



CITY OF POMONA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION

COMMISSION

DATE: February 3, 2021 (*Continued from January 6, 2021*)

TO: Historic Preservation Commission (HPC)

FROM: Development Services Department, Planning Division

SUBJECT: **MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 13258-2020):**
Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an existing 85 s.f. deck area to accommodate the construction of a 391 s.f. first floor addition consisting of a new family room, laundry room and one bathroom, and a second story 70 s.f. bathroom and 74 s.f. second story balcony. Renovations to the interior and exterior will also be completed as part of the overall project. The request also includes demolishing an existing two-car garage and constructing a new 790 s.f. limited detached ADU (under a separate ministerial permit) on a property located at 420 E. Alvarado Street in the Lincoln Park Historic District.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution (Attachment 1) approving a Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 13258-2020) to allow the construction of a 391 s.f. first floor addition and a second story 70 s.f. bathroom and 74s.f. balcony on a property located at 420 E. Alvarado Street in the Lincoln Park Historic District, subject to findings and conditions of approval.

PROPERTY & APPLICANT INFORMATION

Address	420 E. Alvarado Street
Assessor's Parcel Number (APN)	8337004-009
Lot Size	11,164 (0.26 acres)
General Plan Land Use Designation	Residential Neighborhood
Zoning District	R-1-6,000 Single Family Residential
Historic District	Lincoln Park Historic District
Specific Plan	N/A

City Council District	District 4
Applicant	Kevin Lee
Property Owner	JinBao Zhao & Yan Pan

RELATED ACTIONS

Historic Preservation Commission	2009 – Major COA to replace 18 wood double hung windows with fibrex double hung, Denied.
Code Enforcement	N/A
Building & Safety	1946 – 20’ x 20’ new garage. 1986 – Electrical permit. 1989 – Sewer & Plumbing permit. 1992 – Replace septic with sewer. 1994 – Termite damage repair. 1994 – Plumbing permit. 1994 – Foundation inspection. 2000 – Re-roof composition shingles. 2008 – 12’ 12’ concrete pier at rear of residence.
Planning	2000 - Minor COA to re-roof composition shingles. Approved. 2009 – Trim 10 trees. Approved. 2010 – Trim 15 trees. Approved. 2013- Trim 8 trees. Approved.

BACKGROUND

A Major Certificate Appropriateness application has been submitted for the property located at 420 E. Alvarado Street, east of Palomares Street in the R-1-6,000 Single Family Residential Zone (Attachment 2). The property is currently developed with a 2,074 s.f. single-family home with a 130 s.f. porch, 85 s.f. deck and a detached 420 s.f. garage. The home is surrounded by single-family residences to the north, east, south and west. Photos of the home have been included for reference as Attachment 3.

Permit History

Staff located permits for the construction of a new garage in 1946, along with additional plumbing, sewer, electrical, termite repair and re-roof permits, for work completed between 1986 to 2000. No building records were located for the original construction of the home nor the breakfast nook addition to the rear; however, that is not uncommon of historic properties and a further review of the Los Angeles County Assessor’s records indicates that the residence was constructed in 1911. Staff was able to locate a courtesy inspection permit record from 1994 that acknowledged the enclosed rear porch area of the dwelling and permitted it to remain, although it did not meet the current development standards for side yard setbacks. The scope of work for this MAJCOA

proposes to modify a previous alteration and propose a new addition that will meet both current development standards and the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties for additions and new construction.

Continuance

On November 4, 2020, the Historic Preservation Commission held a public hearing to consider Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 13258-2020). In discussions for the project, the Historic Preservation Commission had several concerns related to proposed project. The applicant addressed some of the concerns and held a second meeting on January 6, 2021. Further concerns were raised in regards to design and needing further refinement. The Historic Preservation Commission voted to continue the project to the February 3, 2021 and assigned Commissioner Kercheval as the contact with City staff to help guide the applicant in the redesign, which addresses the Commission's concerns:

1. Pushing the balcony back
2. Second story roofline should continue
3. Stone veneer to be included in the addition portion
4. Correct siding on breakfast nook and add stone veneer
5. Provide the style of doors

SITE DESCRIPTION

The City of Pomona's Lincoln Park Historic Survey identifies the architectural style of the residence as Craftsman and a contributor to the Lincoln Park Historic District (Attachment 4). The historic survey provides the following property description:



Photograph of home

“This attractive, clean-lined house is a beautiful example of the Craftsman Bungalow. The double-gabled roof lends visual interest to the front of the house and enhances the box-like gable roof line.

Clapboard siding is present. Two large windows on the front porch are surrounded by broad window frames. The front door has the same broad frames. The front gable covers the front porch and is supported by squared wood columns at the corners. A fieldstone foundation supports the structure. D. H. and Belle are the first listed owners of this house built in 1911. He was a cement contractor."

PROPOSED PROJECT

The home has a prominent front porch with a low pedestal and columns above, a front gabled roof, two large fixed windows with wide casings, two prominent vents on the top of plate, and horizontal wood siding. The interior of the home consist of three bedrooms, two bathrooms, a living room, dining room, an office, two storage rooms, a breakfast nook and an outdoor deck area (Attachment 5). The scope of work includes demolishing the existing 85 s.f. deck area to accommodate the construction of a 391 s.f. first floor addition consisting of a new family room, laundry room, and one bathroom, and a second story 70 s.f. bathroom and 74 s.f. second story balcony. Renovations to the existing interior and exterior will also be completed as part of the overall project. The request also includes demolishing an existing two-car garage and constructing a new 790 s.f. limited detached ADU, which will be reviewed under a separate ministerial permit.

Modifications

City staff along with Commissioner Kercheval met with the Applicant twice to discuss the project and provide guidance on the re-design of the project. The Applicant has revised his plans and modified the design to address the concerns of the Commission by simplifying the roof lines, pushing the second story balcony, correcting the siding of the breakfast nook, picking a more appropriate style of the doors and lighting fixtures and having the addition sit on a raised foundation as appose to a concrete slab. The proposed addition has a better flow in the floor plan and is more compatible in scale and size. The proposed addition and exterior renovations now complements the home in terms of materials, color and architectural detailing.

The breakfast nook is 158 s.f. in size and currently has a 3' foot setback. The width has been reduced by 2 feet to meet currently zoning laws, which requires 5 feet from the side property line, which results in a reduction of 14 s.f. The addition, which will be attached to the breakfast nook, will also carry the 5' setback. This change has now simplified the floor plan and has helped address the roofline issue.

The addition will include a shingled roof, a 6:12 roof pitch, and the overall building height will be 23'11". The siding for breakfast nook will be corrected and will match the siding of the addition, made out of hardie board, painted blue, and be installed on the reversed side so its appearance matches the existing look of the wood siding of the home. The proposed windows will be a combination of new wood casement and single hung windows with a 6" wide wood surround; and two of the existing breakfast nook casement windows will be re-used on the second story near the new bathroom and bedroom. The addition will now sit on a raised foundation and stone veneer will be added to the foundation of the breakfast nook. The first story addition will have two entrances, one from the south and one from the east side of the family room. The entrances will

lead from raised steps with white wood railing which will be painted white to match the home. The east entrance will have a small covered patio with a hardie board plank exterior ceiling along and the second story covered balcony will have simpson column caps, wood railings and a hardie board exterior ceiling. The door style will be two, double flush glazed doors with tempered glass. Lighting fixtures will also be installed adjacent to the new doorways.

The applicant has revised the plans and has included these call outs in addition to images for reference of the proposed windows, doors, hardware and exterior lighting. Examples of the materials have been provided on the plans and are enclosed at Attachment 6.

APPLICABLE CODE SECTIONS

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance (Historic Preservation), *Major projects shall include changes which significantly alter the following: height, proportions, the relationship of the building mass and space, roof shape, scale or distinctive facades of the structure. Examples of major projects shall include, but not be limited to room additions, adding dormers, expanding a garage, adding a porch, removing distinctive shutters or part or all of a structure. This category also includes demolition and/or replacement of primary use buildings or structures, and construction/installation of new buildings, structures, new public sidewalks, new public streetscape improvements, new street lamps, new public buildings and structures, and development of new public spaces within an historic district.*

The existing structure is located within the Lincoln Park Historic District; therefore, a Major Certificate of Appropriateness is required for the proposed addition. Furthermore, the proposed project must be to consistent with the City of Pomona's 1999 Historic Design Guidelines and Secretary of Interior (SOI) Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties.

ANALYSIS

Consistency with Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation) of the Zoning Ordinance

Section .5809-13 of the Pomona Zoning Ordinance (PZO) requires that all certificates of appropriateness be reviewed for consistency with the standards contained in the code. As illustrated in Table 1, the addition is consistent with the standards contained in Section .5809-13 of the PZO.

Table 1. *Compliance with Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation)*

Historic Preservation Design Review			
Design Criteria	Review	Yes	No
Height	Is the height and bulk compatible with surrounding structures and in conformance with maximum allowable height?	X , no change to what was previously analyzed	

Proportions of Windows and Doors	Are proportions and relationships between doors and windows compatible with the architectural style and character of surrounding structures?	X, yes and two window from the breakfast nook and being reused	
Relationship of Building Masses and Spaces	Are proposed structures and/or remodeled spaces and created spaces consistent with the shapes and setbacks of existing adjacent structures?	X, yes, the breakfast nook has been reduced by 2 'to match the 5' yard foot setback of the addition	
Roof Shape	Is the design of the roof compatible with the architectural character and style of surrounding structures?	X	
Scale	Is the scale of the structure compatible with the architectural character and style of the existing building?	X , applicant has reduced the scale and size of the overall	
Directional Expression/Facades	Are facades compatible with the dominant horizontal and vertical expression of surrounding structures?	X, the property is surrounded by an apartment complex to the east which is where the addition is. The façade is compatible to the surrounding buildings.	
Architectural Details	Do architectural details like materials and textures make new construction compatible with the architectural style and character of the historic district?	X	
Architectural Rhythm and Articulation	Do proposed structures and façade remodeling show rhythmic repetition of architectural details for compatibility with façade articulation of existing adjacent buildings?	X	
New additions	When new additions and adjacent related new construction are removed, will essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment be impaired?	X, yes, this MAJCOA is altering an alteration (breakfast nook) adding onto that	

Exterior mechanical equipment	Is the design, style, color and texture of the required screening method compatible with the existing or proposed building/façade design?	N/A	
-------------------------------	---	-----	--

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines

The ideal preservation approach in the Design Guidelines states that new additions preserve the historic and architectural integrity of the existing building and that the individual features such as windows, doors, roof, siding, and foundation maintain the same characteristics as the existing. The proposed addition will have the same style, proportions, and materials as the existing residence. As previously analyzed, the proposed roof pitch will match the existing roof pitch on the main residence and the siding materials, which will be compatible, and made out of hardie board siding, installed on the reversed side. The new windows will be a combination of casement and single hung windows with a 6” wood surround. The new doors will be solid wood paneled doors with wood surrounds and two of the existing casement windows in the breakfast nook will be re-used in the second story addition. Lastly, the addition will also be on raised foundation and stone veneer will be added to the breakfast nook and addition to maintain the consistency in architectural detailing of the home. Therefore, the proposed addition is consistent with the ideal preservation approach described in the Design Guidelines.

Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior’s (SOI) Standards

The SOI Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties contains two standards that are directly related to additions and new construction. The standards are as follows:

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed project has been designed to resemble the existing structure’s architectural style and the materials will be compatible with the existing home in proportion and material. Siding of the new exterior will be made out of hardie board siding and installed on the reverse side, so the look matches closely to the existing wood siding and the roof will be shingles. The proposed roof pitch will be 6:12 and the overall building height remains at 23’ 11” high. The proposed addition has been designed to have a raised foundation with stone veneer. Moreover, the breakfast nook will be reduced in width by 2’ to match the 5’ foot side yard setback of the addition and the siding has been corrected to match the addition. The setback difference and materials (hardie board siding and stone veneer) will differentiate the old from the new.

New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The new addition is attached to the rear of the existing breakfast nook, and the second story bathroom is the only portion of the second story addition that is attached to the home. For these reasons, if the addition were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would remain unimpaired. The proposed change will be compatible with the historic integrity of the Lincoln Park Historic District.

PUBLIC NOTICING

On October 22, 2020, a public hearing notice was sent to the applicant and mailed to all owners and occupants of the property located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from the subject site (Attachment 6). Further, the hearing item was continued to a day certain, therefore not further noticing was required.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Pursuant to the Guidelines for Implementation of the Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the proposed project meets the criteria for a Class 1 Categorical Exemption (Existing Facilities), Section 15301(e)(1) in that the project will not result in an increase of more than fifty percent of the floor area of the structures before the addition.

CONCLUSION

The proposed addition is consistent with the applicable standards and guidelines found in the Pomona Zoning Ordinance, Historic Preservation Guidelines and Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties. Therefore, staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 13258-2020), subject to conditions.

RECOMMENDED MOTION

Staff recommends the following motion: Move that the Historic Preservation Commission close the public hearing, find that the project is categorically exempt pursuant to State and Local CEQA guidelines, and approve Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 13258-2020) per staff's recommendation, subject the findings and conditions included in the draft resolution.

Respectfully submitted,

Prepared by,

Anita D. Gutierrez, AICP
Development Services Director

Lynda Lara
Assistant Planner

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1) Draft HPC Resolution
- 2) HPC 1/6/21 Staff Report and Plans
- 3) Location Map & Aerial Photo
- 4) Site Photos
- 5) Lincoln Park Historic Survey
- 6) Proposed Plans (1/27/21)
- 7) Public Hearing Notice