



CITY OF POMONA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION

COMMISSION

DATE: December 2, 2020

TO: Historic Preservation Commission (HPC)

FROM: Planning Division

SUBJECT: **MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 14615-2020)**
Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 14615-2020) to allow for the demolition of a pre-1945 single-family residence on a property located at 1324 E. Kingsley Avenue.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) adopt the attached resolution (Attachment 1) approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 14615-2020) to allow the demolition of a single-family residence located at 1324 E. Kingsley Avenue.

PROPERTY & APPLICANT INFORMATION

Address	1324 E. Kingsley Avenue
Assessor's Parcel Number (APN)	8323-021-004
Lot Size	19,767 s.f. (0.45 acres)
General Plan Land Use Designation	Residential Neighborhood
Zoning District	R-3, Medium Density Multiple Family
Historic District	None
Specific Plan	None
City Council District	4
Applicant	Yuhui Li
Property Owner	Full Love Trust

RELATED ACTIONS

Historic Preservation Commission	None
Code Enforcement	No active or open cases.
Building and Safety	1937 – Plumbing permit for laundry tray 1944 – Install 550 gal private gasoline tank 1945 – Construction of private garage and machine shed 1947 – Build concrete block fireplace above

	dwelling 1950 – Plumbing/gas permit for ferry heating and appliance 1958 – Relocated one-story frame garage to new location 1990 – Repair barn per N.I.C.E. letter
Planning	CUP 2015 – Development of nine (9) townhomes with attached garages, deemed incomplete.

BACKGROUND

On September 2020, the applicant submitted an application for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to request the demolition of a single-family residence with an estimated construction date of 1916, per Los Angeles County Assessor data. The site is located within the R-3 Medium Density Multiple Family Zone. It is located south of East Kingsley Ave., north of East Holt Ave., east of N. Signal Dr., and west of Karesh Ave. (Attachment 2). The applicant intends to demolish the single family residence, an unpermitted unit, and a garage built in 1945, and develop nine (9) apartment units (Attachment 3). The unpermitted unit and the garage built in 1945 is not under the purview of this entitlement since illegal structures and structures built prior to 1945 is not considered.

Prior to the submittal of the application for this Major Certificate of Appropriateness request, the applicant submitted a Conditional Use Permit for the development of nine (9) units. Staff completed its review of the Conditional Use Permit and provided the applicant with comments on March 18, 2015, which included the need to obtain a Major COA to demolish the subject residence.

APPLICABLE CODE SECTIONS

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, “*all applications for demolition of structures built prior to 1945 submitted to the building division shall be considered by Pomona historic preservation commission for a certificate of appropriateness even if the structure is not a designated landmark.*” Furthermore, a public hearing notice must be sent “*to the applicants and property owners of the nominated property and all property owners directly adjacent to, or directly across the street from the site at least 30 days prior to the date of the commission public hearing*” and “*legal notice shall be provided at least ten days prior to the public hearing in a newspaper of local circulation.*” In making a determination, the Historic Preservation Commission “*shall first consider if the property would likely meet the criteria used in historic landmark designation thus deeming it of historical significance,*” and if so, “*then a structure would be denied a certificate of appropriateness for demolition unless it meets the criteria for economic hardship.*”

ANALYSIS

Description of Residence

The City of Pomona's Historic Resources Inventory conducted by Diane Marsh in October 1992 identified 1324 E. Kingsley Avenue as a single family residential, California Bungalow style home, built approximately in 1916. It is further described as being in "*good*" condition; however with "*major*" additions and alterations and the words "*stuccoed wood siding*" for description. The property is identified as "NA," which indicates that the building does not contribute to the historic streetscape because it has been altered too much. The dwelling is not identified as eligible for local landmark status, not eligible for listing in the California Register of Historic Resources, nor eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places (Attachment 4).

The single-story, 2,008 square foot California Bungalow sits on 19,767 square feet lot. The Los Angeles Tax Assessor's data indicates that the home consists of three bedroom and one bathroom. The home's facade features some horizontal wood sidings, wooden frame around the windows, and a red chimney. The roof is both pitched and front gabled. East of this primary structure is an unpermitted unit. No building permits nor information on the Tax Assessor's office can be found for the additional unit. Detached private garage and machine shed was permitted on February 9, 1945, and relocated on July 30, 1958 (Attachment 5).

Building Permit History

Staff has completed a review of all building permit history on file with the Building and Safety Division. Staff was unable to identify the building permits for the original construction of the homes. However, the following building permits were identified:

Building permit history	
1324 East Kingsley Avenue	Electrical installation – July 28, 1934 Plumbing for laundry tray – August 9, 1937 Install 550 private gasoline tank – January 22, 1944 Private garage and machine shed – February 9, 1945 Plumbing for water heater – May 4, 1945 Concrete block fireplace – September 15, 1947 Electrical permit – February 7, 1949 Gas installation for furnace – March 4, 1949 Gas installation for furnace – March 10, 1950 Relocating existing garage – July 30, 1958 Electrical permits – November 13, 1959 Repair barn – September 14, 1990

Historical Significance per City Directory and Resource

Staff has reviewed the City Directory available at the Pomona Public Library to identify any persons associated with these properties who may have made significant contribution to local, state, or national history. Staff has found the following people lived at the address from the following City directories (Attachment 6):

<i>Name</i>	<i>Occupation</i>	<i>Year of Residence</i>
MacDonald	<i>Unlisted</i>	1951
MacDonald	<i>Unlisted</i>	1948
Paul Shenefield	Dentist	1945
Paul Shenefield	Dentist	1940
Paul Shenefield	Dentist	1937-1938
Kroerner	<i>Unlisted</i>	1934
Kroerner	<i>Unlisted</i>	1931

Staff has further reviewed the following City resources and books to evaluate the historical significance of the people identified in the City Directory and no historical significance was found.

City Resources and Books	Research
24 th Annual Pomona Heritage Home Tour	No historical significance found.
28 th Annual Pomona Heritage Home Tour	No historical significance found.
Pomona Centennial History by Pomona Centennial-Bicentennial Committee	No historical significance found.
Pomona Centennial History by Gloria Ricci Lothrop	No historical significance found.
History of Pomona Valley California with Biographical Sketches	No historical significance found.
Sanborne Maps (1959)	No historical significance found.

Historic Landmark Designation Criteria

The subject residence was identified in the City of Pomona's 1992 Historic Resources Inventory Survey as a non-contributing structure that does not contribute to the historic streetscape of the city because it has been altered too much. The structure is not listed as a potential candidate for local, state, or national landmark status. Staff has determined that the structure is not identified with persons or events significant in local history and would not meet the historic landmark designation criteria as listed below.

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, the Historic Preservation Commission shall first consider if the property would likely meet the following criteria used in historic landmark designation:

Criteria	Analysis
<i>It exemplifies or reflects special elements of the city of Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural, or natural history;</i>	The City of Pomona Historic Resources Survey did not identify 1324 E. Kingsley Ave. as a California Bungalow home that contributes to the historic streetscape because it has been too altered. The structure is not eligible for local landmark status, not eligible for listing in the California Register of Historic Resources, nor eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Furthermore, the structures also do not exemplify any special elements of the City's history according to research conducted through the City directories and literature.
<i>It is identified with persons or events significant in local, state, or national history;</i>	As mentioned previously, staff's research of City directories and literature did not indicate that the structure can be identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.
<i>It embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period, or method of construction, or is a valuable example of the use of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;</i>	There are no indications of distinctive method of construction used on the structure, or of any indigenous materials or craftsmanship used in the construction. The existence of a California Bungalow is not unique or unexpected given that there are ample examples of this architectural style throughout the City of Pomona and the material used in the construction are standard and applicable to the period of construction.
<i>It contributes to the significance of a historic area, being a geographically definable area possessing a concentration of historic or scenic properties or thematically related grouping of properties which contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by plan or physical development;</i>	The structure is located approximately one mile east from the Lincoln Park Historic District, and the area surrounding the property does not possess a unifying character and does not have a concentration of related historic or scenic properties. There are several multi-family residential development surrounding the property.
<i>It is the work of a notable builder, designer, landscape designer or architect;</i>	The subject structure was built in approximately 1916 and the builder could not be identified. Staff's research did not identify evidence of any involvement with a noted architect, builder, designer, or person with exemplary talents.
<i>It has a unique location or</i>	The structure is located on East Kingsley Ave. which is an

<i>singular physical characteristics or is a view or vista representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the city of Pomona;</i>	urbanized area of the City. Surrounding land uses are multi-family housing and single-family residences. There are no unique characteristics or an established and familiar visual feature surrounding the subject property.
<i>It embodies elements of architectural design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant structural or architectural achievement or innovation;</i>	The structure does not possess significant architectural character, and does not possess any distinguishing details, structural and architectural innovations. There are ample examples of California Bungalow architecture throughout the City of Pomona and the subject structure is not considered a “prime example” of this architectural style.
<i>It is similar to other distinctive properties, sites, areas, or objects based on an historic, cultural, or architectural motif;</i>	The subject structure has not been found to be similar to distinctive properties, sites, or areas in the City, based on an historic, cultural, or architectural motif. The structure has been identified as California Bungalow; however, it is not considered a “prime example” of California Bungalows and there are ample examples of California Bungalow architecture throughout the City of Pomona.
<i>It reflects significant geographical patterns, including those associated with different eras of settlement and growth, particular transportation modes, or distinctive examples of park or community planning;</i>	The subject structure does not reflect significant geographic patterns of settlement and growth. It is located in a neighborhood comprised of single-family and multi-family residential buildings of different eras. The site does not involve any structures associated with transportation, park or community planning.
<i>It is one of the few remaining examples in the city of Pomona, region, state, or nation possessing distinguishing characteristics or an architectural or historical type or specimen.</i>	The structure does not possess an architectural style or characteristic that distinguishes it from others of its kind. It is not one of few remaining examples of its architectural type in the City, the region, or the state. There are ample examples of California Bungalow architecture throughout the City of Pomona and the subject structure is not considered a “prime example” of this architectural style.

In addition, there is an additional unit that has not been permitted, and a detached garage that has been built separately in 1945. Structures built on or after 1945 are not subject to demolition review by the Historic Preservation Commission.

PUBLIC NOTICING

Per section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance, public hearing notices were sent to the applicant, mailed to all owners and tenants of properties located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject site. In addition, the public hearing notice was published in the Inland Valley Daily Bulletin on November 2, 2020 (Attachment 7). As of date, staff has received no inquiries about possible relocation of the structures.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Pursuant to the Guidelines for Implementation of the Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the proposed project meets the criteria for a Class 1, Section 15301 Categorical Exemption in that the project involves the demolition and removal of duplex or similar multifamily residential structure. In urbanized areas, this exemption applies to duplexes and similar structures where not more than six dwelling units will be demolished.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the structure located at 1324 E. Kingsley Avenue was identified as a non-contributing California Bungalow to the historic streetscape. Staff has determined that the existing California Bungalow is not a prime architectural example nor does it hold historical significance for Pomona's cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, architectural or natural history based on the research conducted through the City directories and City literatures. The structure is not listed as a potential candidate for local, state, or national landmark status in the 1992 Historic Resource Inventory Survey. In summary, Staff has determined that the structure does not meet the historic landmark designation criteria and therefore, its demolition would not cause a potentially significant impact as a historic resource.

RECOMMENDED MOTION

Staff recommends the following motion:

- Move that the Historic Preservation Commission close the public hearing, find that the project is categorically exempt pursuant to State and Local CEQA guidelines, and approve the Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 14615-2020) per staff's recommendation, subject to the findings and conditions included in the draft resolution.

Respectfully submitted by:

Anita D. Gutierrez, AICP
Development Services Director

Prepared by:

Eunice Im, AICP
Assistant Planner

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1) Draft HPC Resolution
- 2) Location Map & Aerial Photo
- 3) Proposed 11-Unit Development
- 4) Historic Resources Inventory Form
- 5) Site Photographs
- 6) City Directories on 650 W. Grand Ave.
- 7) Public Hearing Notice