# OFFICIAL MINUTES POMONA HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION AUGUST 7, 2019

A. CALL TO ORDER:

The Historic Preservation Commission meeting was called to order at

6:30 p.m. by Chair Debra Martin.

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:

Commissioner Gallivan led the pledge of allegiance.

D. ROLL CALL:

Roll was taken by Development Services Director Anita Gutierrez.

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:

Commissioners Debra Martin, Jim Gallivan, Ann Tomkins, Jennifer

Williams, Tamara Gonzalez, Alice R. Gomez.

**COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:** 

Commissioner James Kercheval

STAFF PRESENT:

Development Services Director Gutierrez, City Attorney Marco Martinez, Senior Planner Vinny Tam, Assistant Planner Alex Jimenez, Planning

Manager Gustavo Gonzalez.

Development Services Director Gutierrez introduced the new Planning Manager for the City of Pomona Planning Division, Gustavo (Gus) Gonzalez. Planning Manager Gonzalez shared he is the Historian for the

Orange County Chapter for the American Planning Association.

#### ITEM D:

# SELECTION OF NEW CHAIRPERSION & VICE-CHAIRPERSON

#### 1. Selection of New Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson

Commissioner Jim Gallivan nominated Commissioner Alice Gomez as Chairperson because she is tied to many City of Pomona organizations.

Commissioner Tomkins seconded the nomination for Commissioner Alice Gomez.

Motion by Commissioner Gallivan, seconded by Commissioner Tomkins, carried by a unanimous vote of the members present (6-0-0-1), to elect Commissioner Alice Gomez as Chairperson of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Commissioner Alice Gomez took over the meeting as Chairperson. She asked for nominations for Vice-Chairperson.

Commissioner Martin nominated Commissioner Ann Tomkins.

Motion by Commissioner Martin, seconded by Commissioner Williams, carried by a unanimous vote of the members present (6-0-0-1), to elect Commissioner Ann Tomkins as Vice-Chairperson of the Historic Preservation Commission.

ITEM E:

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** 

None

ITEM F:

### CONSENT CALENDAR:

1. Approval of draft Historic Preservation Commission Minutes meeting of March 6, 2019, June 5, 2019, July 3, 2019 and Planning & Historic Preservation Commission Joint Meeting Minutes of April 17, 2019.

Official Minutes Historic Preservation Commission August 7, 2019 Page 2 of 9

Chair Gomez reported that she was referred to as a 'he' on the March 6th minutes on Page 10.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied that any corrections that refer to Chair Gomez as 'he' would be corrected to read 'she'.

Commissioner Tomkins reported corrections to the July 3, 2019 meeting minutes:

- On Page 4 it reads '2016' for the March 5, 2019 and needs to be corrected.
- On Page 9 where she stated, "the code is trying to prevent things..." it needs to say, "that are much more significant".
- On Page 12 something got jumbled and should read "Commissioner Tomkins replied there was a
  discussion about appealing based on conformance with the regulation to eliminate any concern about
  bias."
- On Page 12 two paragraphs down from the end "she noted she will declare to the commission at that
  time whether there will be an appeal of conformity, it should say "for conformity." She asked for an
  update on this item.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied she has an update on that item.

Commissioner Tomkins reported on Page 22, the last sentence should read "colleagues" not "colleges" and where it reads "Commission gets to review ADUs to make sure they..." need to have the word "don't" inserted, so that it says " to make sure they don't impact the character of the district".

Development Services Director Gutierrez acknowledges the changes.

Motion by Commissioner Martin, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez, carried by a unanimous vote of the members present (6-0-0-1), to approve draft Historic Preservation Commission Minutes meeting of March 6, 2019, June 5, 2019, July 3, 2019 and Planning & Historic Preservation Commission Joint Meeting Minutes of April 17, 2019.

ITEM G: HEARING ITEMS:

None

# ITEM H: DISCUSSION:

# 1. 2<sup>nd</sup> Street fountains restoration.

Alina Barron, Assistant Planner, provided a report.

- The 2<sup>nd</sup> Street Fountains are in the Historic Pomona Mall.
- Background of the Art in Public Places Ordinance and the Public Art fund.
  - The Art in Public Places (AIPP) ordinance was adopted in 2011 and established the following:
    - 1) The AIPP Policy and Guidelines manual.
    - 2) The regulations for original artwork murals.
    - 3) The public art requirement for private developments that includes:
      - New residential developments 10 units or more.
      - New commercial institutional or industrial developments with a building valuation of \$750,000 or more.

- Interior and exterior tenant improvement on these properties with a building valuation of \$750,000 for more.
- The public art requirement for private developers comes with two options:
  - 1) Placement of approved public art on the project site with a dollar amount equal to 1% of the building valuation.
  - 2) A payment of an in-lieu contribution to the public art fund with the dollar amount equal to the 1% building valuation.
- The AIPP Policy Guidelines and Manual outlines the processes by which the Cultural Arts Commission may expend those fees.
- In March 2019, the Cultural Arts Commission released a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) to artists across Los Angeles, Orange and San Bernardino Counties to establish a short list of qualified artists to release Requests for Proposals (RFPs).
- In June 2019, the Cultural Arts Commission selected 27 of those artists to be on that qualified list.
- In June 2019, the Cultural Arts Commission began releasing RFPs for the placement of public art throughout Pomona to the qualified artist shortlist.
- The Cultural Arts Commission would now like to begin efforts to restore existing public art in the City of Pomona, beginning with the Millard Sheets Fountains.
- It's important to note that the executing artist Millard Sheets was responsible for the executing of the entire Pomona Mall public improvements, therefore the entirety of the fountains is seen as a public art piece.
- The Cultural Arts Commission has not released the RFP for this project and city staff are asking for the Historic Preservation Commissions input.
- The Cultural Arts Commission is seeking a team of artists to restore the Millard Sheets Fountains and require that the team of artists apply with a selected professional contractor. The professional contractor must have experience in historic restoration and provide a statement of qualifications.
- The conceptual restoration proposal must contain a list of itemized proposed work, provide a cost
  estimate for each fountain and the process by which the restoration will occur, in line with all relevant
  historical guidelines.
- The Millard Sheets Fountains are part of a locally registered single historic landmark, as a historic landmark the selector proposal will go before the Historic Preservation Commission.
- All proposals will be analyzed by staff for consistency with the City of Pomona's 1999 design guidelines for historic properties and the Secretary of Interior Standards for restoration.
- Displayed pictures of the existing Millard Sheets Fountains artwork.
  - The Albert Stewart Sea Urchin.
  - Millard Owen Sheets Blossoming Tree and Horses.
  - Jean and Arthur Ames The Pomona and Roman Goddess of Fruit Trees.
  - John Edward Svenson The Diving Porpoise.
- Displayed a map of the existing fountains, placed between Park Avenue and Gibbs Street.
- Displayed pictures of each fountain in its current condition along with historical images to discuss.
   (The Diving Porpoise, The Blossoming Trees and Horses, The Sea Urchin)
  - The fountains located on the west side of Garey Avenue have front pillars and benches; however, the east side no longer has those. These benches could be included in the RFPs for restoration.
  - Artists will be required to use historical references to verify original materials used. A news article clipping was provided from the Pomona Public Library archives.
  - Displayed the general description for the restoration process:
    - Discussion item with the Historic Preservation Commission for input to incorporate them into the RFP.
    - The draft RFP will go before the Cultural Arts Commission for approval and release.
    - Once the approved RFP closes an Ad Hoc Committee composed of members of the Cultural Arts Commission Citizens Advisory Committee will select a finalist to be reviewed by the Cultural Arts Commission Citizens Advisory Committee and recommended to the Cultural Arts Commission along with a final restoration plan.
    - The finalists will prepare a restoration plan with details and supportive documentation for staff to present to the Cultural Arts Commission for approval.

Official Minutes Historic Preservation Commission August 7, 2019 Page 4 of 9

> Once the Cultural Arts Commission approves that final restoration plan, it will come before the Historic Preservation Commission as a major Certificate of Appropriateness for approval prior to going to City Council as a consent item for the dollar amount.

Commissioner Gallivan asked about the timeframe.

Assistant Planner Barron replied that the tentative schedule would have the restoration plan come to Historic Preservation Commission for a major Certificate of Appropriateness on November 6, 2019.

Development Services Director Gutierrez added they would ideally be releasing the RFP next month.

Commissioner Martin thanked staff for a great presentation. She reiterated that the planters and the fountains are locally designated.

Commissioner Tomkins asked staff if they knew the story as to why there are columns and benches on the one side and the other side, they didn't have those any longer.

Assistant Planner Barron replied they know only because of the original images.

Commissioner Tomkins asked if staff knew when the benches and columns were taken out and if it was before it was designated.

Assistant Planner Barron replied she has images from when the Historic Preservation Commission had it designated showing they were removed but staff do not have an exact date. She noted it is something they are researching.

Commissioner Gonzalez asked if the Historic Preservation Commission would want to encourage that the benches be replicated on the rebuild.

Commissioner Martin replied absolutely. She asked if it was currently part of the request.

Assistant Planner Barron replied the benches are not part of the request because the historical evidence indicates that the stone choice was very deliberate, and staff is not sure an artist would be able to replicate it. She noted the budget will be a window so they will see how much can be done with those funds.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied it's a suggestion staff can take back to the Cultural Arts Commission.

Chair Gomez responded she would like to see that because what was originally placed there is part of a historic value within downtown. She stated the view in the 1950s downtown picture was nice and can be a part of the future view because there is now better concrete, better stone, and better masonry available to do this job.

Development Services Director Gutierrez agrees. She stated the budget is a factor for this project and shared the Cultural Arts Commission is grappling with what allocation they want to spend and developing a strategic plan for how much money they want to spend on restoration, on murals and on sculpture. She shared the Cultural Arts Commission discussed making the fountains look good, but not necessarily doing a full restoration rebuilding columns and pillars. She stated that will be a discussion to have with the Cultural Arts Commission.

Chair Gomez replied she knows that the Cultural Arts Commission has a pocket of money to do all this work and part of that is the historical value. She stated the Historic Preservation Commission needs to clearly state their wishes so there is less headaches when the item comes back.

Commissioner Gallivan asked if the lamp poles pictured are the ones the currently in the City.

Assistant Planner Barron replied that looking at the current pictures there are more modern lamp poles.

Commissioner Williams stated this is an admirable project and she is excited to hear that the Cultural Arts Commission is looking at historic sites in the City. She commented it would be appropriate for people in historic preservation to be involved in the process sooner than the major Certificate of Appropriateness. She asked how they can accomplish that

Official Minutes Historic Preservation Commission August 7, 2019 Page 5 of 9

because her understanding is that if they have other people beyond Cultural Arts Commissioners on a Committee to work on this project it would become a Brown Act body.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied yes that is true, however, there isn't an Ad Hoc Committee for this project. She shared it is the Cultural Arts Commission and Advisory Committee discussing this separately. She stated it would be appropriate for the historic commissioners to voice their opinions as part of Historic Preservation Commission during the public comment period for this item.

Commissioner Williams replied she thought she saw something about an Ad Hoc Committee.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied there is a subcommittee of the Advisory Committee to score the RFP and present a recommendation to the Cultural Arts Commission for consideration.

Commissioner Gallivan asked if the Advisory Committee consists of people outside of Pomona.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied the Cultural Arts Commission Citizens Advisory Committee is open to those not necessarily living in Pomona and the requirement is you can also be a businessperson. She noted all the Advisory Committee members are heavily involved in the City of Pomona.

#### Chair Gomez opened public comment.

John Clifford, spoke about the Mall being built as a pedestrian mall when there was no traffic. He reported the places where those benches used is now parking and so if the City tried to restore those benches it could cause issues because it would be taking valuable parking away from a busy restaurant (Metro Ale House). He stated he is not opposed to the benches and columns but once something is gone, it's gone, and a replica is not the original historic item. He suggested the Commission consider that there is a different use for that street now and voiced support for restoring what they have.

Dan McIntire, 357 E. Pasadena, invited the Historic Preservation Commissioners to Pomona's 35th Anniversary Home Tour on November 2, 2019. He shared the tour was named Pomona fantasy: Mid-Century Modern in Pomona and will include the Millard Sheets Pedestrian Mall, Civic Center Plaza, City Hall, The Library, The Chase Building (which used to be Home Savings, designed by Millard Sheets), AMOCA will be open for the public to see the mosaic, as well as, residential homes designed by Cliff May, modular homes in Westmont and the Westmont United Methodist Church. He shared as they have gone through and looked at the condition of the Millard Sheets Pedestrian Mall his understanding is that Public Works is in charge of the vegetation surrounding the fountains and the Downtown Pomona Owners Association (DPOA) has been responsible for the maintenance of the fountains. He shared the DPOA has offered to redo the waterproof coating on each one of the fountains as a stop gap measure. He suggested using the tour to leverage interest in the restoration of the fountains. He requested the Commissioner help spread the word in the region that Pomona has a lot of mid-century.

Commissioner Tomkins commented she is glad that they are going to be restoring the fountains; however, she doesn't have much background. She commented when something is on the agenda, she usually researches it, but there wasn't anything included in the agenda package to help her figure out what to research. She expressed concerns that the Commission doesn't have enough information and that when this item comes back as a Major Certificate of Appropriateness the process could be delayed.

Assistant Planner Barron responded there will be a staff report with the agenda for the September 23, 2019 Cultural Arts Commission Citizens Advisory Committee meeting that will contain the selected proposal. She shared the artist will be preparing a narrative and the proposal will include an itemized that list from the contractor of the historic restoration work and what they would like to replace or restore according to the Secretary of Interior (SOI) standards. She noted the RFP will state that the contractor must have historic restoration experience. She summarized a lot of information will be available to the Historic Preservation Commission in September.

Development Services Director Gutierrez added staff will also commit to keeping the Historic Preservation Commission informed throughout the process and provide opportunities to comment.

Chair Gomez replied they would appreciate that.

Official Minutes Historic Preservation Commission August 7, 2019 Page 6 of 9

Development Services Director Gutierrez reported they are moving projects quickly, while still having project thoroughly vetted because the City is trying to utilize funds that haven't been used in a long time.

Chair Gomez replied she appreciates that and asked who will take care of the fountains once they are restored.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied the RFP will include a component for maintenance and then long term there is will be discussion with the Cultural Arts Commission. She noted a third of the funds can be set aside for maintenance. She reported the Cultural Arts Commission needs to define maintenance, what types of projects will be included, what will be the responsibility of the artists for RFPs, and what will be the obligation of the regular fund and the City. She noted those are discussions they have not had in the past so it may take a little time.

Commissioner Gallivan requested access to electrical so people can hook up sound systems or food stands during events.

Assistant Planner Barron replied the Art in Public Places Guidelines includes a list of eligible expenditures and that would not be considered one of them.

Commissioner Martin pointed out the newspaper article staff presented mentioned the Pigeons by Betty Davenport and they are here in the room and that the Gazelle by Betty Davenport is right outside the door.

Commissioner Williams requested to receive a digital copy of the presentation.

Commissioner Gallivan commented that the pillars are something that could be added to the fountains later.

Chair Gomez agreed and commented the City could change the parking lot to a two story down the road somewhere.

Development Services Director Gutierrez stated staff wanted to bring this project to the Historic Preservation Commission's attention and share that this is something the Cultural Arts Commission is excited about it. She noted it is another collaborative effort and an opportunity for two Commissions work together. She stated staff will keep the Commissioners updated as they move forward.

Assistant Planner Barron reported lighting is an eligible expenditure and some of Cultural Arts Commissioners have expressed an interest in lighting the fountains. She noted this would not be original to the fountains. She asked if the Historic Preservation Commission would feel comfortable including lighting in the RFP.

Commissioner Martin replied she thinks it would beautiful.

Chair Gomez agreed to showcase it.

Commissioner Gonzalez agreed and commented it would help activate the space in the evening and promote pedestrian traffic.

Commissioner Gallivan requested an extra socket so extra lighting could be added.

### ITEM I:

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION COMMUNICATION:

# 1. Report from Ad Hoc Committees.

Chair Gomez requested the Ad Hoc Committee be listed on future agendas.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied she can list them individually in the future and reported currently there is a Tree Ad Hoc Committee, an Ordinance Review Ad Hoc Committee and the Stable Ad Hoc Committee.

Chair Gomez asked the Tree Ad Hoc Committee to report.

Official Minutes Historic Preservation Commission August 7, 2019 Page 7 of 9

Commissioner Tomkins shared she spoke with Development Services Director Gutierrez about putting this report off until the next meeting when the Parks and Facilities Manager Michael Sledd is available. She expressed concerns about the impact of the water rate increase will have on people watering trees because the City has already lost a lot of trees for people not watering them. She suggested they discuss the City's policy on watering trees and the enforcement of that policy. She stated the issue doesn't fall within the historic preservation purview, it's under the Parks Commission, however, they are losing trees in historic districts because Pomona is not enforcing its ordinances on watering. She stated it is something the Commission may want to make a recommendation about.

Commissioner Martin agreed.

#### Chair Gomez asked the Ordinance Review Ad-Hoc Committee to report.

Commissioner Williams shared she has been reviewing ordinances from other local cities. She reported the feedback from City Council was that they were not comfortable giving the 50-year change, because as Debra Clifford stated, "they would become the most powerful Commission in the City". She shared the change is going to require something more in depth. She spoke about other local cities having tiered systems identifying sites not permitted to come down unless it's an emergency, a second tier to try to preserve but that is not necessarily a priority and a third tier that is hands off. She stated the tiered system would require the City to do more survey work. She reported there are different options to explore and she is hoping to bring ideas to the September meeting to solidify in October because City Council wanted the Commission to bring something in November.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied she stated she could bring something back as early as November...so in between that time we need to schedule something. We will get that on the calendar for this month and happy to work with her through that.

Commissioner Martin responded that some of the City Council members didn't understand that the ordinance wasn't written to stay as it is forever. She stated they should have done a rollover of 50 years and older but that didn't happen.

Commissioner Tomkins asked for details on what the City Council decided.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied they decided that they are in favor of bringing back an ordinance amendment. She reported there was different opinions on what that ordinance should look like, so staff committed to work with the Ad-Hoc Committee to come up with options based on their discussion and come back to them with an idea. She shared some Councilmembers wanted a flat 50 years, some likes a rolling 50 years, some wanted somewhere in the middle, and some were in favor of doing an administrative process.

Commissioner Tomkins asked if staff's goal was to bring back a couple of options to the City Council.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied her goal was to work with the Ad-Hoc Committee come back with one or two options.

#### Chair Gomez asks the Stable Ad-Hoc Committee to report.

Commissioner Gonzalez reported the Stables Ad-Hoc Committee has been tasked with homework from the last City Council meeting where they unanimously voted to save the Stables. She shared the Committee is working with Water and Wastewater Operations Director Darron Poulsen to find monies to support the difference in funding. She stated they are also gathering support from additional historic preservation organizations within the area. She reported Spectra Co. and Architectural Resource Group are both willing to be a part of the process and are available to help. She shared Director Poulson is meeting with Kemp Brothers tomorrow to let them know about the change in design plans and give them their marching orders. She noted the Ad-Hoc Committee will be setting up a meeting in mid-September and will have something to report in October. She reported Director Poulson informed her Kemp Brothers is sending over credentialing to indicate their ability to perform under a historic designation status. She stated overall all things are working in concert with one another and they are moving forward, but there are just some big hurdles to overcome initially.

Commissioner Gallivan responded he knows other companies who are qualified to do the work. He stated a big part of the process was to go through and define what work must be done to keep it qualified for the National Registry, to make Official Minutes Historic Preservation Commission August 7, 2019 Page 8 of 9

sure it is in the contract. He noted for the Stables to maintain their historic status the work must be done by a qualified person and City Council agreed.

Commissioner Gonzalez added that is why they want to make sure if the team that is currently on board meets that designation/qualification. She stated they know Spectra Co. has that qualification and could at least consult on the process.

Commissioner Gallivan reported there are all kinds of little subsections that state what must be done, and he has created a list to correspond. He shared with respect to funding there are a lot of places that used to provide funding but it's a lot less now. He shared he the Walker House spent \$13 million on upgrades and a good part of that money came from the Getty Foundation and so he contacted the Getty Foundation and was told that relative to their current standards they would not approve because it has to be past WWI for them to fund. He shared he has found a lot of very interesting small funding opportunities, as well as, has support that the building should be saved from high places like the Getty and the State.

Chair Gomez thanked her fellow Commissioners for working diligently to get this process heading in the right direction. She provided a copy of a recent newspaper article on the Stables for the Ad-Hoc Committee to utilize in their efforts.

Commissioner Gallivan noted there are funding cycles that complicate things; however, he will be reaching out to several potential contacts. He commented he doubts that they are going to get any gigantic amounts of money, so they are going to have to make sure the money they have is wisely spent.

Commissioner Gonzalez shared she had a discussion with Commissioner Kercheval, and he reported that he contacted Congresswoman Norma Torres' office and they are willing to explore funding from a higher level. She reported she has made a connection with a member of our community who may be willing to write grants for additional funding.

Commissioner Gallivan shared he called Connie Leyva's office and they have given him the forms to fill out.

#### **General Commissioner Communication**

Commissioner Williams stated she hasn't received anything from staff about the Historic American Buildings Survey (HABS) tiered process for demolition she brought up at a previous meeting and asked if there as an update.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied she hasn't seen it either and will inquire.

Commissioner Williams noted there was also a HABS survey so there might be a bit of confusion about what it was found.

## ITEM I:

# **DIRECTOR COMMUNICATION:**

Development Services Director Gutierrez reported Commissioner Williams brought forward a training opportunity by the California Preservation Foundation on Friday, September 20, 2019 from 9:00 a.m. -4:00 p.m. at Pasadena City Hall. She stated it is about decoding preservation and is a 360 look at historic preservation ordinances policy and practice. She stated if the Commissioners are interested in going there is money in the budget to cover the expense. She stated she will send an email out to the Commission with a deadline to register.

Commissioner Gallivan responded there were also some four-part training about the same time period and one of them covered ADA.

Development Services Director Gutierrez read the description of six-hour California Preservation Foundation conference.

Development Services Director Gutierrez reported the applicant from case on Randolph Street from the July 6, 2019 meeting appealed and received a refund for the major COA. She shared the appeal will be heard by City Council on September 9, 2019 as a public hearing, so they can take action that night.

Official Minutes Historic Preservation Commission August 7, 2019 Page 9 of 9

Commissioner Gallivan asked for clarification.

Development Services Director Gutierrez responded the appeal is for the house on Randolph Street with the fence posts and the wall. She shared the applicant appealed the decision of the Historic Preservation Commission, so staff will be taking that to City Council for their consideration on September 9, 2019.

Commissioner Gallivan asked if there was an update on the applicant who wanted to take down the four houses.

Development Services Director Gutierrez replied the applicant for Phillips Boulevard has not come back yet. She stated they have asked for a few months to redesign.

Commissioner Tomkins retuned to the topic of the appeal and clarified that she had a conversation with the former Director related to the high cost of appeals and if there was a fee for appeals and that in the fee schedule there wasn't a fee. She stated if there isn't an appeal fee then the Commission wouldn't need to do the appeals because people could do them on their own.

#### 1. Minor Certificates of Appropriateness for July 2019 (attached).

Motion by Commissioner Gallivan, seconded by Commissioner Williams to adjourn the meeting.

ADJOURNMENT:

Chair Gomez adjourned the meeting at 7:41 p.m. to the next regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission on September 4, 2019 at 6:30 p.m. in the City Council Chambers.

Anita D. Gutierrez, AICP Development Services Director

Jessica Thorndike, Transcriber

The minutes of this meeting are filed in the Planning Division of City Hall, located 505 South Garey Avenue, Pomona, CA, 91766.