



# CITY OF POMONA

## HISTORIC PRESERVATION

## COMMISSION

**DATE:** November 4, 2020

**TO:** Historic Preservation Commission (HPC)

**FROM:** Development Services Department, Planning Division

**SUBJECT:** **MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 13258-2020):**  
Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an existing deck area to accommodate an interior remodel and the construction of a 590 s.f. addition consisting of a new family room, laundry room, two bathrooms and 2nd story balcony. The request also includes demolishing an existing two-car garage and constructing a new 790 s.f. limited detached ADU (under a separate ministerial permit) on a property located at 420 E. Alvarado Street in the Lincoln Park Historic District.

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution (Attachment 1) approving a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 13258-2020) to allow the construction of a 590 s.f. addition on a property located at 420 E. Alvarado Street in the Lincoln Park Historic District, subject to findings and conditions of approval.

### PROPERTY & APPLICANT INFORMATION

<b>Address</b>	420 E. Alvarado Street
<b>Assessor's Parcel Number (APN)</b>	8337004-009
<b>Lot Size</b>	11,164 (0.26 acres)
<b>General Plan Land Use Designation</b>	Residential Neighborhood
<b>Zoning District</b>	R-1-6,000 Single Family Residential
<b>Historic District</b>	Lincoln Park Historic District
<b>Specific Plan</b>	N/A
<b>City Council District</b>	District 4
<b>Applicant</b>	Kevin Lee
<b>Property Owner</b>	JinBao Zhao & Yan Pan

## RELATED ACTIONS

<b>Historic Preservation Commission</b>	2009 – Major COA to replace 18 wood double hung windows with fibrex double hung, Denied.
<b>Code Enforcement</b>	N/A
<b>Building &amp; Safety</b>	1946 – 20’ x 20’ new garage. 1986 – Electrical permit. 1989 – Sewer & Plumbing permit. 1992 – Replace septic with sewer. 1994 – Termite damage repair. 1994 – Plumbing permit. 1994 – Foundation inspection. 2000 – Re-roof composition shingles. 2008 – 12’ 12’ concrete pier at rear of residence.
<b>Planning</b>	2000 - Minor COA to re-roof composition shingles. Approved. 2009 – Trim 10 trees. Approved. 2010 – Trim 15 trees. Approved. 2013- Trim 8 trees. Approved.

## BACKGROUND

A Major Certificate Appropriateness application has been submitted for the property located at 420 E. Alvarado Street, east of Palomares Street in the R-1-6,000 Single Family Residential Zone (Attachment 2). The property is currently developed with a 2,074 square-foot single-family home with a 130 square-foot porch, 85 square-foot deck and a detached 420 square-foot garage. The home is surrounded by single-family residences to the north, east, south and west. Photos of the home have been included for reference as Attachment 3.

Staff reviewed building permit records and found permits for plumbing, sewer, electrical, termite repair and a re-roof that were completed between 1986 to 2000. Staff also found a building permit for a major alteration, which consisted of the construction of a new garage in 1946. No building records were found for the original construction of the home; however, a review of records from the Los Angeles County Assessor’s Office indicates that the residence was constructed in 1911.

## SITE DESCRIPTION

The City of Pomona’s Lincoln Park Historic Survey identifies the architectural style of the residence as Craftsman and a contributor to the Lincoln Park Historic District (Attachment 4). The historic survey provides the following property description:

*“This attractive, clean-lined house is a beautiful example of the Craftsman Bungalow. The double-gabled roof lends visual interest to the front of the house and enhances the box-like gable roof line. Clapboard siding is present. Two large windows on the front porch are surrounded by broad window frames. The front door has the same broad frames. The front gable covers the front porch and is supported by squared wood columns at the corners. A fieldstone foundation supports the structure. D. H. and Belle are the first listed owners of this house built in 1911. He was a cement contractor.”*

*Photograph of home*



## **PROPOSED PROJECT**

The home has a prominent front porch with a low pedestal and columns above, a front gabled roof, two large fixed windows with wide casings, two prominent vents on the top of plate, and horizontal wood siding. The interior of the home consist of three bedrooms, two bathrooms, a living room, dining room, an office, two storage rooms, a breakfast nook and an outdoor deck area (Attachment 5). The proposed project consists of demolishing the existing deck area to accommodate an interior remodel and the construction of a 590 s.f. addition consisting of a new family room, laundry room,

and bathroom on the first story and a bathroom and balcony on the second story. The proposed project also includes demolishing an existing two-car garage and constructing a new detached 790 s.f. limited detached Accessory Dwelling Unit, which meets the criteria to be reviewed under a separate ministerial permit.

The proposed addition has been designed to complement the home in terms of materials, color and architectural detailing. The addition will include a shingled roof, a 6:12 roof pitch, the roof gable will be extended and will have an overall building height of 23'11". Moreover, the addition will carry the same exterior clapboard siding, wide window and door surrounds, thick fascia boards, fieldstone foundation; new wood casement, single hung, and sliding windows; a wood railing on the second story, large overhanging eaves, and open rafter tails.

## **APPLICABLE CODE SECTIONS**

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance (Historic Preservation), *Major projects shall include changes which significantly alter the following: height, proportions, the relationship of the building mass and space, roof shape, scale or distinctive facades of the structure. Examples of major projects shall include, but not be limited to room additions, adding dormers, expanding a garage, adding a porch, removing distinctive shutters or part or all of a structure. This category also includes demolition and/or replacement of primary use buildings or structures, and construction/installation of new buildings, structures, new public sidewalks, new public streetscape improvements, new street lamps, new public buildings and structures, and development of new public spaces within an historic district.*

The existing structure is located within the Lincoln Park Historic District, therefore a Major Certificate of Appropriateness is required for the proposed addition. Furthermore, the proposed project must be to consistent with the City of Pomona's 1999 Historic Design Guidelines and Secretary of Interior (SOI) Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties.

## **ANALYSIS**

### **Consistency with Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation) of the Zoning Ordinance**

Section .5809-13 of the Pomona Zoning Ordinance (PZO) requires that all certificates of appropriateness be reviewed for consistency with the standards contained in the code. As illustrated in Table 1, the addition is consistent with the standards contained in Section .5809-13 of the PZO.

**Table 1.** *Compliance with Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation)*

<b>Historic Preservation Design Review</b>			
<b>Design Criteria</b>	<b>Review</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
Height	Is the height and bulk compatible with surrounding structures and in conformance with maximum allowable height?	X	
Proportions of Windows and Doors	Are proportions and relationships between doors and windows compatible with the architectural style and character of surrounding structures?	X	
Relationship of Building Masses and Spaces	Are proposed structures and/or remodeled spaces and created spaces consistent with the shapes and setbacks of existing adjacent structures?	X	
Roof Shape	Is the design of the roof compatible with the architectural character and style of surrounding structures?	X	
Scale	Is the scale of the structure compatible with the architectural character and style of the existing building?	X	
Directional Expression/Facades	Are facades compatible with the dominant horizontal and vertical expression of surrounding structures?	X	
Architectural Details	Do architectural details like materials and textures make new construction compatible with the architectural style and character of the historic district?	X	
Architectural Rhythm and Articulation	Do proposed structures and façade remodeling show rhythmic repetition of architectural details for compatibility with façade articulation of existing adjacent buildings?	X	
New additions	When new additions and adjacent related new construction are removed, will essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment be impaired?	X	
Exterior mechanical equipment	Is the design, style, color and texture of the required screening method compatible with the existing or proposed building/façade design?	N/A	

### **Consistency with the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines**

The ideal preservation approach in the Design Guidelines states that new additions preserve the historic and architectural integrity of the existing building and that the individual features such as windows, doors, roof, siding, and foundation maintain the same characteristics as the existing. The proposed addition will have the same style, proportions, and materials as the existing residence. As previously analyzed, the proposed roof pitch will match the existing roof pitch on the main residence and the siding material will consist of clapboard siding and shingles. The new windows will complement the existing windows, and the addition will have open rafter tails to be consistent with the home. Lastly, the addition will also include fieldstone in the foundation of the home to maintain the consistency in architectural detailing of the home. Therefore, the proposed addition is consistent with the ideal preservation approach described in the Design Guidelines.

### **Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's (SOI) Standards**

The SOI Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties contains two standards that are directly related to additions and new construction. The standards are as follows:

*New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The proposed project has been designed to resemble the existing structure's architectural style and the materials will be compatible with the existing home in proportion and material. Siding of the new exterior will match the existing siding which is of clapboard siding and singles. The proposed roof pitch will match the existing 6:12 roof pitch and match the overall building height of the main residence, which is 23' 11" high. Further, the addition will have a second story balcony, which will differentiate from the old.

*New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

The proposed addition is designed in a manner that matches the existing form of the home by expanding the south elevation (rear) at a second-story height. As such, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would remain unimpaired. The proposed change will be compatible with the historic integrity of the Lincoln Park Historic District.

## **PUBLIC NOTICING**

On October 22, 2020, a public hearing notice was sent to the applicant and mailed to all owners and occupants of the property located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject site (Attachment 6). As of the writing of this report, no comments have been received.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

Pursuant to the Guidelines for Implementation of the Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the proposed project meets the criteria for a Class 1 Categorical Exemption (Existing Facilities), Section 15301(e)(1) in that the project will not result in an increase of more than fifty percent of the floor area of the structures before the addition.

## **CONCLUSION**

The proposed addition is consistent with the applicable standards and guidelines found in the Pomona Zoning Ordinance, Historic Preservation Guidelines and Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties. Therefore, staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 13258-2020), subject to conditions.

## **RECOMMENDED MOTION**

Staff recommends the following motion: Move that the Historic Preservation Commission close the public hearing, find that the project is categorically exempt pursuant to State and Local CEQA guidelines, and approve Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 13258-2020) per staff's recommendation, subject the findings and conditions included in the draft resolution.

Respectfully submitted,

Prepared by,

Anita D. Gutierrez, AICP  
Development Services Director

Lynda Lara  
Assistant Planner

## **ATTACHMENTS:**

- 1) Draft HPC Resolution
- 2) Location Map & Aerial Photo
- 3) Site Photos
- 4) Lincoln Park Historic Survey
- 5) Proposed Plans
- 6) Public Hearing Notice