



CITY OF POMONA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION

COMMISSION

DATE: January 15, 2020

TO: Historic Preservation Commission (HPC)

FROM: Planning Division

SUBJECT: **MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 12537-2019)**
Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 12537-2019) to allow for the demolition of a pre-1945 single-family residence on a property located at 650 W. Grand Ave.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) adopt the attached resolution (Attachment 1) approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 12537-2019) to allow the demolition of a single-family residence located at 650 W. Grand Ave., subject to conditions.

PROPERTY & APPLICANT INFORMATION

Address	650 W. Grand Ave.
Assessor's Parcel Number (APN)	8343-005-019
Lot Size	33,811 s.f. (0.78 acres)
General Plan Land Use Designation	Residential Neighborhood
Zoning District	R-2-PD Low Density Multiple Family Zone – Planning Development (PD) Overlay
Historic District	None
Specific Plan	None
City Council District	2
Applicant	Yan Ling Wang
Property Owner	Yan Ling Wang

RELATED ACTIONS

Historic Preservation Commission	None
Code Enforcement	None
Planning	PREAPP-9304-2018 – Development of five (5) duplex and one (1) single condominium, completed November 29, 2018.

BACKGROUND

On September 2019, the applicant submitted an application for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to request the demolition of a single-family residence with an estimated construction date of 1910, per Los Angeles County Assessor data. The site is located within the R-2-PD Low Density Multiple Family and Planned Development (PD) Overlay Zones. It is located north of West Phillips Blvd., south of West Grand Ave., east of South White Ave, and west of South Park Ave. (Attachment 2). The applicant intends to demolish the residence and develop five (5), two-story duplexes, and one two-story (1) detached unit, totaling 11 units on site (Attachment 3). The new development will consist of Craftsman Bungalow architecture, and exhibit many of the architectural elements of the original residence on-site.

Prior to the submittal of the application for this Major Certificate of Appropriateness request, the applicant submitted a pre-application for the development of five (5) duplex and one (1) detached unit on site. Staff completed its review of the pre-application and provided the applicant with comments on November 29, 2018, which included the need to obtain a Major COA to demolish the subject residence.

APPLICABLE CODE SECTIONS

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, *“all applications for demolition of structures built prior to 1945 submitted to the building division shall be considered by Pomona historic preservation commission for a certificate of appropriateness even if the structure is not a designated landmark.”* Furthermore, a public hearing notice must be sent *“to the applicants and property owners of the nominated property and all property owners directly adjacent to, or directly across the street from the site at least 30 days prior to the date of the commission public hearing”* and *“legal notice shall be provided at least ten days prior to the public hearing in a newspaper of local circulation.”* In making a determination, the Historic Preservation Commission *“shall first consider if the property would likely meet the criteria used in historic landmark designation thus deeming it of historical significance,”* and if so, *“then a structure would be denied a certificate of appropriateness for demolition unless it meets the criteria for economic hardship.”*

ANALYSIS

Description of Residence

The City of Pomona’s Historic Resources Inventory conducted by Diane Marsh in May 1993 identified 650 W. Grand Ave. as a single family residential, Craftsman Bungalow styled home, built approximately in 1910. It is further described as being in “good” condition with “few” additions and alterations. The property is succinctly described with “frames on porch” and identified as “C,” which indicates that the structure contributes to the historic streetscape. The dwelling is identified as not eligible for local landmark status, not eligible for listing in the California Register of Historic Resources, nor eligible for listing in the National Register of

Historic Places (Attachment 4).

The single-story craftsman home sits on a large lot of 33,811 square feet. The home features a large covered front porch made of horizontal wood sidings and wooden frame. The roof is both pitched and front gabled with overhanging eaves and exposed rafters. The pitched, front gabled roof indicates ample attic storage space as depicted by the single-paned casement window flanked by wooden louver slats designed as vents. The upper exterior of the home is wrapped by wood shingles, and the home consists of double hung, wooden framed windows, while the front door is characterized by multi-pane windows on top. The structure also has clapboard sidings typical of Craftsman Bungalow, and the foundation of the home is composed of rock base (Attachment 5).

Building Permit History

Staff has completed a review of all building permit history on file with the Building and Safety Division. Staff was unable to identify the building permits for the original construction of the homes. However, the following building permits were identified:

Building permit history	
650 W. Grand Ave.	Plumbing, installation of sewer – 9/19/1930 Reshingle house roof – 5/31/1939 Gas Installation – 2/19/1946 Reroof with composition shingles – 10/20/1948 Lighting meter – 7/24/1953 Electrical permit – 8/23/1966 Concrete slab for boat and ramp – 7/13/1998 Repairing existing footing – 12/19/2013

The Los Angeles County Assessor's (Assessor) records indicate that the dwelling is 1,000 square feet in size, with two bedrooms and one bath. However, a more recent building permit issued in 1998 include schematic drawings that show the property is 1,326 square feet in size, which indicates an additional 326 square feet of unpermitted living space.

Historical Significance per City Directory and Resource

Staff has reviewed the City Directory available at the Pomona Public Library to identify any persons associated with these properties who may have made significant contribution to local, state, or national history. Staff has found the following people lived at the address from the following City directories (Attachment 6):

<i>Name</i>	<i>Occupation</i>	<i>Year of Residence</i>
James A. Cline	Carpenter	1911
James Sweet	Rancher	1914
Otto Chas	Manager	1916

Uncus Scales	<i>Unlisted</i>	1919
Sarah Scales (wid.)	<i>Unlisted</i>	1922
Geo W Brindle (Lula)	<i>Unlisted</i>	1924-1934
John Arnold	Gardener	1937
Pedro Camacho	<i>Unlisted</i>	1951

Staff has further reviewed the following City resources and books to evaluate the historical significance of the people identified in the City Directory and no historical significance was found.

City Resources and Books	Research
24 th Annual Pomona Heritage Home Tour	No historical significance found.
28 th Annual Pomona Heritage Home Tour	No historical significance found.
Pomona Centennial History by Pomona Centennial-Bicentennial Committee	No historical significance found.
Pomona Centennial History by Gloria Ricci Lothrop	No historical significance found.
History of Pomona Valley California with Biographical Sketches	No historical significance found.
Sanborne Maps (1959)	No historical significance found.

Historic Landmark Designation Criteria

The subject residence was identified in the City of Pomona's 1993 Historic Resources Inventory Survey as a contributing structure that contributes to the historic streetscape of the city because it is over 50 years old and still possesses its architectural integrity and character. The structure is not listed as a potential candidate for local, state, or national landmark status. Staff has determined that the structure is not identified with persons or events significant in local history and would not meet the historic landmark designation criteria as listed below.

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Commission shall first consider if the property would likely meet the following criteria used in historic landmark designation:

Criteria	Analysis
<i>It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or natural history;</i>	The City of Pomona Historic Resources Survey did identify 650 W. Grand Ave. as a Craftsman Bungalow home that contributes to the historic streetscape. While the structure hold architectural integrity as assessed by Diane Marsh in 1993, it does not hold architectural standards that exemplifies special elements of Pomona's history. Further, the streetscape has changed significantly since 1993 when the survey was conducted. Several residential developments have been constructed along Grand Ave. in

	recent years, including an eight-unit single family development on the adjacent property to the east. In addition, the structure is not eligible for local landmark status, not eligible for listing in the California Register of Historic Resources, nor eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Furthermore, the structures also do not exemplify any special elements of the City's history according to research conducted through the City directories and literature.
<i>It is identified with persons or events significant in local, state, or national history;</i>	As mentioned previously, staff's research of City directories and literature did not indicate that the structure can be identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.
<i>It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;</i>	There are no indications of distinctive method of construction used on the structure, or of any indigenous materials or craftsmanship used in the construction. The existence of a Craftsman bungalow is not unique or unexpected given that there are ample examples of this architectural style throughout the City of Pomona and the material used in the construction are standard and applicable to the period of construction.
<i>It contributes to the significance of a historic area, being a geographically definable area possessing a concentration of historic or scenic properties or thematically related grouping of properties which contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by plan or physical development;</i>	The structure is located approximately one mile from the Wilton Heights Historic District, and the area surrounding the property does not possess a unifying character and does not have a concentration of related historic or scenic properties. Further, the streetscape has changed significantly since 1993 when the survey was conducted. Several residential developments have been constructed along Grand Ave. in recent years, including an eight-unit single family development on the adjacent property to the east.
<i>It is the work of a notable builder, designer, landscape designer or architect;</i>	The subject structure was built in approximately 1910 and the builder could not be identified. Staff's research did not identify evidence of any involvement with a noted architect, builder, designer, or person with exemplary talents.
<i>It has a unique location or singular physical characteristics or is a view or vista representing</i>	The structure is located on West Grand Ave. which is an urbanized area of the City. Further, the streetscape has changed significantly since 1993 when the survey was

<i>an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the city of Pomona;</i>	conducted. Several residential developments have been constructed along Grand Ave. in recent years, including an eight-unit single family development on the adjacent property to the east. Surrounding land uses are newer multi-family housing, and single-family residences. There are no unique characteristics or an established and familiar visual feature surrounding the subject property.
<i>It embodies elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation;</i>	The structure does not possess significant architectural character, and does not possess any distinguishing details, structural and architectural innovations. There are ample examples of Craftsman Bungalow architecture throughout the City of Pomona and the subject structure is not considered a “prime example” of this architectural style.
<i>It is similar to other distinctive properties, sites, areas, or objects based on an historic, cultural, or architectural motif;</i>	The subject structure has not been found to be similar to distinctive properties, sites, or areas in the City, based on an historic, cultural, or architectural motif. The structure has been identified as Craftsman Bungalow; however, it is not considered a “prime example” of Craftsman bungalows and there are ample examples of Craftsman Bungalow architecture throughout the City of Pomona.
<i>It reflects significant geographical patterns, including those associated with different eras of settlement and growth, particular transportation modes, or distinctive examples of park or community planning;</i>	The subject structure does not reflect significant geographic patterns of settlement and growth. It is located in a neighborhood comprised of single-family and multi-family residential buildings of different eras. The site does not involve any structures associated with transportation, park or community planning. As previously mentioned, the streetscape along Grand Ave. has changed significantly since 1993 when the survey was conducted. Several residential developments have been constructed along Grand Ave. in recent years, including an eight-unit single family development on the adjacent property to the east.
<i>It is one of the few remaining examples in the city of Pomona, region, state, or nation possessing distinguishing characteristics or an architectural or historical type or specimen.</i>	The structure does not possess an architectural style or characteristic that distinguishes it from others of its kind. It is not one of few remaining examples of its architectural type in the City, the region, or the state. There are ample examples of Craftsman Bungalow architecture throughout the City of Pomona and the subject structure is not considered a “prime example” of this architectural style.

In addition, the applicant submitted a *Cultural Resource Investigation and Historic Property Evaluation* prepared by McKenna et al. for the subject residence. The report analyzed the historical significance of residence based upon the eligibility criteria at each level of evaluation (federal, state, regional, and local), including the National Register of Historic Places and the California Register of Historical Resources as a California Landmark, a California Point of Historical Interest, and of a locally significant resource. The report also emphasized the lack of architectural integrity for the residence based upon the National Park Services' seven aspects of integrity: location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association. The report determined the subject residence to meet only two of the seven elements of integrity, and that it fails to maintain the required level of integrity needed to be considered for recognition as a significant historical resource (Attachment 7). To address the loss of the residence, staff has added condition of approval to extend relocation opportunities for the residence, and to require the new development to exhibit similar architectural elements as the existing residence.

PUBLIC NOTICING

Per section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, demolitions of pre-1945 structures require a thirty (30) day notice to all property owners directly adjacent to, or directly across the street prior to the date of the commission public hearing. On December 12, 2019, public hearing notice was posted at the subject site, and on December 14, 2019, public hearing notices were sent to the applicant, mailed to all owners and tenants of properties located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject site, and to all local historical groups and HPC Commissioners. In addition, the public hearing notice was published in the Inland Valley Daily Bulletin on December 18, 2019. As of date, staff has received no inquiries about possible relocation of the structures.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Pursuant to the Guidelines for Implementation of the Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the proposed project meets the criteria for a Class 1, Section 15301 Categorical Exemption in that the project involves the demolition and removal of duplex or similar multifamily residential structure. In urbanized areas, this exemption applies to duplexes and similar structures where not more than six dwelling units will be demolished.

CONCLUSION

Although the structure located at 650 West Grand Boulevard was identified as a contributing Craftsman Bungalow to the historic streetscape, staff has determined that the existing Craftsman bungalow is not a prime architectural example nor does it hold historical significance for Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural or natural history based on the research conducted through the City directories and City literatures. The streetscape has changed significantly since 1993 when the survey was conducted, with several residential developments constructed along Grand Ave. in recent years, including an eight-unit single family development on the adjacent property to the east. The structure is not listed as a

potential candidate for local, state, or national landmark status in the 1993 Historic Resource Inventory Survey, and the Cultural Resource Investigation and Historic Property Evaluation submitted by the applicant concluded that the structure fails to maintain the required level of integrity needed to be considered for recognition as a significant historical resource. In summary, Staff has determined that the structure does not meet the historic landmark designation criteria and therefore, its demolition would not cause a potentially significant impact as a historic resource.

Respectfully submitted by:

Prepared by:

Anita D. Gutierrez, AICP
Development Services Director

Eunice Im, AICP
Assistant Planner

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1) Draft HPC Resolution
- 2) Location Map & Aerial Photo
- 3) Proposed 11-Unit Development
- 4) Historic Resources Inventory Form
- 5) Site Photographs
- 6) City Directories on 650 W. Grand Ave.
- 7) Cultural Resource Investigation and Historic Property Evaluation by McKenna et al.