Planning has received no inquiries about possible relocation of the structures.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Pursuant to California Environmental Quality Act, Article 5, Section 15061(b)(4), a project is exempt from CEQA when the project will be rejected or disapproved by a public agency. In this case, the Historic Preservation Commission has recommended the project for denial and therefore CEQA does not apply.

CONCLUSION

In summary, staff is requesting that the Commission provide further guidance and/or findings regarding the historical significance of 961 E. Phillips Blvd so that the findings for denial may be met, pursuant to the Commission's direction at the April, 3, 2019 public hearing. If the Commission wants to move forward with denial of all four structures, additional information for the findings of structure D can be provided at the June 5, 2019 Commission meeting. However, in light of the additional information submitted, if the Commission would like to re-consider its recommendation or discuss the report, the item would need to be re-noticed for a new public hearing as the previous public hearing was closed.

Respectfully submitted by:

Anita D. Gutierrez, AICP
Development Services Director

Prepared by:

Eunice Im, AICP
Assistant Planner

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1) Draft HPC Resolution
- 2) Staff Report and Attachments for April 3, 2019 HPC Hearing
- 3) Historic Peer Review by Sapphos Environmental, Inc.
- 4) Draft HPC Minutes for April 3, 2019

HPC RESOLUTION NO.

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF POMONA, CALIFORNIA DENYING MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 011397-2019) TO ALLOW FOR THE DEMOLITION OF FOUR PRE-1945 SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCES LOCATED AT 961, 955, 953 AND 949 EAST PHILLIPS BOULEVARD.

THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF POMONA DOES RESOLVE AS FOLLOWS:

WHEREAS, Harry Shang, has submitted an application for Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 011397-2019) to allow for the demolition of four single family residences located at 961, 955, 953 and 949 East Phillips Boulevard (APN: 8333-031-013);

WHEREAS, available records indicate that the structures were constructed in 1910, 1923, 1925, and 1924, respectively;

WHEREAS, the City of Pomona's Historic Resources Inventory prepared in 1993 by Diane Marsh, identifies 949 E. Phillips Blvd. and 961 E. Phillips Blvd., in its survey of East Phillips Boulevard;

WHEREAS, in accordance with Section .5809-13.F.8b, all property owners directly adjacent to the site were notified of the application on February 28, 2019, no less than thirty days before consideration by the Historic Preservation Commission;

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission must make findings as described in Section .5809-13.F.8 of the Pomona Zoning Ordinance (PZO) to approve Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 011397-2019) for the demolition of any structure constructed before 1945;

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Pomona, has, after giving notice thereof as required by law, held a public hearing on April 3, 2019 concerning the requested Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 011397-2019); and

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission has carefully considered all pertinent testimony and the staff report offered in the case presented at the public hearing on April 3, 2019.

WHEREAS, Historic Preservation Commission directed staff at the April 3, 2019 hearing to draft recommendations for denial and closed the public hearing.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT HEREBY RESOLVED by the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Pomona, California, as follows:

SECTION 1. Pursuant to California Environmental Quality Act, Article 5, Section 15061(b)(4), a project is exempt from CEQA when the project will be rejected or disapproved by a public agency. In this case, the Historic Preservation Commission has recommended the project for denial and therefore CEQA does not apply.

SECTION 2. Section .5809-13.F.6 of the PZO requires the Historic Preservation Commission to determine whether all onsite structures meet any of the criteria for designation as a local historic landmark before approving a Major Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition of pre-1945 structures. The Historic Preservation Commission hereby finds as follows:

949 E. Phillips Blvd (Structure A)

- a. *The structure exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or natural history;*

The Commissioners find that the porch, sidings, eaves underneath the roof and windows are original. In addition, much of the interior of the home such as flooring and moldings have been kept intact. The Commissioners also emphasized that the structure could be contributing once the front porch was modified and that the original condition of the home reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's aesthetic and architectural history.

- b. *It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;*

The Commissioners find the home to be distinct in that the front fascia boards angled out, adding an "Asian flare" to the home. The original windows and the window to the attic also added a distinct characteristic to the style of Craftsman home. Though "not wholeheartedly craftsman," one Commissioner believed that the home was a transition from Victorian to Craftsman. The Commissioners also noted that the home is 109 years old.

- c. *The structure embodies elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation;*

The Commissioners find that the original state of the exterior and interior of the home is historically significant and holds enough craftsmanship indicative of Craftsman Bungalow homes.

953 E. Phillips Blvd. (Structure B)

- a. *The structure exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or natural history;*

Commissioners find that the interior fireplace located within the living room to be of significance. The Commissioners' opinion is that the images of covered wagons on the fireplace could possibly reflect special elements of the City of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, or natural history.

- b. It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;*

The Commissioners find that the home exhibits distinctive characteristics of Tudor architectural style, such as the steeply pitched, side-gabled roof and the tall narrow multi-pane windows. The chimney of the home was also considered to be distinctive and most of the interior fixtures and kitchen appear to be in original condition.

955 E. Phillips Blvd. (Structure C)

- a. It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;*

The Commissioners find that much of the interior of the home has been kept intact, the interior exhibits beautiful mouldings, and that the interior kitchen and doors seem to be of original materials.

SECTION 3. The Historic Preservation Commission hereby finds the structures identified as 955, 953 and 949 East Phillips Boulevard to be of historic significance and therefore deny the Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 011397-2019) to allow for the demolition of four single family residences located at 961, 955, 953 and 949 East Phillips Boulevard (APN: 8333-031-013)

SECTION 4. The Secretary shall certify to the adoption of this Resolution and forward the original to the City Clerk.

APPROVED AND PASSED THIS 5th DAY OF JUNE, 2019.

DEBRA MARTIN,
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CHAIRPERSON

ATTEST:

ANITA D. GUTIERREZ, AICP
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION SECRETARY

STATE OF CALIFORNIA)
COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES)
CITY OF POMONA)

AYES:
NOES:
ABSTAIN:
ABSENT:

Pursuant to Resolution No. of the City of Pomona, the time in which judicial review of this action must be sought is governed by California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.6.