



CITY OF POMONA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION

COMMISSION

DATE: February 3, 2021

TO: Historic Preservation Commission (HPC)

FROM: Development Services Department, Planning Division

SUBJECT: MAJOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (MAJCOA 14450-2020)
(CONTINUANCE FROM DECEMBER 2nd, 2020)

Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 14450-2020) to allow a 335 square foot workshop addition to an existing garage, converted to an ADU, on a contributing single-family residential site within the R-1-6,000 (Single Family Residential) zoning at 269 E. Alvarado Street in the Lincoln Park Historic District.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the attached resolution (Attachment 1) approving Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 14450-2020), subject to findings and conditions of approval.

PROPERTY & APPLICANT INFORMATION

Address	269 E. Alvarado Street
Assessor's Parcel Number (APN)	8339-013-017
Lot Size	7,822 sf.
General Plan Land Use Designation	Residential Neighborhood
Zoning District	R-1-6,000
Historic District	Lincoln Park Historic District
Specific Plan	N/A
City Council District	District 4
Applicant	Augusto Dolce
Property Owner	Augusto Dolce

RELATED ACTIONS

Historic Preservation Commission	2020 – New six feet tall wooden dog ear fence to match existing
Code Enforcement	No active or open cases.
Building & Safety	1966 – 21 x 24 Detached garage
Planning	None

SITE DESCRIPTION AND BACKGROUND

The property is currently developed as a 1,312 square foot single-family residence with a detached 508 square foot garage on a 7,822 square foot lot. It is located on E. Alvarado Street within the R-1-6,000 zoning district and the Lincoln Park Historic District. Surrounding the subject property to the north, west, east are single-family residential homes, and to the southwest is the St. Paul's Episcopal Church.

Owner and applicant, Augusto Dolce, submitted an application for Major Certificate of Appropriateness on September 2, 2020 for the proposed workshop addition to the existing garage. The Major Certificate of Appropriateness was taken to hearing on December 2, 2020, however, the applicant expressed concern with the presented plans, and the hearing was subsequently continued to the hearing in February. The existing garage has been converted to an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) under separate ministerial review, and a door has been added to the east elevation of the new workshop addition, as requested by the owner, since the December hearing (Attachment 2).

PROPOSED PROJECT

The proposed project consists of adding 335 square feet of habitable area to the east of the existing garage located at the rear of the property lot. The addition is proposed to be used as a workshop and small indoor gym for the applicant.

The exterior façade of the new addition and the garage conversion will complement the existing structure as the proposed structure will be consistent with the existing home in material, colors, and architectural details. The new addition and garage conversion will be differentiated from the primary structure in that the horizontal siding will consist of similar but different material: hardy boards. New windows will match the existing wood windows and sill, and rafters will be placed underneath the roof eaves to carry the same architectural detail from the primary structure.

APPLICABLE CODE SECTIONS

Per Section .5809-13(F)(8) of the City of Pomona Zoning Ordinance (Historic Preservation), *Major projects shall include changes which significantly alter the following: height, proportions, the relationship of the building mass and space, roof shape, scale or distinctive facades of the structure. Examples of major projects shall include, but not be limited to room additions, adding dormers, expanding a garage, adding a porch, removing distinctive shutters or part or all of a structure. This category also includes demolition and/or replacement of primary use buildings or structures, and construction/installation of new buildings, structures, new public sidewalks, new public streetscape improvements, new street lamps, new public buildings and structures, and development of new public spaces within an historic district.*

The existing structure is located within the Lincoln Park Historic District, therefore a Major Certificate of Appropriateness is required for the proposed addition. Furthermore, the proposed project must be to consistent with the City of Pomona's 1999 Historic Design Guidelines and Secretary of Interior (SOI) Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties.

ANALYSIS:

Consistency with Section .5809-13 (Historic Preservation) of the Zoning Ordinance Standards:

Section .5809-13 of the Pomona Zoning Ordinance (PZO) requires that all Certificates of Appropriateness be reviewed for consistency with the standards contained in the code. As illustrated in Table 1, the proposed addition, as conditioned, are consistent with the standards contained in Section .5809-13 of the PZO.

Table 1. Compliance with .5809-13 (Historic Preservation)

Historic Preservation Design Review			
Design Criteria	Review	Yes	No
Height	Is the height and bulk compatible with surrounding structures and in conformance with maximum allowable height?	X	
Proportions of Windows and Doors	Are proportions and relationships between doors and windows compatible with the architectural style and character of surrounding structures?	X	
Relationship of Building Masses and Spaces	Are proposed structures and/or remodeled spaces and created spaces consistent with the shapes and setbacks of existing adjacent structures?	X	
Roof Shape	Is the design of the roof compatible with the architectural character and style of surrounding structures?	X	
Scale	Is the scale of the structure compatible with the architectural character and style of the existing building?	X	
Directional Expression/Facades	Are facades compatible with the dominant horizontal and vertical expression of surrounding structures?	X	
Architectural Details	Do architectural details like materials and textures make new construction compatible with the architectural style and character of the historic district?	X	
Architectural Rhythm and Articulation	Do proposed structures and façade remodeling show rhythmic repetition of architectural details for compatibility with façade articulation of existing adjacent buildings?	X	
New additions	When new additions and adjacent	X	

Historic Preservation Design Review			
Design Criteria	Review	Yes	No
	related new construction are removed, will essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment be impaired?		
Exterior mechanical equipment	Is the design, style, color and texture of the required screening method compatible with the existing or proposed building/façade design?	N/A	

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines

Addition:

The ideal preservation approach in the Design Guidelines state that new additions preserve the historic and architectural integrity of the existing residence and that the individual features such as windows, doors, roof, siding, and foundation maintain the same characteristics as the existing. As stated previously, the proposed addition will have the same style, proportions, detailing, and similar materials as the existing residence. The exterior walls of the addition will have horizontal sidings that match the existing residence. The new windows and doors will match the existing and architectural details and rhythms on the existing home will be carried throughout the addition of the structure. In addition, the architect changed the door of the addition to match the Craftsman Bungalow style since the December hearing.

Lastly, the existing garage was built in 1966, and its foundation on concrete slab. As such, the façade of the garage conversion and new addition will not have fieldstone foundation as it was not part of the original design. Therefore, the proposed addition is consistent with the ideal preservation approach described in the Design Guidelines.

Consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's (SOI) Standards

The SOI Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties contains two standards that are directly related to additions and new construction. The standards are as follows:

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed project involves a 335 square foot addition to an existing garage built in 1966. The existing garage is built on concrete slab. The exterior façade of the garage conversion and addition has been designed to resemble the existing structure's architectural style. New windows will match the proportion and material of the existing window. Siding of the new exterior will be compatible with the existing sidings and architectural details such as the rafters underneath the roof will be carried throughout the new structure. As such, the proposed project will be consistent in style with the residence

located in the Lincoln Park Historic District. The proposed project will not impact the historic character of the home and the surrounding historic district will not be negatively impacted.

New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed addition will not affect the significant architectural features of the residence because the addition is only an expansion to the existing garage. The expansion to the existing garage structure will not have a negative impact on the essential form and integrity of the historic property.

PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS

On November 19, 2020, public hearing notices were sent to the applicant/owner and to the property owners and occupants of the properties located directly adjacent to and directly across the street from subject site (Attachment 6). As of the writing of this report, no public comments have been received to date.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

Pursuant to the Guidelines for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the proposed project meets the criteria for a Class 3 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures), Section 15303, Categorical Exemption per Section 15303(e)(2). The proposed project meets the exemption requirement as the proposed project consists of small workshop addition. Therefore, no further environmental review is required.

CONCLUSION

The proposed addition is consistent with the applicable standards and guidelines found in the Pomona Zoning Ordinance, Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, the Secretary of Interior's Standards, and the General Plan. The proposed addition will match the architectural style of the primary residence and will have no adverse impact on the historic district.

RECOMMENDED MOTION

Staff recommends the following motion:

- Move that the Historic Preservation Commission close the public hearing, find that the project is categorically exempt pursuant to State and Local CEQA guidelines, and approve the Major Certificate of Appropriateness (MAJCOA 14450-2020) per staff's recommendation, subject to the findings and conditions included in the draft resolution.

Respectfully submitted by:

Prepared by:

Anita D. Gutierrez, AICP
Development Services Director

Eunice Im, AICP
Assistant Planner

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1) Attachment 1- Draft HPC Resolution
- 2) Attachment 2 – December 2nd HPC Hearing Package w/ New Plans